International Society
of Philosophy and Cosmology

Future Human Image

Volume 16

Kyiv, 2021
# Table of Contents

Ljiljana Ćabrilo Blagojević .................................................................................................................. 4  
Health Pass in France – The Ethics of Conviction and the Ethics of Responsibility

Dan Howitt ............................................................................................................................................... 12  
The Case of Tito and Soma Mukhopadhyay: Factitious Heroism by Proxy, Factitious Heroism, and Revealing the Deception Thereof for the Future of Autism Treatment

Yevhen Kharkovshchenko and Vitalii Turenko ...................................................................................... 31  
State-Religion Relationships in Ukraine during the Covid-19 Pandemic: Specific and Particular Features

Bo Ma and Yuhuan Hou .......................................................................................................................... 43  
Artificial Intelligence Empowers the Integrated Development of Legal Education: Challenges and Responses

Wiktor Możgin and Isabela de Andrade Gama ......................................................................................... 55  
The Theory of Microhistory in the Scientific Discourse As a Potential Fighting Tool In Hybrid War

Victoria Omelchenko .............................................................................................................................. 64  
Culture as a Priority of Humanitarian Policy

Frol Revin .................................................................................................................................................... 75  
The Shifting Image of Social Capital: Digitizing Cooperative Ties

Sergii Rudenko and Yaroslav Sobolievskyi ............................................................................................. 83  
Identity Crisis as the Main Motive of Contemporary Native American Literature

Vadym Tytarenko ....................................................................................................................................... 93  
English as a Medium of Instruction in Ukrainian Higher Educational Practices: Challenges and Suggestions

Amita Valmiki ............................................................................................................................................. 102  
Ecofeminism and Social Ecology in Indian Context: Exploration in Customs, Cultures, and Religions

Heorhii Vdovychenko ............................................................................................................................... 110  
A Study of the History of Chinese Philosophy in Independent Ukraine: The Sinological Experience of Kyiv Universities in the Late 20th and Early 21st Centuries

Review
Feng-Shuo Chang .................................................................................................................................. 122  

Authors ...................................................................................................................................................... 128
Health Pass in France – The Ethics of Conviction and the Ethics of Responsibility

Ljiljana Ćabrilo Blagojević

European Center for Peace and Development (ECPD), established by the United Nations University for Peace (Belgrade, Serbia)
E-mail: ljiljanacabrilo.blagojevic@yahoo.fr
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0932-5085


Introduction

We have never heard so much about dictatorship in France than during this covid 19 crisis and especially about the health pass: “health dictatorship,” “vaccine dictatorship,” “violation of freedoms,” “presidential authoritarianism.” The government was not left out of authoritarian concepts: “war,” “state of emergency,” “mobilization,” “curfew” (...) and did not skimp on the prohibitions appearing quite arbitrary (Fregosi, 2021).

There is nothing democratic about a pandemic. In the spirit of Durkheim, this period could be called “the period of acute anomie.” In crisis management, there were no major differences in solutions between authoritarian and democratic regimes. To understand the restrictive
government measures supposed to fight the COVID-19 pandemic, we can turn to Max Weber and his two ethics: the ethics of conviction and the ethics of responsibility. On the one hand, the ethics of conviction is based on the Kantian principle of duty: one must act according to higher principles in which one believes.

Responsibility ethics means acting based on concrete effects that can reasonably be expected. Absolute moral systems are concerned with premises, while political ethics are concerned with consequences. One who is driven by the ethics of conviction will put his principles before results, and as Weber says, he will attribute his failure to other men, to society, or to God. Whoever acts according to the ethics of responsibility will take the world and people as they are and hold themselves accountable for the results of their actions, whatever constraints they encounter (Weber, 1959). The politician is responsible for the results, whatever the strength of those who can compromise them: the politician’s ethics is that of danger and risk, of the awareness of the possibility of error.

**Health pass in France**

Health pass came into effect on June 9 in France for events that brought together more than 1,000 people. However, faced with the increase in COVID-19 cases due to the spread of the Delta variant and vaccination that was too early to contain it, it was made compulsory from August 9, 2021, for adults 18 years and plus, and from September 30, 2021, for 12-18 years-olds, for anyone wishing to access many places of life, such as cafes, bars, restaurants (terraces and rooms), cultural and leisure venues, hospitals (non-urgent care), retirement homes, fairs, seminars, and trade shows, without any notion of gauge. By prefectural decision, it may be compulsory to access shopping centres of more than 20,000 sq.m in certain departments. Finally, long-distance transport (trains, coaches and planes) is also affected by the measure (Tobelem, 2021; Service, 2021).

France is far from having been the first to make this choice on the Old Continent. It is not the last either. The EU’s digital Covid certificate regulation entered into force on July 1, 2021. The device is now widely used in Europe, although its terms differ significantly from state to state. All health passes are intended to be maintained on a temporary basis, while national epidemics are brought under control, even if some fear their sustainability in one form or another. It has thus happened that countries have reduced them considerably or even eliminated them (Commission, 2021).

In France, to obtain a health pass, you must meet one of these criteria (Gouvernement, 2021):

1. Vaccination, provided that people have a complete vaccination schedule and the necessary time after the final injection, either:
   - 7 days after the 2nd injection for double injection vaccines (Pfizer, Moderna, AstraZeneca);
   - 28 days after injection for vaccines with a single injection (Johnson & Johnson);
   - 7 days after the injection of vaccines for people who have had a history of COVID (single injection).

2. Proof of a negative test of fewer than 72 hours.

3. The result of a positive RT-PCR or antigen test attesting to recovery from COVID-19, dating at least 11 days and less than six months.
The extension of the health pass and compulsory vaccination for certain professions triggered demonstrations in France, called the “anti-pass” or “anti-vax” in the media, and often compared with the movement of yellow vests which, three years ago after its appearance and two years without significant activity, does not cease to haunt the authorities and remains very present in the minds of the population.

**Sanitary passes versus “Yellow Vests”**

The movement against the health pass expresses “a breach of confidence, not so much on the measures that are taken, but on the way, they have been taken,” declared Antoine Bristielle, director of the Observatory of the opinion of the Jean Jaurès Foundation (Bristielle, 2021). According to him, the demonstrators are far from all anti-vaccine. There are people who are anti-vaccine, but also others who demonstrate more clearly against the health pass or for freedoms or against the fact that it is something that is imposed from above by the government. Opponents of the health pass “are rather people who are relatively young, there is an over-representation of 25 to 34-year-olds who consider themselves to be the most affected by the health pass. Antoine Bristielle believes that we can make the link with the movement of Yellow vests because the anti-health pass movement once again reflects a feeling of the illegitimacy of institutions and the way in which decisions are taken, which had already been denounced by the yellow vests advocating the citizens’ initiative referendum. Historian Sylvain Boulouque also thinks that the anti-health pass movement is quite similar to that of the Yellow vests (Desarbres, 2021). On the one hand, there is a part of the extreme left, and on the other part of the extreme right. People on the left are rather in favour of the vaccine, some would even be in favour of a compulsory vaccine, but they are opposed to the health pass and the constraint on freedoms that it produces. The second part of the demonstrators who are rather on the right are anti-vaccines: in the name of individual freedom, I do what I want.

For Jean Petaux (Collet, 2021), political scientist, the demonstrators share certain struggles: the fact of being anti-elite, anti-system. In both movements, we also observe the same lack of organization and defined structure, as well as the same use of social networks and instant messaging. The anti-pass movement is broader, bringing together mainly an urban population, while the yellow vests came from a certain peripheral France. There are people from all walks of life, executives, and even people who have been vaccinated. However, if the yellow vests enjoyed very broad support, 49% of the French population are strongly opposed to the anti-health pass movement.

Also, the government’s behaviour is firmer against anti-pass than at the time of the Yellow vests because defending the legitimacy of a 90-95% vaccine coverage is easier than defending the legitimacy of a carbon tax, as was the case in 2018. The government, on the strength of polls among the French who, nearly 70%, believe that the pass is legitimate, is more able to show its muscles. The health pass requirement is difficult to refuse, even for those with social difficulties, because there are no associated costs.

According to the psycho-sociologist Pascal Marchand (Marchand, 2021), it is important not to confuse the movement of Yellow vests and the movement of anti-health passes. The yellow vest movement from protest to protest was building a representation of alternative politics and a political agenda. On the contrary, the only thing the manifests have in common concerning the anti-health-passes movement is the perception of being deprived of a certain freedom. Certainly, there is also among them, as among the Yellow vests, a rejection of institutions and
the first of them is the public health institution. The recent history of the country has shown that pharmaceutical industries and others were able to diffuse products that caused toxic damage to the population. There is also hostility towards the media, seen as the prolonged hand of power. A loss of credibility of traditional media has led to recourse to alternative media – to more conspiratorial social networks.

Compulsory vaccination for certain professions

From September 15, health personnel and all people working in health establishments as well as firefighters, ambulance workers, or even home helpers, gendarmes and soldiers, must have received at least one dose of vaccine. Or they will need to have a certificate of recovery if they have already contracted COVID-19 or a certificate of contraindication. After September 15, those who are not in good standing (by this date, they must have made at least one injection, then have a complete vaccination schedule by October 15) will be suspended until they become compliant, and for this time, they will no longer receive their salary (Chérau, 2021).

The issue of compulsory vaccination was particularly discussed in relation to medical personnel. There are those, rare, who have chosen to hang up the blouse. The fact that some people are resigned to giving up this profession for which they had a real vocation, often nurtured in childhood to escape vaccination, is appealing (Haroche, 2021). Professor Karine Lacombe analyzed “In care, the interest is collective. When we engage in care, we think of others. And thinking about others means making sure you are vaccinated, protected so as not to infect yourself and not to infect others either. It is an approach that is altruistic. We do not want to be vaccinated, we change jobs, we make ourselves available” (Haroche, 2021).

Behind this type of observation is the idea that these people had no place in the medical profession. Thus, a caregiver who rejects vaccination would necessarily be a bad caregiver. Dr. Gérald Kierzeck, for his part is irritated by the “stigmatization” of unvaccinated staff: these same caregivers who were applauded in the spring of 2020. We can truly speak of institutional mistreatment and harassment, leading to a vicious circle of resignations, departures, and lack of staff (Haroche, 2021). According to Frédéric Pierru (CNRS), a specialist in the medical field cited by Liberation (Favereau, 2015), the bourgeois recruitment of the medical profession leads to a social hierarchy: the well-to-do classes who give orders to the middle and popular classes. However, regarding the refusal of vaccination, the further down the scale, the greater the reluctance. There may be a message: we, the orderlies and nurses, are not under the orders of the doctors.

What about the sacrificial meaning of the vocation of a caregiver? Putting on the gown is the pragmatic choice for some caregivers that offers the greatest certainty of finding a job. Caring can be seen as a professional activity like any other, which one accepts to do, but without however giving up on one’s own convictions. In any case, we can note how much the health crisis has led to a crystallization of the splits that have always existed, exacerbated by political considerations and by social networks.

What consequences for democracy can the introduction of the health pass have?

The professor of medical ethics, Emmanuel Hirsch, emphasizes that, paradoxically, because in France people have the privilege of having vaccines against COVID-19, the question of individual freedom and the choice to be vaccinated or not is aroused. What about
fundamental freedoms if this remedy has not been offered, as is the case in low- and middle-income countries (Hirsch, 2021)?

Does the law relating to the management of the health crisis mark an inflection that is detrimental to democratic values and principles (Loi, 2021)? How do we think about our responsibilities in an emergency and in both (political and ethical) challenges?

In an opinion of July 16, the COVID-19 Scientific Council “notes that certain provisions provided for in this new law can generate limitations on individual freedoms but can also make it possible to maintain greater freedom for the wider world (Avis, 2021). The Universal Declaration of Human Rights (art. 29-1) (La Déclaration, 1948) maintains that “the individual has duties towards the community in which only the free and full development of his personality is possible.” Tested by an interdependence whose imperatives and rules we have understood, is self-determination affirmed as an act of freedom, even of resistance, a position that is democratically acceptable? Individualism comes up against the limits of its legitimization when it does not allow intervention in a pandemic phenomenon that we can only manage to control through collective action. The idea of individual freedom must be examined considering the circumstances of a pandemic.

If article 16-3 of the Civil Code invoked to oppose vaccination affirms that “the integrity of the human body can only be harmed in the event of therapeutic necessity for the person” (Code Civil, 2004). Would it not be appropriate to admit that in a pandemic individual integrity is reciprocally conditioned by the respect accorded to collective integrity? Believing that refusing vaccination preserves one’s integrity should not be unfavorable to that of others. Therefore, the vaccine strategy now has an ethical and political scope beyond a health imperative.

However, according to the philosopher and writer Gaspard Koenig, not being able to move around in public space without showing your identity is serious. Morally, it is a barrier to be crossed, open a bit anyhow, without debate (Koenig, 2021).

The vaccine today in France is free and available to everyone. The choice is individual: those who want to protect themselves can do so. However, even vaccinated, we can be contagious. Authorities are touting the Covid-19 vaccination and health pass as a shield against transmission, while studies are only emerging. Koenig believes that once the vaccination is available to everyone – it is a matter of individual responsibility. According to him, the health pass creates very strong damage: the end of anonymity, as well as the transformation of civil society into controllers for the state. As not everyone is going to do it, it will produce lawless areas. There is also a kind of class contempt in it since the two camps are opposing each other without speaking to each other. Koenig even thinks that compulsory vaccination for all would be more justifiable and pose fewer problems than the health pass since it would be a universal measure that does not induce public space control. The state did what it needed to do: it allowed the entire population to be vaccinated, and from that point on, any restriction policy became illegitimate.

It’s very difficult once you put in place control measures to remove them. A whole ecosystem is being created. We bequeath to future generations a world where there is no longer an anonymous public space, where we can no longer move freely, where we must constantly justify ourselves. “I don’t want to live in a world of constant control,” says Koenig (Koenig, 2021).

Critics of the health pass unanimously denounce an authoritarian danger. The National Commission for Informatics and Freedoms (CNIL) presents this danger as “the risk of habituation and trivialization of such devices that threaten privacy and slippage, in the future, and potentially for other considerations, towards a society where such controls would become the norm and not the exception (Délibération, 2021). The health pass is nothing new as a mode
of regulation. This is how the French state treats foreign people. After checking whether their situation complies with criteria set by the state, it issues them a permit: visa, residence permit, etc. Until recently, however, this type of repression had important practical limitations: titles could only be issued with a certain delay, and at a certain cost, many police officers had to be deployed to verify them, and some police officers had even to be specifically trained to verify its authenticity. These limitations undoubtedly explain in part why this type of repression has so far focused on specific cases (such as the control of foreigners) without being systematically deployed to manage any other situation that the state wishes to regulate.

New technical developments could remove these old limits and allow this form of repression to apply to the entire population for a very wide variety of places and activities. Over the past decade, most of the French population has acquired a smartphone equipped with a camera and capable of reading 2D barcodes. At the same time, the administration has largely adopted the tools of 2D barcode and cryptography to secure the documents it issues. This makes things possible today that were unthinkable even a few years ago. This allows tens of thousands of untrained and unpaid by the state (but simply equipped with a smartphone) to be entrusted with the task of controlling the entire population at the entrance to countless public places and this at an extremely low cost for the state since most of the infrastructure (telephones) has already been privately financed by those in charge of control. Now, and suddenly, the state has the material to regulate public space in almost total proportions (La quadrature, 2021).

The massive adoption of the health pass would have the effect of accustoming the population to submit to this mass control. However, paradoxically, the health pass does not appear to be a very effective regulatory tool in its current format. It seems difficult to prevent doctors from providing passes to people who shouldn’t. And, “good people” can easily share them with “bad people.” Of course, the police intend to carry out identity checks to combat such exchanges, but while the effectiveness of the system ultimately relies on random police checks, there was no need to deploy mass surveillance mechanisms. Meanwhile, cases of fraudulent vaccination certificates are on the increase (Dupré, 2021). The traffic in false certificates has given justice a lot of work. At the Ministry of Solidarity and Health, they advocate severity, while readily recalling Article 441-1 of the Penal Code: “ Forgery and the use of forgery are punishable by three years’ imprisonment and 45,000 Euros fine” (Dupré, 2021), in a spirit of paternalistic rigour.

**Conclusion**

The politician has, by definition, no excuse: it is the counterpart of the exercise of sovereignty. The good ruler decides without always knowing perfectly because one is perpetually confronted with the urgency of action. He should not dwell too much on his own doubts, even if it is healthy for him to have them. In the best of all possible worlds, conviction and responsibility are not mutually exclusive. But when it comes to acting in a marked world, this opposition arises when the action must be decided (Tenzer, 2007). On the other hand, the state in a democracy is obligated to prove that a measure causing risks to fundamental freedoms is necessary before it is deployed.

In France, the government imposed the health pass without demonstrating its effectiveness. It did not deploy or test alternative measures that would pose no risk to freedoms (such as benevolent, transparent, and non-paternalistic communication campaigns of vaccination) or additional ambitious measures (such as the release of funding to allow the doubling of classrooms and their ventilation, for example).
The effectiveness of the pass in terms of health remains to be demonstrated. There are still many uncertainties: transmission rate even once vaccinated, the effectiveness on new variants, the validity period to remember... Despite everything, the executive can be happy: in December 2020, only 42% of French people were favorable to vaccination. At the start of October 2021, 75.2% of French people had received at least one dose of vaccine, 72.8% had received all the required doses (COVIDTracker, 2021). Another reason for government satisfaction is the acceptance of the health pass by 70% of the population (Timsit, 2021), which confirms the adherence of the French to the government’s anti-COVID policy, even if it has brought essential importance restrictions.

However, the rulers and the population must remain vigilant: if today, these injunctions are only concerning the health sphere, we must fear that this kind of tool, once trivialized, could be put at the service of injunctions going well beyond this framework. And that a few more steps towards Technopolis could crush democratic freedoms for good. As Renée Fregosi said: “Spoiled children of democracy, Westerners have become lazy to defend democratic gains through constant vigilance and renewed inventiveness to adapt to new challenges” (Fregosi, 2021).

References


Délibération no 2021-097 du 6 août 2021 portant avis sur un projet de décret modifiant le décret no 2021-699 du 1er juin 2021 prescrivant les mesures générales nécessaires à la gestion de la sortie de crise sanitaire et le décret no 2021-901 du 6 juillet 2021 relatif au traitement automatisé de données à caractère personnel dénommé “Convertisseur de certificats” (deman de d’avis no. 21013690) Texte no 93 (2021) Available online: https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/jorf/id/JORFTEXT0000043915894


Service public français (2021) Available online: https://www.service-public.fr/particuliers/actualites/A15084


The Case of Tito and Soma Mukhopadhyay: Factitious Heroism by Proxy, Factitious Heroism, and Revealing the Deception Thereof for the Future of Autism Treatment

Dan Howitt

Harvard University (Cambridge, Massachusetts, the United States of America)
E-mail: dth055@g.harvard.edu
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1027-8917

I reveal the masterful multifaceted communicative fraud that Soma Mukhopadhyay has engaged in with her profoundly autistic son Tito since 2000 on an array of major television programs, and in the presence of an array of scientists, physicians, and autism organization leaders who studied them, and which has not been observed by anyone else. Soma has deceived the public that her son has a normal if not advanced neurology and mind, and that all profoundly autistic persons may as well. She devised a variation of the treatment method and educational method that is referred to as Facilitated Communication, and refers to her method as the Rapid Prompting Method. By my having revealed the intricacy of the communicative fraud that she engages in with Tito, (a) the past, current, and future treatment methods and educational methods for autistic persons may be assessed more carefully by scientists, physicians, journalists, autism organization leaders, and others, and (b) the ways that autistic persons are conceived of may be proceeded with more carefully. I do not intend for my observational work, and ensuing conceptual work, to demonstrate to others that the particular fraud that Soma engages should be monitored for, but rather, that claims of, and demonstrations of, treatment methods and educational methods for autism be acutely visually and auditorily observed, such that the innumerable kinds of fraud that may be occurring are observed. The assessment of treatment methods and educational methods for autism with preexisting methodologies will likely result, as it did of Tito and Soma, in highly surreptitious fraud being overlooked, and perpetuated; and this entails the proliferation of mass deception.

Keywords: Tito Mukhopadhyay, Soma Mukhopadhyay, Factitious Heroism By Proxy, Factitious Heroism, Facilitated Communication, Rapid Prompting Method, Autism

Received: 28 September 2021 / Accepted: 23 October 2021 / Published: 15 November 2021
Introduction

None of the innumerable millions of people since 2000 who have observed the profoundly autistic man Tito Mukhopadhyay and his mother Soma Mukhopadhyay on CNN, PBS, BBC, Good Morning America, and Closer To Truth, and none of the array of scientists, physicians, autism organizations, and journalists who studied them, observed the brilliant, multifaceted, communicative fraud that Soma engages in with Tito.

Tito, since he was eleven years old in 2000, to the present, has been presented by Soma on the aforementioned television programs, and via other forms of media and literature, as being able to write-communicate and type-communicate not only normally, but at an advanced level, and on his own accord – that is, from an independent content of his mind – with the assistance of the Facilitated Communication method that she treats him with, which she refers to as the “Rapid Prompting Method.”

In this article, I provide my visual observations and auditory observations of the interactions of Tito and Soma that have not been observed from 2000 to the present by innumerable millions of people, including the vast array of scientists, physicians, journalists, autism organization leaders, and others, who studied them. I concurrently adduce various novel concepts in order to characterize my observations.

My observations, and concurrent conceptualization, demonstrate the presence of what I refer to as “Factitious Heroism By Proxy,” and Factitious Heroism.

For context: (a) I demonstrated that none of the innumerable millions of people who observed the television presentations of the profoundly autistic woman Carly Fleischmann between 2008-2018 observed the brilliant communicative fraud that her speech-therapist Howard Dalal engaged in with her; (b) I uncovered an array of instances of brilliant conceptual fraud (which I refer to as “dissociative fraud”) of fundamental mathematics and fundamental physics; and (c) I observed a fundamental feature of the universe that has not been correctly observed, nor conceived of, by humanity to the present.

The Harvard Educational Review in 1990 published an article of Douglas Biklen that presents the 1970’s clinical, communicative method of Rosemary Crossley of Australia to the United States, namely what is referred to as “Facilitated Communication”; and Biklen, a professor at Syracuse University in the United States, is considered to be the first person to do so; and Crossley, a clinician and educator in Australia, is considered to be the founder of the method.

Biklen states:

Jonathan Solaris cannot speak. David Armbruster can say a few words, usually unintelligible. (...) I was not surprised by how either of them appeared. Theirs were the

---

1 See (Terrill, 2000; Blakeslee, 2002).
2 See (Feldman, 2018: 100-103; Feldman, 2004: 102, 117).
3 See (Howitt, November 2021, forthcoming).
4 See (Howitt, 2021; 2021a).
5 See (Howitt, 2021; 2021a).
behaviors of autism. But what I did not anticipate was that their communication with me would assault my assumptions about autism and ultimately yield important lessons for education (Biklen, 1990: 291).

In 1995 in the United States, the following article described the method, delineated its history, and argued that it is illegitimate.7

Facilitated communication (FC) ... a teaching-treatment technique ... is a method of assisting people with severe developmental disabilities to communicate.

(...) this technique, which involves providing physical support to people with disabilities as they type out messages on a keyboard or letterboard, appears to result in unexpected literacy and to disclose normative or superior intellectual skills among people with lifelong histories of severe developmental delay.

Controlled research using single and double blind procedures in the laboratory and natural settings with a range of clinical populations with which FC is used has determined that, not only are the people with disabilities unable to respond accurately to label or describe stimuli unseen by their assistants, but that the responses are controlled by the assistants.

In 2018 in England, the following article described the method, delineated the history of scientific studies of the method, and argued that it is illegitimate.8

Facilitated communication (FC) (...) is a technique that involves a person with a disability pointing to letters, pictures, or objects on a keyboard or on a communication board, typically with physical support from a “facilitator.” The physical support of FC usually occurs on the hand, wrist, elbow, or shoulder (Biklen, Winston Morton, Gold, Berrigan, & Swaminathan, 1992) but can also occur on other parts of the body. (2)

... there are no new studies on authorship and, therefore, no evidence that FC is a valid form of communication for individuals with severe communication disabilities. Given that facilitator control has been documented repeatedly and replicated by several different research teams across continents over the last 26 years, it is not surprising to see that there are no additional studies addressing the question of authorship in FC. What is noteworthy, however, is that there are also no studies that demonstrate that the individuals with disabilities are the authors of the messages generated with FC. (8)

Notwithstanding the aforementioned critical articles, and the following, aforementioned statement,

not only are the people with disabilities unable to respond accurately to label or describe stimuli unseen by their assistants, but (...) the responses are controlled by the assistants.

---

7 See (Jacobson, 1995).
8 See (Hemsley, 2018).
there apparently are no articles that provide precise descriptions of how the assistants (speech therapists, etc.) control the communication of the disabled persons. While the articles deduce that the assistants accomplish this via physical support (...) on the hand, wrist, elbow, or shoulder (...) [and] on other parts of the body.

there apparently are no studies that provide analyses of videos of assistants working with their clients, and descriptions of when in the videos the assistants engage in this communicative fraud, and precisely how. And this is perhaps why, despite the findings of the critical articles, the aforementioned 2018 article provides leeway for the clinical procession of Facilitated Communication by emphasizing that wherever the method proceeds, there should be a scientific examination of the authorship of the communications of the disabled persons who are undergoing the method:

With substantial scientific evidence demonstrating the influence of facilitators over messages produced using FC, it is ethically and scientifically imperative to empirically test authorship of messages produced using FC and analyzing FC message data without authorship testing reduces the credibility of findings. (6)

However, if precisely how

the responses (...) [of] the people with disabilities are controlled by the assistants

were demonstrated, perhaps it would be concluded that there is no need for additional scientific examination of the various employments of the method, nor variations of the method, such as the aforementioned Rapid Prompting Method.

Moreover, the aforementioned is perhaps why Facilitated Communication and the Rapid Prompting Method are considered to be significantly beneficial by a considerable extent of people in the US, and likely worldwide: The aforementioned Autism Parenting Magazine, despite discussing the array of negative aspects of Facilitated Communication, also discusses an array of positive aspects of it, and does not reject it⁹; the following two major US media articles of 2016 and 2018 clearly indicate that Facilitated Communication is readily employed by a significant extent of people;¹⁰ and the following major autism media article of 2020 states the following about the Rapid Prompting Method:¹¹

Despite rapid prompting’s popularity, no rigorous scientific studies show that the method works. There is no empirical support for the idea that it spurs academic progress or that its students express their own thoughts.

But the lack of proof has not dissuaded many parents. Mukhopadhyay conducts up to 11 sessions a day and holds workshops around the world several times a year. In Austin, she sees her clients at the offices of a nonprofit called Helping Autism through Learning

---

¹⁰ See (Shermer, 2016; Salzberg, 2018).
¹¹ See (Borrell, 2020).
and Outreach (HALO), founded for her programs in 2002. Four-day HALO camps cost $850, and training sessions for parents and providers are $950. HALO sells Mukhopadhyay’s books and a variety of letter boards. It also has lent its trademarked seal of approval to 10 independent providers in the United States, the United Kingdom and Mexico. Mukhopadhyay draws a salary of more than $150,000 per year, according to tax filings. And HALO has competitors, such as the Growing Kids Therapy Center in Herndon, Virginia, which provides training called Spelling to Communicate that also focuses on motor skills and encourages autistic people to use a letter board to communicate.

Parents have also tried to introduce the method into U.S. special-education classrooms. According to a 2018 study, 17 percent of 535 special educators surveyed in Tennessee used the rapid prompting method with their students every day – a frequency on par with their use of such evidence-based practices as pivotal response treatment and the picture-exchange communication system.

Regarding what the Rapid Prompting Method is:12

Rapid prompting appears straightforward: A teacher holds up an alphabet board or a choice of two words on scraps of paper and then verbally or physically prompts an autistic person to point to individual letters or to words. The teacher might, for instance, tell the student that the sky is blue and then ask what color the sky is. Although teachers try to avoid moving the student’s hand directly, they may nudge an elbow or tap a shoulder.

Moreover, the employment of the method can be observed in the extensive television coverage that I provide and discuss later in this article.

The Rapid Prompting Method began in the United States in 2001:13

The Cure Autism Now Foundation introduced RPM to the USA in 2001 (http://www.halo-soma.org). (...) In 2001, the Cure Autism Now Foundation offered Mukhopadhyay a fellowship to implement her teaching method at a school in Los Angeles, working with nine children with ASD.

Aside, Portia Iversen is who co-founded Cure Autism Now (which later became Autism Speaks); and I discuss her later in this article in the context of my discussion about the PBS Closer To Truth television presentation in 2003 of Tito and Soma, of which she was an interviewee and participant. Moreover, regarding the involvement of Iversen and Cure Autism Now with the Rapid Prompting Method14:

In the early 2000s, the media billed Tito as a miracle. Mukhopadhyay first brought him to the U.S. in July 2001 with the support of Cure Autism Now, a nonprofit that later became part of Autism Speaks. The organization’s co-founder, Portia Iversen,
wanted Mukhopadhyay to work with her own son, Dov. Within months of her arrival in the U.S., Mukhopadhyay was working with other parents, and Iversen’s publicity machine attracted the interest of scientists. “Autism experts are studying him, amazed to discover, for what they say is the first time, a severely autistic person who can explain his disorder,” journalist Sandra Blakeslee wrote in a 2002 article about Tito in *The New York Times*.

Regarding discussions about, and criticisms of, the Rapid Prompting Method:¹⁵

FC [Facilitated Communication] and RPM [Rapid Prompting Method] are strikingly similar in terms of claims of miraculous hidden communication and intelligence evident only during facilitator-dependent communication. (...) RPM may create an illusion similar to FC by fostering indefinite prompt dependency. (47)

RPM facilitators generate and subsequently prompt participants to convey messages that may not represent the individual’s genuine desires, thoughts, or emotions. (45)

Given the similarities between RPM and FC, it seems very likely that the messages are (unintentionally and subconsciously) authored by the RPM facilitator (Boynton, 2012; Todd, 2012; Tostanoski et al., 2014; von Tetzchner 2012). (46)

(...) indefinite prompt dependency is entirely incompatible with genuine independent skill leaning – because the aid is actually making the responses and using the participant as a mechanism of expression. (...) prompt dependency precludes independence by rendering an individual facilitator-dependent. It is possible that no actual academic or communicative skills are taught to participants in RPM. Instead, participants may only learn how to better follow subtle, rhythmic, and frequent prompts. The danger, of course, is that an untrained observer might not be able to readily recognize such subtle prompts and may mistakenly assume that prompted responses accurately reflect the true preferences, academic abilities, and emotions of the individual. Such an outcome would make RPM equally as dangerous and inhuman as facilitated communication (FC), a thoroughly debunked method that creates a powerful illusion that seems notably simpler to RPM (Todd, 2013; Tostanoski et al., 2014; Travers, Tincani, & Lang, in press). (46)

Notwithstanding, and as I discussed of Facilitated Communication, what in my opinion explains the persistent prevalence of the Rapid Prompting Method is the apparent absence of analyses of videos of employments of the method; and this would explain why the authors of the aforementioned study state the following; and via italics I add emphasis to the words that demonstrate that the authors, as is the case of the authors of the critical studies on Facilitated Communication, do not, and cannot, argue that there is proof of communicative fraud:

> It is possible that no actual academic or communicative skills are taught to participants in RPM. Instead, participants may only learn how to better follow subtle, rhythmic, and frequent prompts.

¹⁵ See (Lang et al., 2014).
While, of course, there is an absence of definitive proof of the effectiveness of the two methods, this, of course, is immensely different than the presence of definitive proof of fraud.

The following, aforementioned position of the aforementioned authors demonstrates, I believe, that not only has no one observed communicative fraud occur during the employment of the Rapid Prompting Method, but that, perhaps due to the unsaid belief that it is impossible to do so, there is not even the goal to do so: The authors believe that what is crucial is observing the prompts that occur, and the prompted responses, and that when the prompts are not observed, observers may mistakenly observe the communications of the disabled persons to be from an independent content of their minds.

The danger, of course, is that an untrained observer might not be able to readily recognize such subtle prompts and may mistakenly assume that prompted responses accurately reflect the true preferences, academic abilities, and emotions of the individual.

However, as is stated above:\(^{16}\)

Rapid prompting appears straightforward: A teacher holds up an alphabet board or a choice of two words on scraps of paper and then verbally or physically prompts an autistic person to point to individual letters or to words.

The prompts are observational self-evident, as are the prompted responses, as can be observed in the videos that I provide of the extensive television coverage of the employment of the method. What is not only not observationally self-evident, but of the near observational impossibility of masterful practical magic, is the multitude of variations of novel, highly surreptitious, multifaceted communicative fraud that Soma engages in with Tito, even in the presence of world-renowned physicians, scientists, professors, and journalists, and the founder of the most important autism organization in the United States, who herself has a profoundly autistic child. Moreover, this has occurred in the presence of, via television, what I would estimate to be fifty to one-hundred million or more people world-wide over twenty-one years and ongoing. None of the above persons observed any of the communicative fraud. Two of the most elite physicians and scientists in history – Oliver Sacks\(^{17}\) and Michael Merzenich\(^{18}\) – studied Tito and Soma extensively, and concluded that Tito has a normal, if not advanced, brain and mind, and that he communicates from an independent content of his mind. Sacks is quoted on the back-cover of a book that is purported to be written by Tito as stating the following:\(^{19}\)

\[\ldots\text{it has usually been assumed that deeply autistic people are scarcely capable of introspection or deep thought, let alone of poetic or metaphoric leaps of the imagination—or, if they are, that they are incapable of communicating these thoughts to us. Tito gives the lie to all these assumptions, and forces us to reconsider the condition of the deeply autistic.}\]

Merzenich is quoted on that back-cover as stated the following\(^{20}\):

\[\text{See (Borrell, 2020).}\]
\[\text{See (Neuman, 2015).}\]
\[\text{See (Farley, 2016; Farley, 2015).}\]
\[\text{See (Mukhopadhyay, 2011).}\]
\[\text{See (Mukhopadhyay, 2011: back cover).}\]
Tito is not only authentic, but also miraculous. (...) [He] is a beautiful example of the possible.

The medium of my experimental study is the array of preexisting, extensive television coverage of Tito and Soma engaged in the Rapid Prompting Method, and a journal-article in which a purported email-conversation between the author and Tito is provided; and the context of my study is the array of preexisting literature and media on Tito and Soma, the Rapid Prompting Method, and Facilitated Communication.

The above method of experimentation allows all persons to visually and auditorily observe what I visually and auditorily observed.

Profound autism is, of course, an extraordinarily devastating neurological condition, which moreover, of course, entails devastating psychological effects on autistic persons; and the families and others who involved with autistic persons encounter significant difficulties. Moreover, the social, political, and economic structures of countries throughout the world are of course intensely impacted by the prevalence of profound autism, as well as lesser degrees of autism. The intractability of the condition is surely the basis for the devising of, and proliferation of, Facilitated Communication and the Rapid Prompting Method. However, as I conveyed above, significant structural resources have been, and continue to be, distributed to the practitioners of the methods; and since the methods are, as I have shown of two employments of the methods, not only fraudulent, but masterfully so, an immense extent of people worldwide are both being deceived, deceiving themselves, and deceiving others; and the deception is of profoundly autistic persons being improved by the methods, and of the very concept of profoundly autistic. And due to the masterfully deceptive practitioners, even world-renowned autism organizations, scientists, physicians, journalists, and others, have unknowingly aided the structural proliferation of the methods, and the reconception of the profoundly autistic.

Now that the brilliant practical magic of the founder of the Rapid Prompting Method has been observed, and can now be observed by all persons, perhaps modifications of the aforementioned societal structures might occur, and perhaps the elating widespread deception will discontinue, for better or worse; but perhaps it is better to endure the despair of intractability than relish the elation of deception.

60 Minutes, 2003\textsuperscript{21}

In 2003 on 60 Minutes, at 0:11 – 0:42, the aforementioned Merzenich is interviewed about Tito, and states,

I was surprised when I – certainly surprised when I met him – to see the very compelling evidence that he was for real.

The narrator states that Merzenich had been studying Tito for nearly a year, and that Merzenich says that Tito is not only authentic, but miraculous.

Merzenich then states,

\textsuperscript{21} See (Mabrey, 2003).
There can be little question in the writing behavior in Tito that he’s providing the answers and that the answers are coming from his brain.

However, and to begin:

1:54 – 2:03: Soma is with Tito, away from the interviewer, assisting him with his handwriting. Tito writes a word, she takes the pencil away from him, she erases the word, while she is erasing the word she states “vegetable”, she gives him back the pencil, he begins to write again, and she states “vegetable” again. She is then shown with the pencil in her hand again, and erasing the word again; and as she is erasing, she states, “No one will be able to read that.” Then, that excerpt of the filming stops, and another excerpt is shown.

At 2:55, the interviewer is present, and Tito and Soma are sitting with her in a different area. The interviewer asks him a question, and he writes, “I would have been a vegetable.” As I will further explain below, it is clear that Soma extensively prepares Tito on what to write.

3:04: As I explain further in my below section on the 2003 PBS Closer To Truth television episode, the following is the case about Tito’s writing of “I would have been a vegetable.” Tito appears to start each sentence with “I” on his own accord. Soma then reads each word that he writes, and verbally adds a letter at the end of each word; and the letters cue Tito on what to write for the next word. For the above sentence, she states “I-w,” “would-h,” “have-b,” “a-v.” He writes, “I would have been a vegetable.” Aside, it is unclear whether she said “a-v” before he wrote “a,” which would have made saying “been-a” not necessary.

3:34 – 4:02: The interviewer states,

He has written hundreds of poems, including this one, which we watched him write from beginning to end.

However, at 3:57 – 4:01, he is shown typing with one finger. They then show the 12 line poem. Regarding whether they carefully watched him write – that is, whether they watched each key that he typed, and observed what appeared on the screen – I will provide the following:

PBS, Closer To Truth, 2003

0:40 – 0:58: The creator and host of Closer To Truth, Robert Kuhn, talks to Tito and then asks him a question. When Kuhn is finished with his question, Soma begins tapping on Tito’s right shoulder with her right hand’s fingers, at which time Tito, at 0:59, begins to write. He writes, “I get.” First, as is seen on the piece of paper on which he is writing, he begins his above sentence also with “I get”, and the top sentence with “I can get”. As was discussed above, the “get” and “can” were surely cued by Soma by her verbally stating “I-g” and “I-c” after Tito wrote “I”. Second, as he is finishing the “et” of “get,” Soma states “I get a-f.” He then begins and finishes writing “flattered”. As I further discuss below, Soma, by extending her vocalization of a word that Tito writes with the first letter of another word, she is queuing him on which word to write next by stimulating his memory on what she previously prepared him to write upon hearing the first letter of the other word.

2:17: Portia Iversen asks Tito a question. Tito writes “I,” Soma quickly says “I,” Tito writes “just,” and Soma quickly says “just-n.” The next word that Tito writes, immediately after he hears the “n” of “just-n,” is “need.” Soma then says “need-t,” and Tito writes “to.” Both the

22 See (Kuhn, 2003).
“n” and “t” are quickly but sharply voiced. The filming then stops, and then resumes as Tito is writing the last word of the sentence. Soma is queuing Tito on what he should write for the next word by including the first letter of what she has prepared him to write for the next word, as the last letter of the word that she verbally calls out. (Aside, for the above first word “I,” Soma says “I-s,” which was likely done in order to cue him to write a word that begins with “s” for the next word).

For the question that Iversen asked, there likely are many answers that Tito could have written. Since he proceeded with “just” after “I,” Soma likely adjusted the kind of answer that she wanted him to produce. Aside, most people likely overlook the above because they attribute it to her Indian accent: While Americans et al. do not state, for example, “just-n” for “just,” and “need-t” for “need,” most people, upon hearing her intense Indian accent, likely think that this anomaly is due to her accent.

4:16: The filming begins with Soma saying “have-t”; and Tito then writes “to.” Soma then says “to-w,” and Tito writes “wait.” Soma then says “wait-l,” and Tito writes “long.” Soma then reads the sentence, “I do not have to wait long.”

8:18: Soma begins with saying what Tito wrote. He writes “I”, and Soma says “I-c”; and you can moreover see how she pronounces the “c” with her mouth. Tito then writes “could not.” Soma then says “couldn’t-n”; and Tito then writes something like “not”. Soma then says “not-e”; and the filming of that instance of him writing stops, and Soma does not read the sentence that he wrote.

12:28: Soma says “it-c”, “can-b”, then “d”, for Tito’s writing of “It can become bigger than the door”. It is difficult to hear the entirety of what she says; and what Tito actually wrote is not shown. Moreover, I think that she calls out “because” rather than “bigger”, as Tito is writing, and then verbally corrected it in her final reading of the sentence. Soma cues “can”, “become”, and “door”, and then likely adds and corrects some of the words in between, namely “bigger” for “because”, and “the” prior to “door.”

25:17: When Soma reads a sentence that is already written by Tito, she does not say any post-word letters.

3:51 – 4:50: Before Kuhn asks him a particular question, and while the group is having a discussion, Soma begins to state some words, and Tito concurrently is writing. At the same time that Kuhn finishes asking a brief question, Tito is finished with the core of his answer. Tito then continues to write something that is completely separate from Kuhn’s question. I believe that Tito knew what to write before Kuhn asked him the question – that is, that Soma prepared him for the answer. Tito then continued to write something that was separate from Kuhn’s question, likely due to being confused about what to write at what time. Aside, no one was observing, for the above, the coordination between Soma speaking and Tito writing. It is possible that she stimulates him, via his memory, to provide X answer by stating one or a few words to him at the outset, which seems to be the case for the above. Moreover, as he was writing, she could have been stating words before he wrote them. For the above, the camera was not filming his writing.

5:23: Kuhn asks, “Does he read?” He has never been shown to read to an even extremely minimal degree, and, it is clear that he cannot read his own writing. He has never replicated what he just wrote, and has never been publicly asked to replicate what he just wrote.

7:42: Soma says that he sometimes edits his writing. She has never publicly demonstrated that he does this. He has had significant television coverage, and other kinds of public coverage. This episode of Kuhn’s program was in 2003, which is when Soma and Iversen
worked together. In 17 years, no editing has been demonstrated. 7:56, Soma states that he “corrects himself, backspaces, opens his files.” This has never been demonstrated.

8:13: Iversen begins to ask Tito a question, and when she is about half way through her question, Tito begins to write. Her question is entirely unclear half way through, and it is necessary to wait until she is finished in order to understand what she asked. As for his answer, this is uncertain: Soma states the three-word answer, and I believe that it is something like “I could not.”

10:11: At the instant that Kuhn begins to ask Tito, “Tito how do you see color?”, Soma presses a key on the computer. I believe that the key that she pressed prepares a prearranged computer program to proceed upon the next key-strike – that is, her key-strike puts the prearranged program in ready-mode; and then the program proceeds upon the next key-strike. In this case, the program is a prearranged automated verbal statement, namely “Shapes come first and then color.” Upon Tito’s first key-strike, the prosody of the automated verbal statement begins, and is of a consistent prosody. Tito’s second key-strike is a miss-strike, as he lightly touches three keys in between each other. The camera then does not show any more typing until his last key-strike. For his last key-strike, the automated voice states “color” (the last word of the above statement) before he makes the key-strike; and after he makes the key-strike, there is no automated voice.

In addition to the above, while it appears that he makes at least 3 key-strikes, of the 6 that would be needed for the 6 word sentence, the keys that he strikes are letter-keys, not word-keys: On the keyboard of 26 letters, there are no keys which, when pressed, result in the words “Shapes,” “come,” “first,” “and,” “then,” “color.” That is, there are no keys that are devoted to these particular words. Moreover, there are no typed-communication programs that use the 26 letters in this way; and such programs would, in any case, be useless.

In addition to the above, Soma, while the automated voice is proceeding, verbally reports the first 4 words of the above statement in the following manner.

Computer: “Shape”  
Soma immediately thereafter: “Shape”  
Computer: “Come, First”  
Soma immediately thereafter, and rapidly: “Shape-Come-First”  
Computer: “And”  
Soma simultaneously: “And”

Soma is reading the words from the screen. While this is not relevant to the above, I believe that she does this as a distraction, namely to try to distract observers away from fully attending to the keys that Tito is pressing, and from the relation between the automated voice’s prosody and the keys that Tito presses. Moreover, I believe that she, in doing this, is trying to provide legitimacy to the relation between Tito’s key-strikes and the automated voice: She is trying to convey that since she is reading the words on the screen, she is simply reading what the computer program is also reading, namely Tito’s key-strikes. Aside, there is no need for Soma to say anything, at any time, during Tito’s typing and the automated voice’s speech. There is also no need for Soma to verbally state each word that Tito writes with his pencil. I believe that she does both of these for the above distractive purpose, and legitimacy purpose.

10:38: While the group is having a discussion, the camera shows Tito in the process of writing with his pencil, and Soma stating several words during this time, as she watches him
writing. (However, there is no audio of her voice, and only her mouth can be seen forming words). At 10:45, Soma states “door” and then taps 5 times total with her right index finger on the clipboard holding the piece of paper on which Tito is writing. Tito then writes the last word of that statement, which is “door.” Soma then states what he wrote, “Only after I see the door”; and then she adds, “I see the room,” “Only after I see the door.” It is unclear whether “I see the room” is what she is adding to the discussion about Tito’s statement “Only after I see the door,” or whether Tito also wrote this during that time-period. Regardless, it is clear that she verbally instructed him to write “door.” And again, she should not be verbally stating anything, at any time. Aside, it is fine if she wants to ensure that he has a pencil in his hand, and if she asks him to write, and if she touches the paper in order to further direct him to write, and even if she directs him back to his chair if he gets up from it, but she should not be verbally involved at any time; and care should be taken by observers in order to ensure that she is not pointing to anything in particular, such as particular keyboard keys, and particular words that may be pre-written on the paper or screen.

In addition to the above apparent purposes of her verbal involvement, there is now proof that she verbally instructs him on what to write. Moreover, as is shown in the above 60 Minutes segment, there is proof that she extensively prepares him on what to write.

12:25: Soma abruptly states, “I can see a point” and gives Tito his pencil; and then he apparently writes, “It can become bigger than the door.” Again, Soma began a process without notifying anyone of it. In this instance, I believe that her stating to Tito “I can see a point,” signifies to him that it is time to write, “It can become bigger than the door.”

Aside, in the various television coverage from 2003 to the present, Tito provides the same brief statements, or variations thereof.

Also aside, autistic author Donna Williams of Australia in 1992, 1994, and 1998 was one of the first people, and perhaps the first person, to provide such statements. All of the statements, which I argue that Soma provides for Tito, are usurped from Williams, both directly, and in slight variations, in order to give the appearance of novelty. Williams is well known for describing what she calls “fragmented vision” and for describing the disintegration of her sensory experience.

17:09 – 17:42, and 21:14 – 21:30: Tito is shown in the process of writing, and Soma is shown speaking to him at times.

25:17: Soma interrupts Dr. Eric Courchesne, and begins to read from the piece of paper; and Tito is now several feet away. Since Tito was away from the paper, there was no need for Soma to interrupt Eric. She reads from the paper, “That it will lead to the better kinds of treatment.” As was reported by 60 Minutes in 2003, Tito does not write on his own accord:

He cannot pick up the pad and pencil to write without his mother’s constant prodding and urging.

It is clear that Soma initiated his writing of that statement, and either verbally guided him while the camera was filming elsewhere, or stimulated Tito in some way to produce a statement that he was previously prepared to write. Aside, and as is especially shown in the below PBS video of 14 years later, it clearly appears that there are words which, when spoken to Tito, stimulate his memory of previously taught statements: As is the case when Kuhn and Iversen asked Tito

23 See (Williams, 1992; 1994; 1998).
24 See (Mabrey, 2003).
questions, he clearly appears to respond to a particular word, and begins typing or writing after hearing the word, despite that the question has not been fully expressed, and despite that the sense of the question has therefore not even partially been conveyed. I believe that Soma has taught him that certain words should be followed with certain written/typed statements; and this would explain why it is not necessary for him to listen to the entire question, and instead only approximately half of it; and in the below video, he sometimes begins typing after hearing only 1-2 words of a question.

PBS, 2017\textsuperscript{25}

0:02: The interviewer asks Tito a question. At 0:09, just after he begins typing (he types 4 letters), shown at the top of his computer screen is a pre-typed statement, namely, “about my sensory perception.” I also believe that the first word of his own statement below it, namely, “My,” was pre-typed, since it was present despite that he had typed only 4 letters, namely, “sens.” Clearly the pre-typed statement is there as a cue to Tito for what he should type: He clearly is taught to identify the appearance of the above phrase as meaning that he should proceed with X answer, which he typed from the extensive preparatory instruction that Soma provided to him.

0:59: The interviewer begins to ask him a question, namely, “Is there one sense that is more powerful than others?”; and when the interviewer reaches “sense,” Tito lowers his arms and hands and begins typing. I believe the word “sense” cued him to write a prepared answer: An answer that Soma previously taught him to write.

1:27: Tito is shown typing, he then briefly hesitates, the interviewer asks, “What does sensory overload feel like to you?”, he continues to type after she says “like” and does 3 key-strikes. Soma then reads an approximate 28 word statement from the screen. While it is likely that there was a break in the filming at the time (1:36) when Soma picked up the computer to read the screen, it is still apparent that Tito was writing his answer even prior to the question being asked; and this was likely because there was a cue-topic at the top of the screen, written by Soma, which Tito was already instructed on how to answer.

2:17: The interviewer asks Tito, “What helps calm your sensory system?” At 2:21, it appears that a portion of the filming was excised, and that it resumes from a slightly different angle. Tito likely had hesitated to respond.

Disabilities Studies Quarterly, 2010\textsuperscript{26}

Tito’s responses in the email-interview with Professor Ralph Savarese are in diametric contrast to the statements of his during the above television interviews. In the television interviews, Tito’s responses are entirely of the nature of soliloquy or monologue, whereas in his email interview with Savarese, his responses are entirely of the nature of dialogue. I believe that this further demonstrates that Tito’s in-person written communication is the result of Soma’s aforementioned interventional conduct, and that Soma is who emailed with Savarese. For example:

T.M. Who knows from where I learnt it? But one thing is for sure: I was exposed to poems very early on in my life. Mother recites, and used to recite, poems in Bengali,

\textsuperscript{25} See (PBS, 2017).
\textsuperscript{26} See (Savarese, 2010).
Hindi and English languages. I by-hearted most of them because I appreciated the sound pattern. Maybe I felt that my words would sound something like that. Or maybe I did it unintentionally without any kind of care. But you noticed it and asked me because you appreciated it. Thank you.

T.M. In one of my yet to be published works (in fact, it is a book about my social experiments), there is a character who is a flying, invisible kangaroo that never looks straight, only cross-eyed. When they did the interview on CNN, I was writing this piece. The whole world looked like a field to me as would be seen through the eyes of that flying, invisible kangaroo that never looks straight, only cross-eyed. The kangaroo could separate this from that – the specifics from general, the colors from shapes, properties from labels – and giggle at all the confusion that could happen after that!

T.M. I have described it in my book *How Can I Talk if My Lips Don't Move?* However, since you ask it again, I may say this about my processing – it may make me disassociate myself from the totality of the situation and select one aspect of it. After that, I may be completely within a labyrinth with my overindulgence or overassociation in that single aspect of the environment that has multiple aspects, making me ignore the other parts of the situation. Does it link to poetry? I do not know.

**Conclusion**

At 5:17 – 5:24, the following is stated in the aforementioned 60 Minutes presentation.

> If Tito is a miracle of autism, the miracle worker is his mother Soma ...

27

The statement continues with,

> “... Soma, who gave up a career in chemistry to devote her life to teaching her son – even though doctors in India said he would never be able to learn.”

Soma desires to publicly portray Tito as a miracle, and to publicly portray herself as a miracle worker; and in order to accomplish this, she engages in, and continues to engage in, the novel, highly surreptitious, multifaceted, communicative fraud that I revealed, and which has evaded the tens of millions and perhaps hundreds of millions of viewers of them over the last approximate twenty-one years, including the vast array of scientists, physicians, other clinicians, journalists, autism organization leaders, etc., who studied them. 28 In so doing, Soma, with regard to Tito, engages in Factitious Heroism By Proxy, as she, via her fraud, portrays him as accomplishing something (that is, as being a “miracle”) in order that he is admired by other people, and in order that she encounters immense conceptual gratification and emotional gratification. Moreover, Soma engages in Factitious Heroism, as she portrays herself as being the hero (that is, the “miracle worker”) of the accomplishment that she presents Tito as having accomplished.

A corollary to the above Factitious Disorders is the following, as the aforementioned Dr. Feldman states:

27 See (Mabrey, 2003).
28 See (Merzenich, et al., 2008).
(...)

false heroes accept their ill-garnered accolades, often with mock humility.”

In the 2007 New York Times review of the aforementioned Iversen’s book, Strange Son: Two Mothers, Two Sons, and the Quest to Unlock the Hidden World of Autism (about which the two mothers are Iversen and Soma, and the two sons are Iversen’s son Dov, and Tito), a quote from Iversen’s book where she quotes Tito is provided.

“Men and women are puzzled by everything I do,” Tito wrote. “My parents and those who love me are embarrassed and worried. Doctors use different terminologies to describe me. I just wonder.”

This is what I refer to as “mock humility by proxy”: Tito is not engaging in mock humility, but rather Soma is, via her communicative fraud with Tito, whether she is engaging in interactive communicative fraud with him, or writing for him.

In 2003 on Good Morning America, during an episode of Dr. Tim Johnson’s presentations, Johnson states the following:

Tito’s poetry caught the attention of world-renowned autism experts, who wanted to study him. The boy was one of the few people with autism able to describe his inner experience.

Johnson then invokes Merzenich:

Merzenich says Soma and Mukhopadhyay’s efforts should be examined closely by the medical world. “So we need to look at the strategy more widely and determine whether or not it is a valid strategy for a large number of children,” Merzenich said. “That’s still unresolved. But the initial observations are extremely hopeful.”

Johnson then quotes Merzenich:

“There might be thousands of children like Tito, and one of our challenges is to determine whether anything can be done about that and whether there are more children that can be in a sense awakened like Tito,” Merzenich said.

In light of how Tito began to be publicly presented at eleven years old, and Carly Fleischmann, about whom I have presented this article, at thirteen years old, and in light of the apparent absence of publicly presented employments of Facilitated Communication and the Rapid Prompting Method to children of, for example, three to eight years old, the following issue arises: Before children of eleven years old and beyond are capable of verbally communicating, and type-communicating and write-communicating, at the levels that they do, they of course must under a multitude of years of formative communicative-

29 See (Feldman, 2018: 100).
30 See (Iversen, 2007: 142).
31 See (Zuger, 2007: 4th paragraph).
32 See (Johnson, 2003: 19th, 32nd, 18th paragraphs respectively).
33 See (Howitt, 2021, forthcoming).
education, such as gradually learning the alphabet, simple words, complex words, spelling, grammar, combinations of words, the construction of sentences, etc., and how to understand the verbal expression of language that are expressed them, and how to verbally express language to others. As is conveyed in the various public presentations of Tito and Soma, and Carly, they are characterized as children who, despite not undergoing any of this formative education, in any formal context, due to being incapable of doing so, were able to do so entirely autonomously, in their own informal context, and with no practical demonstrations that they were doing so, and that the employments of Facilitated Communication and the Rapid Prompting Method with them simply allowed them, at eleven years old and thirteen years old, to educe the capacities that they already had. That is, they are characterized as always having had highly elaborate, communicative minds, and as having developed their minds on their own accord (that is, without the assistance of anyone, nor any methods), and that the novel communicative methods are simply the conduits that allowed for the educing of their minds, which previously remained entirely quiescent.

This, however, is surely another facet of the system of fraud of the clinicians of the methods. There, of course, was no early-childhood education of the profoundly autistic children that is even minimally consistent with the later, abruptly presented, advanced verbal-comprehension, and advanced written-communication, of them at approximately eleven years old and older. Moreover, attributing the acquisition of this education to the profoundly autistic children themselves results in the proliferation of the now proven, staggeringly inaccurate conception of such persons as having normal to advanced minds, which were, moreover, previously simply quiescent: Not only are such persons, despite their florid, extreme, practical symptomology, inaccurately conceived of as being normal to advanced, but they are inaccurately conceived of as having undergone early childhood education and development completely autonomously, despite the absence of any practical indications that they were doing so from the onset of their autism (that is, before three years old), to their later presentations of their supposed, typical to advanced verbal-comprehension and written-communication.

Regarding the nature of the fraud: As I discussed previously, this kind of fraud is by-proxy in nature, which means, as is the case of Munchausen By Proxy, that the perpetrators typically ardently publicly express that they have not engaged in harmful conduct and fraudulent conduct. Surely, at a particular level of their minds, they not only know what they are doing, but that they are deriving significant gratification from what they are doing; but at another level of their minds – such as when their minds operate socially – they clearly disassociate from their memory of what they have done, their knowledge of what they have done, their knowledge that they have derived gratification from what they have done, and the gratification that they have derived. As such, it would not be accurate to conceive of the perpetrators as being normal (or typical) persons who elect to engage in such fraud. Rather, they, despite their typically highly socially facile capacities, and humanism – their affability, devotion to their clients, concern about autism, pride in what they have accomplished, and pride in their clients – are direly mentally ill. However, in the case of Factitious Heroism By Proxy, unlike what is the case of the grave Munchausen By Proxy, the subjects of their by-proxy conduct at least do not appear to be physically nor psychologically harmed. However, I will speculate that the pre-public training that is likely necessary in order to succeed in

---

34 See (Center for Disease Control and Prevention, 2021).
35 See (Feldman, 2018; Feldman, 2004).
having the autistic persons do what they do in public may be extraordinarily arduous, and akin to the brutal training of circus animals.36

Elephants, tigers, and other animals that circuses use to entertain audiences do not stand on their heads, jump through hoops, or balance on pedestals because they want to. They perform these and other difficult tricks because they’re afraid of what will happen if they do not.

In case the autistic persons are not subject to brutal physical treatment, I would speculate that, at a minimum, they are subject to training that is of such extraordinary repetition that it is of neurological and psychological brutality.

The following is the title of one of the aforementioned seven books that Soma claims were written by Tito, and which he is listed as the author of: The Mind Tree: A Miraculous Child Breaks the Silence of Autism.37 Soma surely titles the book in this way due to her perpetual desire for Tito to be conceived of as “miraculous,” and for her as “the miracle worker.”

References


36 See (People For The Ethical Treatment of Animals, 2021).


Terrill, C. (2000) Tito’s Story. Available online: www.genome.ch.bbc.co.uk/de5d2fc1ae9b4294a7abc1d6225820b5. BBC.


State-Religion Relationships in Ukraine during the Covid-19 Pandemic: Specific and Particular Features

Yevhen Kharkovshchenko

Doctor of Philosophical Sciences, Head of Department of Religious studies,
Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv (Kyiv, Ukraine)
E-mail: sacerdoc@ukr.net
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8241-1625

Vitalii Turenko

Candidate of Philosophical Sciences, Researcher,
Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv (Kyiv, Ukraine)
E-mail: vitali_turenko@ukr.net
https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0572-9119


This paper presents the particular functioning of state-religion relationships in Ukraine during the coronavirus pandemic. Our research proved that the Ukrainian government has developed two strategies – a restrictive strategy and a partner strategy – in dealing with religious organisations in this crisis. Restrictions were aimed at reducing coronavirus cases in the country. The partnership was created to provide mutual aid in treating the infected citizens of Ukraine. The authors have also proved that religious organisations in Ukraine found themselves in a difficult situation – between the threat of their total discontinuation and the challenges of possible transformation of their activity. Therefore, a partial limitation of church service attendance has been introduced, focusing on the fact that a religious organisation cannot waive church services since that would contradict its nature and mission. The authors have concluded that further harmonious interaction of government authorities and religious organisations in Ukraine in COVID-19 conditions depends on numerous factors: the epidemiologic situation, government decisions on the functioning of various social institutions, religious institutions in particular, and support by religious leaders of government initiatives on preventing the public spread of the disease.

Keywords: relationships between the state and religions, COVID-19, religious organisation in Ukraine, Orthodox Church of Ukraine (OCU), Ukrainian Orthodox Church (UOC), Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church (UGCC), religious security

© Kharkovshchenko, Yevhen, 2021
© Turenko, Vitalii, 2021
Introduction

The coronavirus pandemic that seized the world in 2020 provoked various challenges for all countries, including Ukraine. These challenges concern different aspects of social life, particularly religious organisations. Religious institutions in Ukraine have met this challenge in different ways and have therefore functioned in conformity with their beliefs. At the same time, this situation has changed the relationships between the state authorities and religious organisations. Thus, to analyse the interaction of the Ukrainian state authorities and religious institutions during the COVID-19 pandemic, it is particularly important to reveal possible differences compared to the experience of such interaction in other countries and regions of the world.

The practical importance is to highlight the significant role of religious organisations and communities in saving people’s lives and reducing COVID-19 cases. Religious organisations were one of the main sources of support, control and direct medical aid and social servicing for their communities. Religious leaders shared information on the importance of public healthcare to protect the members of their own and other communities. In addition, they provided pastoral and spiritual support in emergencies related to public healthcare and other health challenges, protecting the needs of vulnerable populations (Tokman 2020b).

The theoretical base of this article is the scientific papers of foreign (G. Ignatowski and L. Sulkowski, R. Lunkin) and Ukrainian (P. Kraliuk, V. Tokman, L. Vyhovskyi) scholars, among others, who investigated certain aspects of the research problem. Of particular importance were sociological studies, recommendations of international organisations and the Ministry of Culture and Information Policy of Ukraine, analytical materials developed by the National Institute for Strategic Studies, and the Ukrainian Centre for Economic and Political Studies named after Olexander Razumkov. However, there is still no complex religious analysis of particular features of state-religion relationships during the coronavirus pandemic in Ukraine. The authors’ previous scientific papers also became an important base for the research. In particular, some of our scientific studies (Rudenko et al., 2020; Kharkovshchenko et al., 2020; Rudenko & Turenko, 2020) have investigated religious, cultural, methodological, social and political aspects that proved important in preparing this paper.

The research goal was to study specific features and characteristics of state-denomination relationships in Ukraine at the time of the coronavirus pandemic. The previous model of interaction of the government and denominations could no longer function in such crisis conditions. Due to the high degree of uncertainty peculiar of any social cataclysm, insufficient development, a lack of decision-making models and a deficiency of related information bases, it is especially important to reinterpret and understand the should-be attitude of the state towards religion and the attitude of religion to the state.

To achieve the goal of this article, we have used the following general scientific and special methods of research for processes and phenomena: the comparative method, the sociological polling method, interdisciplinarity and principles of academic studies on religion, – objectivity, non-confessionalism, ideological pluralism, and neutrality in religious issues.
The two-vector strategy of state power of Ukraine concerning religious organisations

The limitations introduced by various countries due to the spread of the COVID-19 pandemic have also influenced the activity of Churches. These restrictions aim to prevent public gatherings that are a direct consequence of cult practices of religious organisations. They include church services, prayer meetings, celebrations, funerals, rituals, etc.

In Ukraine, we observe quite indistinct government instructions limiting the activity of religious organisations. The Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No 211 of March 11, 2020, “On preventing the spread of acute respiratory disease COVID-19 caused by coronavirus SARS-CoV2”, has been changed several times. In the original version of the subordinate act, public gatherings of over ten participants were prohibited, including gatherings of religious organisations. On April 2, 2020, the government changed this wording and underlined that all public gatherings, including religious gatherings, must be banned. At the same time, the official website of the Cabinet of Ministers stated that churches would not be closed. Such a general statute resulted in much obfuscation and numerous interpretations of limited religious freedom. For example, experts from the Institute of Religious Freedom stated that only public gatherings were limited, not mentioning other religious events, including home meetings, social aid for the disadvantaged, and other private forms of expression of religious beliefs (Explanation of IRF, 2020).

It should be noted that such uncertainty about the functioning of religious organisations in pandemic conditions was observed not only in Ukraine but in many other countries as well, which resulted in large numbers of believers attending the church services of certain religious organisations, as seen in both Europe and Asia (for instance, India).

Such vagueness was revealed in a public opinion poll in Ukraine concerning government actions towards religious organisations (See Fig. 1 below) (Razumkov-centre, 2020).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Which of the following statements do you agree with most?</th>
<th>% respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>During the coronavirus pandemic, churches and preaching houses should work only with limitations and strict observance of all sanitary rules</td>
<td>45,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Churches and preaching houses must not be opened during the coronavirus pandemic as it is dangerous</td>
<td>36,1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Churches and preaching houses should be opened during the coronavirus pandemic to enable people to pray for their health and the health of their relatives</td>
<td>11,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is difficult to answer</td>
<td>7,1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2020
Regions of Ukraine

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>West</th>
<th>Centre</th>
<th>South</th>
<th>East</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>During the coronavirus pandemic, churches</td>
<td>59.9</td>
<td>50.5</td>
<td>27.9</td>
<td>31.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and preaching houses should work only</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with limitations and strict observance of</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>all sanitary rules</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Churches and preaching houses should not</td>
<td>20.7</td>
<td>29.1</td>
<td>62.9</td>
<td>48.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be opened during the coronavirus pandemic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>as it is dangerous</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Churches and preaching houses should be</td>
<td>15.2</td>
<td>11.8</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>12.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>opened during the coronavirus pandemic to</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>enable people to pray for their health and</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the health of their relatives</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is difficult to answer</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As we can see, nationwide, most of the respondents were inclined to agree with the opening of places of worship, as long as people wore protective masks and practised social distancing. At the same time, it should be noted that the people of the south and east of Ukraine were more careful regionally, while the people in the west and centre supported a more liberal attitude to the functioning of religious organisations.

As stated by V. Tokman, “many (clergymen, believers, ordinary citizens) were interested in the following issue: what exactly can be practised in churches and preaching houses during cult and ritual events? As there was no official response, leaders of churches and confessions used certain government statements, current legislation on sanitary norms, and foreign countries’ experience. They started developing methodical recommendations on believers’ quarantine behaviour. The implementation of the government’s decision on quarantine restrictions by representatives of state and local authorities in the regions proved to be a real problem for the Churches” (Tokman 2020a).

Due to the lack of unambiguous interpretation of Resolution No 211, some churches were closed. As a result, not long before Easter, the All-Ukrainian Council of Churches and Religious Organisations (AUCCRO) addressed Denys Shmyhal, the Prime Minister of Ukraine, and the Ministry of Internal Affairs of Ukraine with their own propositions on providing the constitutional right of religious freedom during a lockdown. The AUCCRO also called on the government to interpret Resolution 211 and to instruct local police and power authorities to prevent misunderstanding and chaos during the Easter celebrations.

One should also note that the Orthodox Church of Ukraine, the Ukrainian Greek-Catholic Church, and the Roman Catholic Church in Ukraine demonstrated a high level of discipline in quarantine conditions in keeping with the recommendations of the Ukraine Ecumenical Patriarchate and the Vatican. Therefore, considering the constructive response of most religious organisations to the restrictive lockdown steps of the Ukrainian power authorities, after the lockdown, the Ministry of Culture and the Information Policy of Ukraine proposed the following algorithm for the step-by-step resumption of systematic and full-value work of religious organisations.

1. The opening of churches to believers for visiting and private preaching (but not during the traditional services given by clergymen, i.e., without believers and with
no more than ten persons present), in keeping with all quarantine behaviour rules for public places (in particular, observing the norm of one person per 10 sq. m inside the church) can be possible when, within ten consecutive days, the percentage of confirmed coronavirus cases among tested people decreases daily, and the daily number of people who have recovered is stable or increasing.

2. Church services with a limited number of believers in the church (preaching house), in keeping with all quarantine rules, in particular with individual protective means and physical distance between the people present, can be possible when, within ten consecutive days, the number of daily new unrelated COVID-19 cases is fewer than five per region.

3. Holding ordinary church services with a large number of believers in traditional ritual and cultic events, such as mass communion, when clergymen and believers keep to the personal hygiene norms, in particular with the use of personal protective means, can be possible if the official records in Ukraine state only rare COVID-19 cases solely due to imported disease cases” (MKIP 2020).

As V. Tokman stated, by implementing these steps, the state does not see religious organisations as a means of spreading the pandemic but rather an ally in fighting the pandemic. Following on from this, Ukrainian scientists set the following recommendations for key central power authorities responsible for dealing with religious institutions.

“1. To the State Service of Ukraine on Ethnic Policy and Freedom of Conscience: – to elaborate and submit to the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine the initiatives on developing a partnership model of state-confession relationships at legislative and regulatory levels;
   – to complete the draft of the concept of state-confession relationships in Ukraine with its further adoption as a law.

2. To the Commission of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine on humanitarian and information policy:
   – to provide for the parliamentary consideration of the draft law on military chaplain service by the end of 2020.

3. To central and local authorities:
   – to closely engage religious organisations in the realisation of programs, conceptions, and projects concerning human development;
   – to involve the religious network of various confessions interested in carrying out awareness-raising work regarding the spread and prevention of the coronavirus infection” (Tokman 2020b).

Such recommendations were made because the central power authorities saw that religious organisations were highly active in controlling the spread of the coronavirus infection. In the first days of quarantine, Ukraine’s largest churches (UGCC, OCU, UOC) went public with a statement that they were fully ready to help the state prevent the spread of the pandemic.

Thus, one can conclude that the state authorities demonstrated a bivectoral attitude regarding the functioning of religious institutions. On the one hand, the state introduced several church service limitations, but on the other hand, the central power and confession leaders interacted to help infected people and to prevent mass infection and deaths of the Ukrainian people. So, the Ukrainian government took an adaptable approach to the functioning of religious organisations, depending on the pandemic dynamics during a certain period.
Religious organisations in Ukraine during pandemics: threat vs. challenge

Western scientists L. Sulkowski and G. Ignatowski state that “any pandemic disorganises social life. One of the manifestations of social activity is religious life. Regardless of increasing secularisation, religion, churches and confession associations influence individual ethical choices and business decisions... Decisions taken by clergymen, irrespective of their personal views, were the result of ecclesiology and traditions. With the change in the organisation of church life, churches contacted believers in various ways, using modern technology and access to public mass media. Though churches do not change their doctrinal positions, they declare various forms of interaction” (Sulkowski & Ignatowski, 2020).

Concerning global experience, we can observe two approaches to solving this problem under total or partial lockdown:

a) total rejection of any public meetings, including church services;
b) partial restriction of church service attendance, emphasising that churches cannot completely refuse services as it contradicts their nature and mission (Lunkin 2020).

Most religious organisations have chosen the second strategy. This has been confirmed by the believers’ poll (Razumkov Centre, 2020) and recommendations of the All-Ukrainian Council of Churches and Religious Organisations given as a response to the introduction of quarantine in Ukraine from March 12, 2020 to April 3, 2020 to prevent the spread of the coronavirus:

a) to treat with respect and personal responsibility the measures taken by the power authorities to prevent the spread of this viral disease, its localisation, and quick recovery of infected people;
b) to avoid extremes: not to give way to panic but not to ignore the danger;
c) to treat oneself and others with responsibility if one has symptoms of an acute respiratory disease or he/she has recently come back from a country with high coronavirus prevalence. This includes staying home for at least two weeks (coronavirus incubation period), avoiding places with large numbers of people, and seeking medical advice;
d) to adhere to expert recommendations on current special hygiene rules;
e) to demonstrate love, understanding, tolerance, sympathy and assistance to those fighting the disease [See Fig. 2 below] (Razumkov Centre, 2020):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Did you visit a church (preaching house) under strict quarantine in March-May 2020?</th>
<th>% of respondents who attended religious services and meetings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes, I attended as often before quarantine</td>
<td>6,7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes, I attended, but not so often</td>
<td>25, 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, I did not attend</td>
<td>67,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did not respond</td>
<td>0,2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

2020
The survey results have demonstrated that under strict quarantine in March-May 2020, most respondents (68%) did not attend church or a preaching house (61% of citizens in the west and 77% of citizens in the south and east); another 26% of respondents reduced the frequency of their attendance, and only 7% of respondents disregarded the quarantine (from 11% of UOC believers to 3% of UGCC believers).

1. In general, the relative majority (45%) of citizens was sure that during the pandemic, churches and preaching houses should remain open but in keeping with all sanitary rules (from 60% of citizens in the west to 28% of citizens in the south; from 67% of UGCC believers to 37% of “ordinary Christians”).

2. 36% of respondents were sure that during the pandemic, churches and preaching houses should not open due to danger (from 63% of citizens in the south to 21% of citizens in the west; from 47% “ordinary Christians” to 17% of UGCC believers).

3. Only 12% of respondents spoke against any restrictions in the functioning of churches and preaching houses (from 15% of citizens in the west to 4% citizens in the south; from 19% of UOC believers to 6% of “ordinary Christians”).

To keep quarantine restrictions from preventing the observance of the principle of religious freedom and realisation of believers’ needs, religious services were streamed on the Internet.

---

**Regions of Ukraine**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>West</th>
<th>Centre</th>
<th>South</th>
<th>East</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes, I attended as often as before quarantine</td>
<td>7,9</td>
<td>5,3</td>
<td>5,1</td>
<td>7,7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes, I attended, but much more seldom</td>
<td>30,6</td>
<td>26,7</td>
<td>17,9</td>
<td>15,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, I did not attend</td>
<td>61,2</td>
<td>67,8</td>
<td>76,9</td>
<td>76,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did not respond</td>
<td>0,5</td>
<td>0,3</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CONFESSION AFFILIATION**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Confession Affiliation</th>
<th>OCU</th>
<th>UOC</th>
<th>People who confess themselves Orthodox</th>
<th>UGCC</th>
<th>People who confess themselves as Christians</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes, I attended as often as before quarantine</td>
<td>8,2</td>
<td>11,1</td>
<td>3,9</td>
<td>2,6</td>
<td>5,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes, I attended, but much more seldom</td>
<td>20,9</td>
<td>35,3</td>
<td>18,2</td>
<td>35,6</td>
<td>9,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, I did not attend</td>
<td>70,9</td>
<td>53,2</td>
<td>77,3</td>
<td>61,8</td>
<td>85,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did not respond</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,5</td>
<td>0,5</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The survey results have demonstrated that under strict quarantine in March-May 2020, most respondents (68%) did not attend church or a preaching house (61% of citizens in the west and 77% of citizens in the south and east); another 26% of respondents reduced the frequency of their attendance, and only 7% of respondents disregarded the quarantine (from 11% of UOC believers to 3% of UGCC believers).

1. In general, the relative majority (45%) of citizens was sure that during the pandemic, churches and preaching houses should remain open but in keeping with all sanitary rules (from 60% of citizens in the west to 28% of citizens in the south; from 67% of UGCC believers to 37% of “ordinary Christians”).

2. 36% of respondents were sure that during the pandemic, churches and preaching houses should not open due to danger (from 63% of citizens in the south to 21% of citizens in the west; from 47% “ordinary Christians” to 17% of UGCC believers).

3. Only 12% of respondents spoke against any restrictions in the functioning of churches and preaching houses (from 15% of citizens in the west to 4% citizens in the south; from 19% of UOC believers to 6% of “ordinary Christians”).

To keep quarantine restrictions from preventing the observance of the principle of religious freedom and realisation of believers’ needs, religious services were streamed on the Internet. The religious services were attended by 13% of respondents (from 39% of citizens in the west...
to 4-5% of citizens in the other regions; from 56% of UGCC believers to 6% of “ordinary Christians” and “ordinary Orthodox Christians”) (Razumkov-centre, 2020).

As the data show, it is no wonder that Orthodox Christians of Ukraine, as the country’s leading creed, have started a discussion of the possible transformation of sacraments. Supporting this point is the opinion of the famous researcher T. Derkach: “The history of the church has largely referred to non-standard, nonlinear situations faced by ancient or medieval believers or bishops. The church has never had quiet periods when it was possible to serve the liturgy, baptise, consecrate and receive communion, being fully confident in the future. The church was not a conveyor of the same rituals on a daily basis. Certain external and internal circumstances have changed – the church has changed service practice and had to refine the teachings of God himself. However, there were situations when it was necessary to take unique decisions quickly. In law, it is called ad hoc – a method of solving a specific problem or task which cannot be used for solving other problems and which cannot fit in the general decision-taking strategy (exception). By the way, the church has had lots of such exceptions but, for one reason or another, they were used as precedents when necessary paid” (Derkach, 2020).

At the same time, the coronavirus pandemic and the progress of powerful science and technology also stimulated the development of potential new forms of participation in the sacraments, including distant, “online” sacraments. Because direct participation can increase the number of COVID-19 cases in a country, the possible transformation of the sacraments can guarantee the safety and health of the country’s citizens (Vyhovskyi, 2020).

However, this issue resulted in a heated discussion, especially after the “Internet Eucharist” held by OCU clergymen Ihor Savva and Dmytro Vaisburd.

After this event, Eustratius (Zorya), the OCU archbishop, published on his Facebook page a series of reflections (statuses). “In his first post, he states that the Eucharist cannot be served distantly, as it is impossible to eat and drink distantly (to my mind, it is a manipulative comparison, as people take the sacrament physically, while what is meant here is distant consecration, but not taking the sacrament itself – D.G.). The second argument is that the form of performing the sacrament cannot be changed, as it was established by Jesus Christ himself. Then archbishop Eustratius states that the logic of online sacrament excludes, if it is not necessary, both the clergyman and the liturgy itself – there are left only God and man. And as God is in man’s soul, it is quite enough just to make mediation. The archbishop also believes that online broadcast is a contemplation of the sacrament, but not participation in it, although the liturgy assumes participation. Here is an obvious challenge Archbishop Eustratius poses to the archpriest Ihor Savva: when does a person actually participate in liturgy – when he/she is physically present in church but cannot hear the Eucharist prayers (but most often does not even imagine they exist)? Or when a person is physically absent from church but can hear and see the virtual performance of the Eucharistic canon?” (Gorevoy, 2020).

Therefore, we can see that the religious studies discourse considers the pandemic as a challenge to the future. It emphasises that such a situation stimulates new conditions and forms of interaction between the state and religious organisations and their followers (Kharkovshchenko et al., 2020).

It is interesting to note that this discussion emerged in the Orthodox community. Even though a number of countries with the most Catholic citizens have come through COVID-19, Catholics did not dwell on different forms of participation in the sacraments. Here we can conclude that what they care about is not religious (in)security, as the number of permanent participants in church services is really small, and it was not their goal to change the form of
sacraments. This especially concerns Ukraine, where Catholics hold the second position in the country’s population, since:

1. On March 17, the Roman Catholic Church (RCC) in Ukraine published an address to bishops on church activity during the pandemic. In addition to recommendations on social distancing and sanitation, the Roman Catholic Church suggested restricting the believers’ participation in church services and thus using as widely as possible all communication channels – radio, television, Internet channels and social networks.

2. On March 24, recommendations were made to the Greek Catholic clergy on how to perform liturgy rituals during quarantine. These included creating an opportunity for people to participate in televised church services via social networks; to worship the shroud of Christ during quarantine by bowing heads to the ground but not by kissing it, and to celebrate Easter only in the open air (Kraliuk et al., 2020).

Unlike the situation in Ukraine, a number of countries and religious traditions experienced insubordination to decisions of power authorities and senior leaders of a certain confession. In particular, mass religious events were held in Pakistan and India and a number of European (in particular, Balkan) countries, including Ukraine. Of course, it is necessary to note the reasons for such insubordination. In India and Pakistan, the reason was the religious beliefs of followers of Hinduism; with Christian believers, the reason was the apocalyptic mood and disbelief in the existence of the epidemic itself (Impact of a pandemic on religion, 2020).

At the same time, epidemics are a threat to the functioning of religious organisations in Ukraine. Therefore, social and political cataclysms push religious organisations to act in different ways, and to develop and implement new models of interaction with believers, representatives of certain religious traditions, and the country’s citizens in general.

The participation of religious organisations in the fight against the spread of the coronavirus has shown that they are not archaic, and they respond to social challenges. For many, mostly Christian believers, the crisis has raised acute awareness of the need to develop new forms of Christian mission and new ways to attract people to the church. In many countries, the pandemic has helped to develop an inter-denominational dialogue. Social changes caused by the coronavirus pandemic have stressed the current problems and have accelerated the existing processes in internal church life.

That is why “the socially important activity of religious organisations during the pandemic proves that religious denominations are an important partner of the state, in particular in crisis conditions, to mobilise various resources and implement humanitarian projects. Intensification of cooperation between the two institutions will determine the state policy vector as to the freedom of consciousness and freedom of religion. This issue was discussed in particular on June 23, 2020 at the meeting of AUCCRO members with O.Tkachenko, the new minister of culture of Ukraine, and O.Bohdan, head of the State Service of Ukraine on Ethnic Policy and Freedom of Conscience. Regarding the current situation, related lines of cooperation should be further developed because of the need for wide humanitarian support of vulnerable groups of citizens” (Tokman, 2020a).
Prospective relationships of Ukrainian power authorities and religious organisations

It should be noted that this article was written during the ongoing coronavirus pandemic, which demonstrates the significance of considering further development of state-church relationships in pandemic conditions. Importantly, considering the experience of the first COVID-19 wave, the World Health Organisation has developed general recommendations on the functioning of religious organisations and their relationships with countries’ leaders.

In particular, these recommendations state the following: “Various global religious and interreligious organisations issued directives, consultancy memoranda and made statements supporting the activity and role of religious leaders of organisations that are based on faith. Many of these religious organisations have made their contributions to these directives due to the well-known fact that COVID-19 is a global pandemic that influences all races, ethnic groups and geographical regions and needs a global reaction. Inter-confessional cooperation of majority and minority faiths is crucially important, in particular, through the exchange of knowledge, resources and advanced practice, where it is possible. (…) When national or local power authorities allow religious meetings, organisations themselves will be able to take their own well-grounded decisions on how many and how often these meetings will be held” (WHO, 2020).

Thus, we can assume that Ukraine will continue developing restrictive strategies (soft or hard, depending on the number of COVID-19 cases) that will enable religious organisations to provide for the safety of the country’s citizens in general and believers in particular. However, one important issue remains: how will leaders of religious organisation respond in the future to the decisions of power authorities concerning the possible introduction of measures to prevent and contain the pandemic (including mass vaccinations, etc.)? Thus, one can suggest that there may be protests by believers against the decisions of power authorities based on religious beliefs, as was observed during the “weekend” quarantine.

At the same time, the key aspects of the discussion around possible online Eucharist (online confession, online christening on the Internet, etc.) are mostly theological or, rather, sacramental. Academic religious studies pose a number of other questions:

- Is it possible to solve the problem of religious (in)security by introducing new forms of sacraments?
- Can online sacraments fully replace the real presence of believers in the church?

Answers to these questions can be the basis for both constructive and destructive dialogues. So, in our view, when introducing innovations in church services, in conformity with recommendations and restrictions imposed by the power authorities, including those concerning participation in sacraments, it is necessary to do it with care, remaining mindful of believers’ consciousness globally and locally. In avoiding health risks, one can face another side of religious insecurity – conflicts and fights between supporters of various views on this issue. Therefore, the main goal is not to introduce new forms of sacraments in the Orthodox Church but protection from potential religious conflicts that can arise, depending on whether a radical decision is adopted or rejected.
Conclusions

Thus, having analysed and defined the specific features of state-religion relationships in Ukraine during the COVID-19 pandemic, we can draw the following conclusions:

1. The government of Ukraine has developed two strategies concerning religious organisations in the current context – a restrictive strategy and a partner strategy. While the restrictive strategy aimed to reduce the increase of COVID-19 cases in the country, the partnership strategy aimed to provide mutual assistance in treating the infected citizens of Ukraine.

2. Religious organisations have found themselves in a difficult situation: they are caught between the threat of their total discontinuation and the problems of possible transformation of their activity. This resulted in the introduction of partial restrictions on church service attendance, focusing on the fact that religious organisations cannot completely waive their activity as it contradicts their nature and mission.

3. The further harmonious interaction of state authorities and religious organisations in Ukraine during the COVID-19 pandemic depends on many factors: the epidemiological situation, state power decisions on the functioning of various special institutions, including religious ones, and support by religious leaders of government initiatives on preventing the spread of the disease among the people of Ukraine.

References

Derkach, Tetyana (2020) Online Eucharist: The End of the World or the Beginning of Theological Discussion? Available online: https://duhovnyfront.com.ua/2020/05/16/onlain-prychastia-kinets-svitu-chy-pochatok-bohoslovskoi-dyskusii


Gorevoy, Dmytro (2020) Is it possible to take Eucharist online? How did the OCU react to this? Available online: https://cerkvarium.org/spetstemy/serkva-i-koronavirus/chimozhlivoprichastya-onlajn-yak-na-tse-vidreaguvali-v-seredovishchchi-pts


MCIP (2020) Recommendations for the steps to be taken by the quarantine authorities. Available online: https://mkip.gov.ua/news/3755.html


Artificial Intelligence Empowers the Integrated Development of Legal Education: Challenges and Responses

Bo Ma

Ph.D. in Law, Professor, Guangdong University of Petrochemical Technology (Maoming, Guangdong, China)
E-mail: gdjasonma@gdupt.edu.cn
https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3121-571X

Yuhuan Hou

Guangdong University of Petrochemical Technology (Maoming, Guangdong, China)
E-mail: 1827366275@qq.com


Artificial intelligence is profoundly changing human social life, and the integration between artificial intelligence and law continues to deepen. Artificial intelligence has brought new impetus for legal education from three dimensions: providing new technologies, establishing new models, and shaping new paradigms. At present, it is still at the exploratory stage on how to position the goal of cultivating versatile professionals of “artificial intelligence + law,” how to improve the competence of teachers, and how to integrate the curriculum system. As one of the important contents of the paradigm transformation of “New Liberal Arts” education, legal education must also upgrade the concept of cultivating professionals, make full use of the support of big data, artificial intelligence, and other new technologies, clarify the goal of cultivating versatile professionals who “have the ability of legal thinking + can use artificial intelligence technology,” bolster the ranks of teachers who not only “understand the technology” but also can “foster a new generation of people with sound values and ethics,” and construct the interdisciplinary, integrated AILE theoretical and practical curriculum systems, for the purpose of responding to the development trend of the transformation of liberal arts education in the new era, and providing intellectual support for cultivating professionals to meet the development needs of the country in the new era.

Keywords: artificial intelligence, technological revolution, legal education, talent training, challenge and response

Projects Supported by the teaching team of the School of Intellectual Property Industry of GDUPT (TDPY201933); Projects Supported by Research Funding of GDUPT (2019BS007).
© Ma, Bo, 2021
© Hou, Yuhuan, 2021
Introduction

In 2017, the State Council of the People’s Republic of China issued the *New Generation Artificial Intelligence Development Plan*, which stated that artificial intelligence has developed rapidly. A set of new features such as deep learning, cross-border integration, human-computer cooperation, group intelligence sharing and free manoeuvre have emerged. The rapid development of artificial intelligence will profoundly change the world and how we live in it. “In 2018, the Ministry of Education of the People’s Republic of China issued the Artificial Intelligence Innovation Action Plan for Institutions of Higher Education, proposing to pay increased attention to the cross-integration of professional education for artificial intelligence (AI) with computer and control science, mathematics, statistics, physics, biology, psychology, sociology, law, and other disciplines, and explore a new training model of “AI + X.” In November 2020, the National Conference on the Construction of New Liberal Arts was held at Shandong University (Weihai City), which released the Declaration on the Construction of New liberal Arts, and launched the construction of new liberal arts in an all-round way. Director Wu Yan of the Ministry of Education proposed that the new liberal arts should be deeply integrated with modern information technology to promote the learning revolution. The construction of new liberal arts must adhere to the “three basic principles,” including keeping to the right path and making innovations, using correct values to lead people’s minds, and taking category-based approaches, and focus on “three key drivers,” including optimizing the disciplines, improving the quality of the courses, and creating new models. Professor Liu Xiaohong, President of Shanghai University of Political Science and Law, believes that the integration between artificial intelligence and law continues to deepen, and the trend of mutual influence and common development between law and technology is also more obvious. The combination of artificial intelligence and the rule of law activities makes legal information and processes digitalized and Internet-based. Thus, new forms of judicial activities such as smart courts, Internet courts, and mobile micro courts have emerged. The development of legal big data analysis and the emergence of legal robots have enabled legislation, justice, law enforcement and legal services to achieve a certain degree of automation and intelligence (Liu Xiaohong, 2020). It can be seen that artificial intelligence will play an extremely important role in how to respond to the new demands of the “new liberal arts” for the integration of science and technology in legal education and to promote the reform of the model of cultivating professionals in legal education.

I. How artificial intelligence empowers legal education

“Empowerment” was originally a term in positive psychology, mainly aiming to give other people positive energy by changing their words and deeds, attitudes, and environment. The “artificial intelligence empowered legal education,” as mentioned in this paper, refers to that artificial intelligence provides a new method, path and possibility for the integrated development of legal education. Artificial intelligence can be defined in both broader and narrower senses. In the narrower sense, artificial intelligence is a branch of computer science, which refers to the science and technology of using the intelligence simulated or realized
by the computer to study how to make machines intelligent. Artificial intelligence refers to a comprehensive discipline that studies and develops theories, methods, technologies, and application systems for simulating, extending, and expanding humans and other animals and developing various machine intelligence and intelligent machines. This paper mainly uses the concept of artificial intelligence at its broader level.

(I) Providing a new technology

The Artificial Intelligence Innovation Action Plan for Institutions of Higher Education proposes that artificial intelligence has characteristics that combine technical and social features, and it is a new driver of economic development and an accelerator of social development. “Big data and artificial intelligence are regarded as the two wheels of pushing for the paradigm shift of humanities and social sciences at the present stage emphasizing the significance of social networks and inter-subjectivity in the revolution of the way of thinking, and taking the measures such as “using technology to check technology” as the realistic countermeasures to the ethical dilemma” (Jia & Ma, 2021: 110). Using artificial intelligence technology can innovate new ways to provide training, revolutionize teaching methods, improve academic administration, and build an intelligent, Internet-based, personalized and lifelong education system, which are important measures for promoting the development of balanced education and educational equity and increasing education quality. In fact, artificial intelligence technology has been widely used in all aspects of higher education and teachings, such as learning management systems, monitoring examinations, grading and evaluation, student information systems, handling official business, library services, enrollment, and mobile applications. In 2018, Carl Benedikt Frey and Michael Osborne, professors of the University of Oxford, published a report, The Future of Employment: How susceptible are jobs to computerization. The report indicated that the computerizable probability of legal secretaries is 98%, the computerizable probability of judges is 40%, and the computerizable probability of paralegals and legal assistants is 94%.

(II) Establishing a new model

Human civilization has gone through the transformation from agricultural civilization to industrial civilization, and then to the current ecological civilization and information civilization. Big data, cloud computing, artificial intelligence, blockchain, and other information technology means have put forward new requirements for legal education. Some scholars have proposed that legal education in the era of artificial intelligence should be transformed from a “streamed training model” to a “personalized training model” in order to adapt to the concept of “new liberal arts” and realize the mutual integration of legal education and the development of artificial intelligence. “The so-called personalized training model in the era of artificial intelligence means that legal education should attach importance to the characteristics and ability needs of law students, constantly combine artificial intelligence with legal education, and restructure law discipline and other disciplines from the knowledge level, to adapt to the new requirements of the development of law in the artificial intelligence era. It can be seen that the era of artificial intelligence emphasizes more on the knowledge, creativity and thinking ability of legal professionals” (Peng, 2020: 20). The book Civilization 2030: The Near Future for Law Firms also notes that in the future, artificial intelligence and robots will dominate the legal practice, and the legal market will no longer be dominated by legal talents, but by “legal talents + big data.”
(III) Shaping a new paradigm

Making full use of information-based intelligent systems such as artificial intelligence may lead to a relatively reduced number of legal practitioners, which has an important impact on the cultivation of legal talents. Due to the widespread application of legal artificial intelligence technology, the demand for legal practitioners has shown a downward trend, which requires legal education to cultivate legal professionals who can adapt to the era of artificial intelligence. In the era of artificial intelligence, it is the goal of law students to build themselves into versatile professionals of “law + artificial intelligence.” High-quality legal professionals must have both excellent legal literacy and proficient artificial intelligence application capabilities. “Law students with such versatile talent will be more and more sought after by employers” (Chen, 2020: 86). Most legal practitioners believe that the original business of legal assistants, such as document production, data retrieval and analysis, typical case handling and consultation, and the production of simple position papers or statements of defense, may be replaced by artificial intelligence in the future. Some scholars note that artificial intelligence is endowing legal education with a new educational paradigm, i.e., AILE coupling model (AI represents Artificial Intelligence, L represents Law, and E represents Education). “As a new education model, AILE coupling model is a paradigm constructed on the basis of the traditional legal education model. It mainly includes four elements: the educational goal of cultivating outstanding legal professionals, the education content focusing on the curriculum construction based on the integrated development of law and artificial intelligence, the systematic education method and the comprehensive evaluation mechanism” (Zou & Li, 2020: 136).

II. Challenges faced by legal professionals training in the era of artificial intelligence

(I) The challenge of unclear positioning of the goal of cultivating professionals

Although the New Generation Artificial Intelligence Development Plan clearly proposes to cultivate versatile professionals of “artificial intelligence + law,” there is still a general lag in legal education in colleges and universities, which is mainly reflected in the training goals, training programs, curriculum systems, teachers and other aspects. “In terms of training goals, almost all law schools and departments in domestic universities maintain the previous overall training goals and have not made necessary adjustments in the era of artificial intelligence, lagging far behind the pace of the development of science and technology in the era” (Zhao, 2020: 153). The Southwest University of Political Science and Law and the Shanghai University of Political Science and Law took the lead in establishing the school of artificial intelligence and law, and carried out a useful attempt to cultivate versatile professionals of “artificial intelligence + law.” The Shanghai University of Political Science and Law proposed to cultivate professionals with applicable expertise and versatile talent in artificial intelligence and law. It has positioned two school-running goals: The first is to cultivate artificial intelligence legal professionals. That is to cultivate the professional who can meet the legal needs of the artificial intelligence era, including those who provide legal services for the legislation, law enforcement, judicial and law-abiding needs of artificial intelligence. The second is to cultivate legal artificial intelligence professionals. That is to cultivate the artificial intelligence professionals with applicable law expertise, including those who can apply artificial intelligence in legislation, law enforcement, justice and law-abiding. However, it is still at the exploratory stage on how to cultivate professionals of “artificial intelligence
Artificial Intelligence Empowers the Integrated Development of Legal Education: Challenges and Responses by Bo Ma and Yuhuan Hou

Future Human Image, Volume 16, 2021

"Having acquired proficiency in law" how to position the goal of cultivating professionals, and how to integrate relevant curriculum systems. Therefore, even though the Ministry of Education has issued the policy on cultivating versatile professionals of “artificial intelligence + law,” the issues like the following ones still need to be further explored and detailed: How to implement the policy? How can versatile professionals acquire the knowledge and skills of law and artificial intelligence? To what extent should the legal professionals cultivated acquire proficiency in the knowledge of big data and artificial intelligence?

1. Having acquired proficiency in law: Having legal thinking and legal application ability.

“Having acquired proficiency in law” requires that the versatile professionals of “artificial intelligence + law” shall first have legal thinking ability and legal application ability. “In the era of artificial intelligence, legal education shall keep up with the pace of the development of science and technology, actively develop legal education theories and methods under the new situation, and cultivate legal talents from the perspective of the combination of law and technology. Legal education shall cultivate students’ legal application ability, big data thinking ability, and computational thinking ability to respond to the new requirements for legal professionals in the artificial intelligence era” (Zhao, 2020: 155). In the era of artificial intelligence, legal issues brought about by technology will emerge one after another. Legal professionals must have superb comprehensive legal capabilities so that they can use legal concepts and legal rules, and comprehensively consider multiple factors such as social conditions, value judgments, and moral customs, and solve new problems such as the subject qualification of artificial intelligence, intellectual property rights, and infringement liability. This also puts forward higher requirements for the teachers who are responsible for cultivating versatile professionals of “artificial intelligence + law.” The main manifestations are as follows: First, a teacher must have acquired proficiency in basic legal concepts and
legal rules. An accurate understanding and interpretation of legal concepts and legal rules is the basis for legal thinking. Second, a teacher must master the current legal knowledge system framework. Third, a teacher must be able to analyze case facts, grasp legal relationships, make legal interpretations, and apply legal rules. Using legal reasoning and following legal logic can solve practical problems. Fourth, a teacher must be able to make value measurements, and rationally judge legal rules.

2. Understanding the technology: Analyze and apply artificial intelligence technology. “Understand the technology” requires that the versatile professionals of “artificial intelligence + law” shall have the ability to apply artificial intelligence technology. This is mainly reflected in the following two aspects: The first is to use artificial intelligence technology to facilitate the construction of intelligent learning environments, which are conducive to solving difficult problems in a legal learning problem. Emerging technologies facilitate the construction of intelligent learning environments, which are integrated with digital classrooms, teaching aids, equipment, learning resources, and communication communities, etc. The exploration of teaching rules through the acquisition and analysis of multimodal data promotes the transformation of educational scientific research from traditional empiricism to data-driven evidence-based research. In addition, for the current legal education practical training courses, artificial intelligence technology can also be fully utilized to assist teaching. “In the teaching of practical training courses, the teacher can use artificial intelligence technology to build a robot teaching system with cloud computing and complete the AR+VR fusion, real-time interaction and 3D tracking of scene cases. Thus, with artificial intelligence technology, the students can clearly understand theoretical knowledge, establish legal thinking, and develop vocational skills” (Zuo & Li, 2019: 16). The second is to apply artificial intelligence technology to facilitate legal practice teaching. The main manifestation is that after the teacher provides the students with certain basic education in artificial intelligence and big data technology, the students can use artificial intelligence technology as the basic tool to proficiently use legal interpretation, value weighing, legal argumentation and other methods to solve the difficult problems of applying the law brought about by various new technologies in the information age. Firstly, according to the needs, the relevant legal issues shall be analyzed, and the mathematical model of the corresponding legal issues shall be established. Based on this mathematical model, the appropriate development tools and programming languages shall be selected, and the complete and orderly instructions shall be designed to solve the legal problem in the way that the computer solves the problem. In this way, the algorithms are used to realize programming, and the programming is applied to the practice of the legal problem, which brings convenience to the legal practice. Secondly, the algorithm model can be used to analyze the massive data generated by laws and regulations, judicial judgment documents, administrative law enforcement documents, enterprise registration information, etc., and the information can be processed, collated and analyzed to obtain the internal logical relationship between events, thus fully grasping the big data panorama. On these grounds, legislators can formulate more scientific legal norms; judges can conduct a more in-depth analysis of cases; and law enforcement officials can formulate more precise risk prevention and control plans.

(III) The challenge of the lack of interdisciplinary integrated curriculum systems of “artificial intelligence + law.”

At present, legal education has formed a legal education system with undergraduate legal education as the starting point and foundation, and with diversified postgraduate education,
but there is still a lack of interdisciplinary integrated curriculum systems of “artificial intelligence + law” in the legal education system and in the model of cultivating professionals. Most of the traditional law curriculum systems do not involve artificial intelligence-related courses such as big data and blockchain, and the field of artificial intelligence does not have a deep enough involvement in the law. Hence, the two fields simply go in their own ways. “At present, courses such as Fundamentals of Python Language Programming and Python Data Analysis and Application are generally offered in all programs, including in the law program, so that the students can master basic data analysis and processing ability. However, for the cultivation of law students, it is still unclear what the specific goals of such courses are, how to teach these courses, and how to combine them with other law courses, so the teaching effect is extremely limited, and they are even considered by the students as a burden. Therefore, in the future, for the purpose of improving the effectiveness of such courses, the teachers should continue to explore how to closely integrate them with the specialty of law to achieve a high degree of integration of artificial intelligence and law, instead of just using them as instrumental courses or commonly required courses” (Zhao, 2020: 156). Obviously, if the legal education cannot be integrated with the overall design and planning of artificial intelligence, it will be difficult to align the curriculum knowledge system between law and artificial intelligence, and in the field of artificial intelligence, it will be difficult to develop intelligent service products to meet the needs of the legal industry.

III. Responses of legal education in the context of the artificial intelligence era

In the era of artificial intelligence, there are a series of problems in the cultivation of versatile professionals of “artificial intelligence + law,” such as the unclear positioning of the goal of cultivating professionals, the inadequacy of teachers strong in both law and artificial intelligence, and the lack of interdisciplinary integrated curriculum systems of “artificial intelligence + law.” In response to the above problems, we make three recommendations for improvement: The first is to clarify the abilities that versatile professionals need to have according to social needs and to set the goal of cultivating professionals that fits the orientation of “artificial intelligence + law.” The second is to train law teachers to improve their artificial intelligence skills and strengthen the workforce of teachers strong in artificial intelligence in legal education, and at the same time integrate artificial intelligence technology into legal education, freeing teachers from tedious technical work. The third is to construct the interdisciplinary integrated AILE theoretical and practical curriculum systems.

(I) Set the goal of cultivating professionals that fits the orientation of “artificial intelligence + law.”

Artificial intelligence technology has a wide range of applicability, which can be used in all aspects of the legal field, bringing great convenience to the society. This requires legal education to cultivate versatile professionals who not only have the ability of legal thinking and legal application, but also have the ability to analyze and use artificial intelligence technology, so that they can adapt to the demands of the new era. Legal education shall clarify the abilities that versatile professionals need to have according to social needs, and based on this, set a scientific goal of cultivating versatile professionals of “artificial intelligence + law.” Otherwise, there could be a “disconnection” between legal professionals who only ask
questions and computer professionals who only design artificial intelligence products. Law is a highly specialized discipline. A computer professional without receiving legal education is unable to correctly express legal issues and understand legal norms, resulting in the inability to deal with difficult and complex legal issues, while a legal professional who does not understand or only has a low-level understanding of artificial intelligence technology cannot use artificial intelligence technology to establish artificial intelligence model which not only conforms to the interpretation of legal provisions, but also can stand the test of legal empirical analysis to resolve practical legal issues. The integration of artificial intelligence technology into legal education can make legal education present the characteristics of intelligence, person-machine collaboration, teaching automation, personalization, and interdisciplinary integration. Big data technology can quantify, analyze and model the learning behaviors and learning processes of students, use statistics, machine learning, data mining and other methods to analyze all the data generated in the process of teaching and learning, and recommend personalized learning resources for them, thus optimizing the learning processes and learning environments of law students, and achieving the personalized development of legal education. Robotics can play the role of a tutor, teaching the conceptual, memorable, repetitive, and simple narrative content of legal knowledge and artificial intelligence technology knowledge. Using artificial intelligence technology, legal education can cover online and offline classes and the learning before, during, and after the class. Students can easily access relevant learning materials anytime and anywhere by turning on their computers or mobile phones, which makes learning more convenient. With the support of artificial intelligence technology, the cultivation of versatile professionals of “artificial intelligence + law” will be greatly accelerated.

(II) Distinguish the “way” and “instrument” for bolstering the ranks of teachers strong in both law and artificial intelligence

Great importance shall be attached to distinguishing the “way” and “instrument” for bolstering the ranks of teachers strong in both law and artificial intelligence. As an ancient saying goes, “What is above forms refers to the way [Tao 道]; what is below forms refers to the instrument [Qi 器].”

The core of the so-called “way” for bolstering the ranks of teachers is to “foster a new generation of people with sound values and ethics.” “Artificial intelligence + education” is not equal to the simple application of intelligent technology in education. Artificial intelligence should be regarded as the endogenous variable of the overall reform of education to promote the transformation from industry-oriented education to intelligent education. As person-machine co-teaching becomes normal in education, the role of teachers will change dramatically. Knowledge-based teaching is mostly undertaken by artificial intelligence, while teachers are mainly responsible for learning design, supervision, encouragement, companionship and emotional communication with students. In the future, artificial intelligence will focus on teaching, while teachers will focus on cultivating the integrity of students. Chinese President Xi Jinping stressed, “Virtue makes a decent man. The foundation of cultivating the integrity of students is to promote their code of ethical conduct. This is the dialectics of talent training. Running a school must respect this law. Otherwise, the school will not run well.” Therefore, the primary task of the teachers strong in both law and artificial intelligence is to cultivate the integrity of students. Artificial intelligence technology is only an auxiliary technology that better achieves the purpose of cultivating the integrity of students, but it cannot replace the teacher’s function of cultivating the integrity of students. “The goal of higher education
is to develop talented personnel with moral cultivation and critical thinking, which actually points to the core value level of higher education. The scope of artificial intelligence in higher education is not unlimited. When artificial intelligence works in the field of higher education, it cannot invade the core value of higher education, let alone hinder the realization of the goal of higher education” (Quan, 2021: 68).

The core of the so-called “instrument” for bolstering the ranks of teachers is to “understand the technology.” With the development of a new generation of artificial intelligence technology, many legal issues have emerged that need to be resolved urgently. How can law and artificial intelligence reinforce each other and develop in a coordinated manner is an important research field rising at home and abroad. In the era of artificial intelligence, it is necessary to improve teachers’ technical competence through such measures as artificial intelligence skills training for law teachers, thereby promoting the effective connection between teachers’ competencies and their work in cultivating versatile professionals of “artificial intelligence + law.” Using artificial intelligence technology can free teachers from tedious work so that they can efficiently complete teaching work with high quality. The era of artificial intelligence puts forward higher requirements for law teachers’ competencies, which requires teachers to play their subjective initiatives and transform from “the role of knowledge indoctrinator” to “the role of quality inspirer.” The authors of this paper believe that in the context of artificial intelligence, law teachers should learn to manage artificial intelligence resources and use artificial intelligence technology, and based on this, analyze and evaluate students’ learning effects, cultivate their logical thinking and rational judgment ability, motivate them to learn various kinds of professional knowledge, and improve their legal practice skills.

It should be noted that the roles and positions, educational concepts, and educational methods of teachers will change due to the development of artificial intelligence technology, but their mission of cultivating the integrity of students will remain unchanged, that is: in legal education, the law teachers shall help students to grow and flourish, and cultivate their core qualities, so that the students can establish the professionalism of resolutely defending fairness and justice and the rule of law, and strictly observe professional ethics and remain clean and honest. Although artificial intelligence is revolutionizing education, the essence of education remains unchanged, and the fundamental purpose of promoting a code of ethical conduct, setting up role models and cultivating talent will not change. Under the impact of artificial intelligence technology, higher education in law shall believe in the law and uphold the rule of law, and cultivate legal professionals strong in both moral integrity and law competence. Therefore, artificial intelligence technology is always only a means of education, not the purpose of education. To promote a code of ethical conduct, to set up role models, and to cultivate talent are the fundamental attributes of legal education.

(III) Construct the interdisciplinary integrated AILE theoretical and practical curriculum systems

The standards for cultivating professionals shall be defined according to social needs, and the curriculum systems for cultivating professionals should be constructed in line with the orientation of “artificial intelligence + law.” “In the context of the gradual maturity of artificial intelligence technology, future legal professional activities will be carried out in the way of person-machine collaboration, and legal practitioners will increasingly use legal artificial intelligence technology. Therefore, on the one hand, legal education shall provide students with courses that introduce basic knowledge of computer algorithms and legal artificial intelligence
technology; on the other hand, legal education shall focus on students’ legal knowledge learning and appropriately expand practical courses” (Zhao, 2020; Peng, 2020: 75). Therefore, some scholars have proposed that in the AILE coupling model, for the interdisciplinary integration of law and artificial intelligence, two major categories of courses should be arranged on the basis of the original law courses, including the interdisciplinary integrated theoretical and application-oriented curriculum systems of law and artificial intelligence.

The first category is the interdisciplinary theoretical courses that integrate law and artificial intelligence. The theoretical curriculum system is the curriculum system designed mainly based on the basic knowledge of artificial intelligence and the perspective of the integration of artificial intelligence and departmental laws, which specifically include the following new courses: the historical origin of law and artificial intelligence, the basic principles and theories of law and artificial intelligence, legal information retrieval, information extraction and text processing, legal regulation of artificial intelligence, application of artificial intelligence law, artificial intelligence and philosophy, artificial intelligence and civil and commercial law, artificial intelligence and criminal law, and artificial intelligence and intellectual property law. "Such courses can build a complete knowledge framework for the in-depth interdisciplinary integration of law and artificial intelligence, eliminate the disciplinary barrier between law and artificial intelligence, and stimulate the enthusiasm of law students to actively study the subjects related to artificial intelligence” (Zou & Li, 2020: 138). It should be noted that the establishment of a theoretical curriculum system that integrates law and artificial intelligence requires full consideration of law students’ actual conditions and the supporting role of the curriculum system for cultivating professionals. At present, the supporting role of the law and artificial intelligence-related theoretical courses by relevant colleges and universities for the graduation requirements of law students remains to be evaluated. “From the practice of some law schools that attach importance to artificial intelligence + law, elective courses, summer camps, video courses and academic lectures are their main forms of exploration in discipline-based law and artificial intelligence. However, how such courses can really help students update their knowledge structure and master the law concerning the development of law and artificial intelligence remains to be evaluated. If the courses of law + artificial intelligence are set only in form, it is just the same old stuff with a new label, like old wine in a new bottle. The relevant courses lack substantive content. For students, there is no essential difference between taking this so-called law + artificial intelligence course or studying the so-called artificial intelligence + law specialty and studying other departmental laws. In October 2019, the Ministry of Education clearly stated that the design and planning of the undergraduate education curriculum system should be based on social development needs and attached importance to the systematic and holistic nature of curriculum construction. Engineering education professional certification also requires that there should be a clear mapping relationship between the graduation requirement index points (capability structure) and the curriculum system structure, and each capability in the graduation requirement index points must be supported by a clear course. Therefore, based on the idea of outcomes-based education (OBE) of professional certification, the setting of professional characteristic courses shall form a scientific matrix relationship with the graduation requirements index points. “In the OBE education system, a matrix relationship between the curriculum system and the graduation requirements index points shall be established to provide a basis for reorganizing and optimizing the curriculum teaching content. Through the corresponding relationship, some repetitive courses can be eliminated, the courses that cannot support the index points can be
eliminated, and the courses with professional characteristics can be opened. In the curriculum setting, the points of knowledge and capabilities shall be gradually increased as far as possible. We believe that for the establishment of a theoretical curriculum system that integrates law and artificial intelligence, it is necessary to comprehensively consider relevant requirements such as the goal of cultivating professionals, graduation requirements, and professional certification, and make a timely assessment on the scientific nature of the course.

The second category is the interdisciplinary application-oriented curriculum system that integrates law and artificial intelligence. In terms of the setting, the application-oriented curriculum system may specifically include modeling law and artificial intelligence, the big data extraction technology of law, application of intelligent legal service system, artificial intelligence judicial assistance operations, and other experimental and practical training courses. The setting of the practical teaching courses shall give priority to the experimental and practical training sessions of the operation of the artificial intelligence judicial assistant system, so that students can develop a deeper understanding of the function, structure, principle and operation of the artificial intelligence judicial assistant system, enhance their adaptability to the use of the artificial intelligence judicial assistant system, and overcome blind exclusion or psychological dependence on artificial intelligence. Some foreign scholars have proposed a syllabus of artificial intelligence + law, which specifically includes the courses on legal norms, legal reasoning, legal argumentation and legal digital document technology. The seminar on artificial intelligence and law not only teaches students valuable courses on legal norms, cases, and arguments, but also introduces them to the models and algorithms for dealing with legal practice in the digital age. The artificial intelligence, legal models and text processing of legal reasoning add value to real-world applications, including electronic mining, visualized legal argumentation, predicting results, making resolution decisions, and legal experts. Such courses focus on the in-depth advancement of artificial intelligence in the legal field, aiming at the professional practice ability requirements for the cultivation of outstanding legal professionals.

**Conclusions**

In order to support Guangdong to become “a forerunner of the country” in the new journey toward fully building a modern socialist China and enhancing the quality of cultivating professionals, Guangdong Province has proposed, “Guangdong Province will, based on the perspective of big liberal arts, promote the cross-disciplinary integration of humanities and social sciences with a new round of scientific and technological revolutions and industrial transformations, and actively cultivate liberal arts talents in the new era.” What is the “new” of the new liberal arts? How to respond to the demand of the “new era” for legal professionals? These are undoubtedly issues that we need to think about seriously. However, “new liberal arts” cannot avoid the inherent influence of new technologies such as big data, cloud computing and artificial intelligence on the paradigm shift of humanities and social sciences. “New liberal arts is a new form of production and reproduction of liberal arts knowledge based on highly integrated, information-based and digital knowledge in the post-industrial era. It is the new model and means of the discipline of liberal arts knowledge. It is worth noting that the new liberal arts are not simply a cross between arts and sciences, between arts and engineering, or between arts and medicine, but a demand-oriented interdisciplinary development framework aiming for the frontiers of science and technology and national strategies” (Quan, 2021: 290). As one of the important contents of the paradigm transformation of new liberal arts...
education, legal education must also upgrade the concept on cultivating professionals, make full use of the support of big data, artificial intelligence, and other new technologies, clarify the goal of cultivating versatile professionals who “have the ability of legal thinking + can use artificial intelligence technology,” bolster the ranks of teachers who not only “understand the technology,” but also can “foster a new generation of people with sound values and ethics,” and construct the interdisciplinary integrated AILE theoretical and practical curriculum systems, for the purpose of responding to the high-quality development trend of the transformation of liberal arts education, and cultivating professionals to meet the development needs of the country in the new era.

References


The Theory of Microhistory in the Scientific Discourse As a Potential Fighting Tool In Hybrid War

Wiktor Możgin

Ph.D. Student, Jagiellonian University in Kraków (Kraków, Poland)
E-mail: wiktormozgin@gmail.com
https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5744-8103

Isabela de Andrade Gama

Ph.D., Pontifical Catholic University of Rio de Janeiro (Rio de Janeiro, Brazil)
E-mail: isabela_a_g@hotmail.com
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0394-2752


The article presents the theory of microhistory, taking into account its development, criticism and importance in the field of scientific research. The authors present an analysis of contemporary discourse in the social sciences and humanities, which consists in indicating the need to use methodologies related to the implementation of research on a specific place, process, object. The role of microhistory is to ask big questions in small places, which allows general conclusions to be drawn through the inductive procedure. The authors inscribed this in the context of the hybrid war into which the Ukrainian state was drawn. The authors confirm that getting to know the theory of microhistory, its thorough analysis, and, above all, its practical use in the scientific discourse, through the implementation of research in small Ukrainian towns, will allow you to learn about authentic social moods. From the perspective of events in the eastern regions of Ukraine, the application of scientific achievements (microhistory) will allow us to learn the actual state of the state taking into account all the smallest details, because this is the main goal of the theory of microhistory.

Keywords: microhistory, future studies, research methodology for civilization development, discourse studies, hybrid warfare.

Received: 2 August 2021 / Accepted: 3 September 2021 / Published: 15 November 2021
Introduction

In the 1970s, a tendency in research on globalization processes appeared in the research discourse. Technological development, including information and transport networks, has contributed to an unprecedented scale of social mobility. Man has been detached from the place where he was born and grew up, the place where his habits, views and values were shaped. However, not only man but his entire environment began to rapidly homogenize and unify. The transnational nature of large corporations and the standards they implement have had a decisive influence on the shape of social interactions and ties between people and a specific place. In this context, the place was increasingly pejorative, especially in the field of research. For these focused primarily on complex structures that were global in nature. It was the words “global,” “international,” “supranational,” “world” that began to dictate the conditions for the development of scientific discourse. Processes related to “global warming,” issues related to the functioning of “international financial institutions,” or issues related to “transnational corporations” are the area of interest of many researchers today.

The departure from the problem of place resulted in the appearance of numerous works on this subject. A classic work in this area is the work by Edward Relpha *Place and Placelessness*, in which the author argues that the homogenization of culture, as well as the development of technology and mass culture, affect the shape of the surrounding environment, making specific places lose their importance, at the same time losing their axiological and semantic values (Relph, 1976: 37-41). Marc Auge, on the other hand, in his work *Non-places. An Introduction to Supermodernity* postulated the theory that non-places are unified products of the capitalist world which, despite their likeness, are independent of the country and region in which they are located (Auge, 1995: 21-24). Manuel Castells also emphasizes the theory about the decline of the importance of place. The author claims that the contemporary globalized world is a space of communication networks, not specific locations. Moreover, as Castells claims, ordinary people still live in specific places, but this fact does not play a significant role in the process of shaping the processes that are decisive for the development of the world (Castells, 2009: 82-84).

However, in the context of a scientific discourse that rejects the meaning of a place, paradoxically, as Maria Lewicka claims, one can notice a completely opposite tendency, consisting in emphasizing the importance of a place. It results directly from the number of publications concerning the place created in recent years. As the professor from the Nicolaus Copernicus University in Toruń points out, since 2000, social sensitivity has grown mainly to specific places (Lewicka, 2012: 20-21). The reason for this is that people “burn out” as a *persona mundi* and slow down their life to the point where they can regenerate. In this regard, Edward S. Casey postulates that the unification of world patterns, which often makes people lose the sense of the uniqueness of a place, causes a longing for the diversification of places, for the diversity that has been lost in the world monoculture, currently based on Western economic and political paradigms. The place contains all the elements that have been eliminated by uniformization: character, identity, tradition, and above all – uniqueness (Casey, 1997: 22-26).

Emphasizing the importance of a place in the scientific discourse directly influenced the better understanding of political, economic, social and cultural processes. The erroneous generalization of these processes and the attribution of features to a specific object, resulting from a wide range of studied objects, was avoided. Inductive drawing of conclusions has become important in this context. The authors of this article put forward the thesis that learning about complex structures should take place in points, because this type of scientific reasoning
allows us to know the actual state of the object or process under study. Focusing on one small place, on one small thing, also makes it possible to get to know the complex context, which is a kind of external envelope. Of course, it is worth emphasizing that this type of reasoning is possible primarily in social sciences, because exact sciences in this area are guided by a completely different logic and methodology.

Therefore, the aim of this article is to analyze the contemporary discourse in the social sciences and humanities, which consists in indicating the need to use methodologies related to a specific place, process, and subject. In this respect, the theory of microhistory is of great importance. Therefore, the authors will focus their attention primarily on the development of this method, its criticism, and its importance in contemporary scientific research. The theory of microhistory directly correlates with the research processes of the place. Therefore, it is important to emphasize this theory in the field of research methodology of social sciences and humanities.

Microhistory is a historiographic practice involving the historical description of small territorial and temporal spaces (Magnússon, 2017: 560). From the perspective of a country like Ukraine, it is an extremely important theory that may contribute to explaining significant political and social processes from the perspective of small towns located mainly in eastern regions. The hybrid war into which Kyiv was drawn into, and it is not worth setting a time census here based on 2014, because Moscow had much earlier influenced the way in which Ukraine operated through various instruments, it is a factor destabilizing the state from within. Due to its linguistic, religious and cultural diversity, Ukraine may seem like an easy target in the context of hybrid rivalry with Russia. Nevertheless, the efforts of the rulers to date still allow the state to be kept under the jurisdiction of Kyiv. However, this is not the main goal of this article. Therefore this issue is only signaled to describe the wider context of the events. Thus, microhistory should not be underestimated by the scientific community. Analyzing the history and fate of simple families will serve to understand the authenticity of the state. This is essential to know the real mood of society. In the future, this will allow conclusions to be drawn regarding the political, economic and social conditions in which most of the inhabitants of Ukraine live, because the Ukrainian state is not only large urban agglomerations, but above all hundreds of small towns, scattered all over the territory, inhabited by ordinary Ukrainian families, struggling with the daily routine and problems.

Therefore, it is worth considering what the theory of microhistory is, what its strengths and weaknesses in the context of other theoretical approaches that shape contemporary scientific discourse.

Development of The Theory of Microhistory

Microhistory as a research practice has its origins in Italy at the turn of the 1970s and 1980s. At that time, two research workers, Carlo Ginzburg and Giovanni Levi, take part in the publication of the series of works *Microhistories* by the left-wing publishing house Einaudi. The context of the Italian state with its age-old political and cultural breakdown was of great importance in the process of developing the theory of microhistory. At that time, there was a need to formulate the methodological and theoretical principles of the so-called “little stories”, which related to the study of the peculiarities and uniqueness of specific places, specific people, or specific phenomena. Microhistory is, in a sense, an extension of local history, at the same time having a more inclusive character.
A classic example of work based on the theory of microhistory is *Il formaggio e i vermi* by Carlo Ginzburg. This work describes the life of a simple miller Domenico Scandelli of Friuli. Nevertheless, this work, in addition to its usual description, is also an excellent analysis of the folk culture and customs of the 16th-century Italian province. Carlo Ginzburg’s assumption was to show real events and the uniqueness of a given community. However, the context of these considerations also referred to the wider political and social situation in the region, which emphasized the inclusive nature of *Il formaggio e i vermi* (Serna & Pons, 2020: 316-318).

The works of Carlo Ginzburg, as well as other representatives of the Italian school of microhistory, constituted a kind of opposition to the then-prevailing trends in interpreting history, such as the structuralist or quantitative approach presented mainly by the Annales community. Italian researchers found it important to include the individual in the general historical context and to consider complex political and social structures from his perspective. This was an attempt to rediscover what would have been missed if classical quantitative methods had been used. The fundamental difference in this approach also consisted in the fact that an attempt was made to deduce a detailed fact from the general fact, and vice versa – the detail was used to argue the construction of a general fact. The aim was to reconstruct the history of the “bottom-up” in strict reference to anthropological research. In the research process, he was against historical determinism, quantitative history, teleological history and the interpretation of society using the key of the class structure (Gregorowicz, 2014).

The precursors of microhistory also attempted to teach history as a discipline. This is mainly due to the way it is defined. Giovanni Levi postulated that microhistory is a kind of historiographic practice, and its idea is not to sacrifice a specific element for generalization, while trying not to abandon abstraction, because individual cases may prove to be key to showing more general phenomena (Lanaro, 2011: 7-8). The representatives of the Italian school of microhistory deny stereotypical thinking about the infallibility of historical research. Carlo Ginzburg, in his works, deals with the issue of the relationship between history and rhetoric, which is a kind of reaction to the linguistic turn that reduces historiography to the dimension of text and narrative research in relation to the document (Serna & Pons, 2020: 321-323). It is therefore worth emphasizing that the Italian school was of considerable importance in the development of the theory of microhistory.

It should not be forgotten that microhistory developed not only on the Apennine Peninsula. In France, this theory was also popular mainly thanks to the representatives of the Annales school – Jacques Le Goffa, Emmanuel Le Roy Ladurie and Georges Duby. In these research works, one can read a clear opposition to the existing paradigms and historical concepts. They referred to the achievements of ethnology, sociology and anthropology, describing the lives of specific individuals and places, while implementing their considerations in a wider social and political context. The representatives of the Annales school also referred to the discourse of Michel Foucault, which was associated with poststructuralism and postmodernism. Moreover, this French philosopher also referred to political historicism, which means that the most credible witnesses of the past are the victims of the dominant power and the forgotten subjects of the historical narrative that is being formed (Vinale, 2018: 679-680). In the context of deliberations on the development of microhistory in France, one cannot ignore the achievements of anthropology presented by Marcel Mauss and Claude Lévi-Strauss. Anthropological research has drawn the attention of historians to the existence of simple structures in the form of small communities located in specific places, emphasizing the uniqueness of these communities with their history, tradition and culture. In the deliberations of Claude Lévi-Strauss, one can find,
for example, issues related to myths – their meaning, reading and constructive role in specific communities (Lévi-Strauss, 2013: 9-11). It is a constant practice of anthropologists to refer to specific, small things and use them to describe more complex things.

Microhistory was also developed in the field of research by German historians. Gustav Droysen, an outstanding German researcher of antiquity, was skeptical about the established theories in history, believing that even the most advanced research allows to capture only a fragment of history. In this regard, he emphasized that it is worth focusing your attention on small things that will help explain reality with all its internal variations. Hans Medick emphasizes, for example, that the main cognitive benefit of a microhistoric approach is the ability to thoroughly examine historical details of a given community and a given area, and in perspective, there is also a perception of the mutual relations between these details, making up the wider whole and context (Medick, 2016: 241-242).

In the United States, on the other hand, microhistory was developed by the outstanding researcher-anthropologist Clifford Geertz, who in his works often referred to the achievements of German historiography, in particular to the works of Max Weber and Martin Heidegger. Clifford Geertz is one of the precursors of the so-called interpretative anthropology, which was a kind of critical response to positivism and structuralism in the ethnography of the 1960s and 1970s. However, due to the fact that his solutions were created in the late 1960s and 1970s, they constitute one of the earliest semiotic and interpretative concepts of culture – a concept parallel to the concepts of ambiguity of meaning and differentiation introduced by Jacques Derrida (Geertz, 2001: 27-28). In addition, Clifford Geertz referred in his considerations to the linguistic phrase, the creator of which was another eminent American philosopher, Richard Rorty. He presented the linguistic turn as a process initiated in the 1960s, which puts language understood as a discourse and a sign and its meaning at the center of reflection on culture or the social world. In this breakthrough, according to Rorty, there are three consecutive turns: the linguistic turn, the interpretative turn and the rhetorical turn. As a consequence of these turns, language, i.e., systems of signs, meanings and symbols, is adopted by the humanities and social sciences as the basic way of understanding social and cultural reality (Koopman, 2011: 78-81). On the other hand, Clifford Geertz, referring to Rorty’s thought, understood the whole notion of culture through language. He argued that each culture constitutes a language with different meanings, that is, a different integrated symbolic system or a signifier system. For culture can be defined directly in relation to systems of meanings that are encoded into symbolic forms and linked together into specific networks of meanings (Geertz, 2017: 27-29). The linguistic turn and interpretive anthropology largely refer to microhistory, primarily using the possibility of explaining complex structures through simple structures.

It follows from the above considerations that microhistory has a rich tradition. Nevertheless, there are criticisms of this discourse in research, resulting mainly from the context of the globalizing world and the need to present conclusions and analyzes on a macro scale. The critique of microhistory appeared almost simultaneously with its entry into the scientific discourse at the turn of the 1970s and 1980s. Therefore, in the next part, it is worth considering two main accusations made by critics of microhistory, which concern the “meticulousness” of microhistory, i.e., focusing on small, even insignificant things, and the inability to examine complex structures by referring to the whole rather than considering its structure from the perspective of the parts it is composed of. The latter objection is a direct reference to the question of research on great international entities, which, in the globalized world, started to play a decisive role in the international arena precisely from the 1970s.
Microhistory, despite its wide application in anthropological, sociological and cultural discourses, met with critical comments, especially from representatives of German historiography. Jürgen Kocka, an outstanding German historian, then chairman of the Wissenschaftszentrum Berlin für Sozialforschung, together with Heinz-Gerhard Haupt in their work *Comparative and Transnational History* presented studies of international comparative history important from the point of view of the development of German historiography. This work was the result of empirical research on social history. These researchers were able to conduct a thorough analysis of comparative history and reflect on its methodological and theoretical assumptions. In their deliberations, however, they referred to the postulate that in the 1980s and 1990s, comparative historical studies encountered methodological obstacles in their development. On the one hand, the problem resulted from the cultural-historical approach, which emphasized micro-history and the construction of cultural transfer. On the other hand, from the concept of global history and transnational approaches that emphasized related history (Haupt & Kocka, 2012: 18-21). In the context of the work of these German historians, microhistory is regarded as a method of “detailed” history that does not allow the examination of broad historical views and processes that went beyond the local nature of the research process. Haupt and Kocka argued that referring to microhistory disturbs the perception of phenomena that had a much wider significance in history than it was presented from the perspective of microhistoric research.

Georg G. Iggers’ *Historiography in the Twentieth Century: From Scientific Objectivity to the Postmodern Challenge* also contains a critique of the microhistoric approach. This author presents the basic assumptions on which historical research was based and how the emerging social sciences, taking into account the period from the early 1950s, have transformed traditional historiography. Like Haupt and Kocka, he points out that in the 1970s and 1980s, postmodern ideas forced a reevaluation of historians’ attitudes towards the object and questioned the very possibility of an objective history. Iggers sees contemporary historiography as a hybrid, departing from the classical, macro-historical approach to microhistory, cultural history and the history of everyday life (Iggers, 2012: 31-35). This hybridization was critically viewed by Iggers because he believed, it introduces a methodological “admixture” from other disciplines into the research process, which is not necessarily good for the advancement of historiographic research.

The critique of microhistory referring to the “meticulousness” of its interest also correlates with another accusation that concerns the examination of complex social and political structures. Microhistory, according to the critics of this theory, does not allow for the explanation of these structures, because it focuses on small things that do not have a major impact on the shape of contemporary scientific discourse. This problem is mainly due to the research on large corporations, international organizations and complex political, economic and military processes that became popular at the turn of the 1980s and 1990s. It was then that the integration processes, which took over, in particular, Central and Eastern Europe, became the object of interest of a wide group of scientists (Levi, 2018: 23-24). European integration along with the adoption of new treaties, the establishment of the Commonwealth of Independent States, international initiatives such as the Weimar Triangle or the Visegrad Group required research on a much larger scale than that proposed by microhistory. Hence, economic and political conditions led to relegating the theory of microhistory to the background (Di Fiore, 2018: 46-
The enthusiasm that was associated with the end of the Cold War rivalry and the change in the balance of power on the international arena towards being placed as the hegemon of the United States fostered the development of historiography aimed at studying great social and political structures. A pragmatic approach has become widespread, which analyzed the political and economic calculations and relations between various actors on the international arena and the resulting balance of power.

It is worth emphasizing that this type of research on large structures required an interdisciplinary approach, which directly referred to the methodological hybridism already mentioned in this article. It follows that the microhistory, which has been accused of using this hybridity, could defend itself against this accusation, but it would fail to prove that it is not a very effective method of studying large structures, such as multinational corporations and organizations, which require a completely different methodology and research tools. The authors of this article deny these allegations, claiming that microhistory, through the use of the inductive method, also allows the study of complex social and political structures. The denial of the criticism presented above is also related to the growing need to consider complex processes in points. What’s more, it also results from the more and more often proclaimed idea of the polycentrization of the world. Therefore, in order to get to know a specific entity in a better way, it is necessary to disassemble the components that constitute its internal structure. This metaphor can be applied to virtually any complex structure in the world – a transnational corporation, an international organization, because learning how to decide within such structures is possible only by learning about their internal diversity.

Conclusions

The theory of microhistory, despite many critical voices, continues to play a significant role in the scientific discourse around the world. The authors of this article emphasize the need to use microhistory in research in the field of humanities and social sciences. Charles Joyner postulated that microhistory is asking very large questions in very small places that allow you to find the essence and get to know the essence that is often hidden in complex structures (Szijártó, et al., 2008). This is an extremely important aspect as it allows you to find authentic and credible facts.

Istvan Szijártó, argues that the application of microhistory to modern scientific discourse has four distinct advantages over traditional macro-oriented social history. First, it is attractive to the general public; second, it is much closer to reality; third, he communicates his personal experiences directly with all the details and issues that make up the outer layer of a specific case; and fourthly, at the center of the research process are people, places, things, the knowledge of which allows drawing broader, more general conclusions (Szijártó, 2002: 211-213). Thus, microhistory is a method that, through inductive reasoning, allows for the formulation of more general conclusions.

In this context, the issue of interdisciplinarity that accompanies microhistory should not be forgotten either. The authors of the article believe that, on the one hand, this is an allegation that criticizes microhistory, but on the other hand, learning the authenticity and uniqueness of the studied object or phenomenon requires the use of various methods and theories, which directly leads to this interdisciplinarity in research. Hence the simple conclusion that considering small things, as dictated by microhistory, and then drawing general conclusions, cannot be devoid of an interdisciplinary aspect. Of course, the issue of interdisciplinarity should be contrasted
with contemporary attempts to “clean up” scientific disciplines so that each of them uses only the methodology and theory assigned to it. The creation of hybrids, referring back to Georg Iggers, is not very welcome in the research process. It does not change the fact that it is still hard to avoid borrowings and the contemporary scientific discourse is full of interdisciplinary research, and microhistory in this context is no exception.

The authors of this article also postulate that microhistory is a method that will be increasingly used by various researchers. This is mainly due to the issue of increasing interest in a specific place signaled in the introduction to this article. The aspect of locality will gain importance in research all over the world. Scientists, in turn, will focus on researching small communities and specific individuals in order to achieve both the maximum depth of past reality and its greater color and naturalness (Magnússon & Szijártó, 2013: 38). Getting to know the authentic social moods and the uniqueness of a particular community will allow you to understand the wider processes in which this community is involved. Community is mentioned in this context, but it is only an example that can be replaced by an aspect of a place or a specific phenomenon. Well, microhistory is an effective tool in the research process to answer broad questions by examining small things. The authors predict that the issue of microhistory will be more and more often taken into account in the scientific discourse, which aims to study simple structures that, through induction, will provide conclusions about more complex structures.

Thus, as it was indicated at the beginning of this article, the theory of microhistory cannot be underestimated by the scientific community, especially in a country such as Ukraine. In the context of a hybrid war in which this country has become entangled, it is necessary to learn about the stories of small ones that will certainly allow to draw significant conclusions. Therefore, the authors of this article emphasize the importance of the theory of microhistory in the contemporary scientific discourse, which, through the implementation of various research activities, may become an effective tool in the process of repairing Ukrainian statehood.

References

Culture as a Priority of Humanitarian Policy

Victoria Omelchenko

Candidate of Sciences in Philosophy (Ph.D. in Philosophy), Assistant Professor, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv (Kyiv, Ukraine)
E-mail: victoria.007.omelchenko@gmail.com
https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7589-7834


The concept of “culture” as a component of humanitarian policy and national security is analyzed. It has been established that “culture” contributes to the establishment of the status of identity in the international arena, as the “social contract” must be formulated in its bosom. Concepts such as: “culture,” “ethnicity,” “people,” “nation” are defined. Such normative acts as: UNESCO resolution “The role of culture in ensuring stability, peace and security: a new international agenda,” the Law of Ukraine “On Culture,” “UN Millennium Declaration,” the concept of humanitarian development of Ukraine (NAS of Ukraine). It has been proven that the sphere of culture is not limited to the exhibition and artistic space, but is an environment of values and ideology, and we must build a culturally marked world of humanitarian policy. This should become our state-building position and a conscious choice. After all, they become nations through blood, the creation of state institutions, and most importantly – culture.

Keywords: culture, humanitarian policy, ethnicity, people, nation, national idea, social contract

Received: 23 August 2021 / Accepted: 1 October 2021 / Published: 15 November 2021

Introduction

Culture is values and norms, human capital and dialogue, the social contract and the country’s success story.

Culture is not a luxury that begins after meeting basic needs. Culture is not limited to such material heritage as museums and exhibition spaces, and culture is a way to preserve the human image and human face. This is second nature, in the language of G. Hegel. Culture is a necessary component of state strategy.

Namely, the sphere of culture is a window of opportunity for a meaningful cultural policy that promotes and affirms the status of identity in the international arena. The sphere of culture, along with the methodological apparatus of philosophy, is an environment for the formulation
of a social contract, a sphere of transformation of meanings into clearly nurtured principles and values, according to which communities live and develop.

The sphere of culture is the foundation of the formation of human personality and an indicator of the development of society. Based on the above values, we believe that the level of development of society depends on the development of culture, in the bosom of which should be formulated social contract.

For example, the field of law is not only a corpus of normative summaries, but is a mirror of all social processes, reflecting the culture of thinking of the community, both its positive aspects and all possible pathologies. Confirmation of this thesis can be found in B. Kistyakivsky (1868-1920), who notes the following: “the existence of law – not in articles or paragraphs of laws, but in the minds of the whole community and its individual members” (Kistyakivsky, 1996: 98). That is why each country has its own legal system, which reflects either a high level of culture of thinking in society or is a denominator of legal nihilism.

For us scientists, it is important to speak the language of facts, to be within conceptual certainty. Accordingly, before moving on to understanding culture as a component of humanitarian security, we must define the concept of “culture.” According to researchers, there are more than 600 definitions and interpretations. Such a wide variety of definitions is explained by the fact that culture extends to almost every humanities discipline. Thus, within the encyclopedic dictionary, culture is considered an interdisciplinary discipline and is defined in such sections of scientific knowledge as cultural anthropology, sociology, social psychology, social sciences, politics and economics (according to the Encyclopedia Britannica). Hence, culture permeates all areas of social life, because it always concerns the norms and values, intelligence and spirituality, the formation of Man (“self-made personality”). Among all the definitions, we bring to your attention the definition proposed at the World Conference on Cultural Policies, held under the auspices of UNESCO (1982). According to which, “culture is a set of characteristic material, spiritual, intellectual and emotional features of society, which includes not only various arts, but also lifestyle, basic rules of human existence, value systems, traditions and beliefs” (Popovych, 1998: 3). Thus, culture covers the spheres of material and spiritual, intellectual principles, science, art and way of life. Culture forms a view of the world, a system of values and beliefs and contributes to the flourishing of the personal beginning of man.

One of the most famous Ukrainian researchers, M. Popovych (1930-2018), the author, Essay on the history of the culture of Ukraine, Red Century, Being human, Philosophy of Freedom, working on the conceptual-categorical apparatus of culture formulated his definition. “Culture is a manifestation of people’s lives, which is expressed in various models of their behavior and means and products of their activities, including ideas, ideals, norms and values” (Popovych, 2009).

Culture is the beliefs and actions that determine the way of thinking and models of interaction with the world, oneself, and others. These are beliefs that create ideals, norms and values that are reproduced in everyday practice. Accordingly, the subject of the theory and history of culture is a “cultural personality,” i.e., a thinking personality who improves in the process of his personal formation. Thus, the semantic certainty of the concept of culture is not limited to its material achievements. Back in 1919, Mykhailo Hrushevsky formulated the question, “who are we and where are we going?” The answer to which acquires full significance in the concept of “national culture” of each country and nation.
On the question of the concept of “nation”

By “nation,” we mean:

a) historically formed community of people, characterized by the presence of a common language, territory, economic life, mental composition;

b) people connected by common origins and historical traditions;

c) a community of people united by illusions about common ancestors and a common “hatred” of neighbors (something like a “collective myth”);

d) there is no nation without a “national idea,” without a “national cultural core,” which consists of two components: “national history” (which sets and determines the idea of the people) and “national history.” The core (cultural and political) is formed at the value level, not the instrumental level;

e) the basis of the “cultural core” is national history and literature, and the “political core” – the idea of a sovereign state and the existence of a “social contract.” The existence of the state (state form) is a key element, and it creates an environment for the formation of community.

Thus, a nation is a community of people of different ethnic origins, united by cultural and political nuclei, who are citizens of their state (within which they acquire rights, freedoms and responsibilities), united by a common national idea, a common social contract. It is a political organization operating in the form of a state united by a “social contract” and a “national idea.” Two important factors of the state are the observance of civil rights and responsibilities and the effective functioning of state institutions.

Analyzing the concept of “nation,” we must get acquainted with the figure of Vyacheslav Lipinsky and his concept of the Ukrainian political nation, based on the territorial principle. The essence of which is set out in the work, Letters to the brothers-farmers. We must unite around the “national idea,” unite around the ideological constant; this idea became the starting point for Vyacheslav Lipinsky (1882-1931), a native of the Polish nobility, a student of Jagiellonian and Geneva universities, Ukrainian historian, sociologist, publicist, an ideologue of the conservative-monarchist direction of socio-political thought, who self-identified as a Ukrainian. In Letters to the Brothers-Farmers (Lipinsky, 1919-1926), the researcher clearly stated the need to create a Ukrainian political nation based on the territorial principle, in contrast to other populist projects, which put forward the primacy of the language criterion.

If we lose statehood, territory, we will inevitably lose language. “The fate of the nation is determined by the leading strata” – the aristocracy, the elite, which is “an active minority, not a passive majority of the state and the nation” (Lipinsky, 1919-1926). The intelligentsia must rationally understand and articulate the subconscious, spontaneous directions that operate in society. And on this basis to formulate a national idea. Without this, it is impossible to form a “nation, “cultural and national integrity.” The main condition for the creation of Ukrainian statehood is unity: religious, regional, political, organizational, national. The reason for the “chronic” loss of Ukrainian statehood is the lack of unity among Ukrainians. Only our own state, built by the Ukrainian nation on its ethnographic territory, will save it from economic collapse and bloody anarchy. No one will build the Ukrainian state himself, and no one will make a nation for us if we do not want to be a nation. Ideology is seen as the driving force of national revival. If we lose the state, the integrity of our borders, we will inevitably lose both language and culture. We may be different in our ethnic origin, but we must be united as a
“nation,” we must be united around a national idea. It is the conscience of the nation. “Nation –
spiritual unity – is always born of the state – territorial and political unity” (Lipinsky, 1928:
65). Nations are divided into non-state and enslaved. Non-state actors are those who do not
have a nation-state as a real embodiment of their independence.

V. Lipynsky was critical of nationalism, its radical forms. He believed that nationalism is
of two types: state-building and state-destructive, the first of which is patriotic, and the second
is chauvinism. Slogans, internal imbalances are a sign of chauvinism, and the consolidation
of the nation around a balanced “national idea” is patriotism (Lipinsky, 1919-1926). How thin
is the line between patriotism and chauvinism, but how devastating can be the consequences
of not being able to distinguish between these views and beliefs. As Mykhailo Hrushevsky
rightly and sometimes prophetically pointed out, the Ukrainian people belong to a European
family with historical ties and national character, but at the same time, he warned against
cultivating “ideals” and patterns: “We must not adapt our lives to any ideals. Liberation from
forced dependence on Moscow life should not be a substitute for one dependence on another,
even if it is voluntary. Ukrainian life must be emancipated in general” (Hrushevsky, 1917).
Go your own way. This should be today’s strategy of Ukraine. They become nations through
blood, culture, through the pain of conscious formation of the state. To be a citizen, Ukrainians
must show their “spartan sense of duty” (Hrushevsky, 1917). We must be worthy of the times
in which we live.

The development of the infrastructure of state institutions is an indicator of legal culture,
law and order, is the basis for the development of all other social manifestations. This is the
key to creating a healthy community that has a future. Lubomyr Husar said: “nationalism is to
love one’s own and disrespect others, and patriotism is to love one’s own and respect others.
There is a great temptation in nationalism, and it is not Christian. We need to love our own and
respect others” [Husar].

Culture, like the entire humanitarian bloc, is an indicator of the state of development of
society. Thus, in the field of culture and philosophy, the meanings and values that should be a
priority in the construction of public policy are formulated. Culture is that which is connected
with the development of human potential. Without this, we will not be able to succeed in
science, education, private or public life. We must have the courage to use our own minds.
Remember Kant’s appeals “Sapere Aude!”, “Have the courage to use your own mind!” Living
in a global and changing world, we ask questions that allow us to learn the basics of governance,
learn the tools to build effective institutions, and build a healthy community.

Research methodology

The issue of the humanitarian sphere is the subject of research by many researchers,
including such as W. Dzoz (2007), who played a leading role in humanitarian policy in the
process of social modernization; V. Gorbulin (2009), who, in turn, strengthened the importance
of elites who must put national interests above personal in the context of creating a favorable
climate for the flourishing of humanitarian policy; O. Postupna (2012), who described in detail
the components of the humanitarian sphere; A. Childs (2013), who studies the level of threats,
conflicts and intolerance in the field of global humanitarian policy and substantiates the
conceptual basis of the strategy of cultural theories on the security of humanitarian assistance.
Thus, V. Gorbulin calls for a bold formulation of the social contract, in which the central
place is given to the national idea, the core of which is culture. Without which it is impossible
to formulate a state strategy. Culture is always values and meanings. In general, Ukrainian security is impossible without social and political harmony, without the serious role of the non-governmental sector. So, we have a long way to go to a secure European, democratic Ukraine. This requires the consolidation of the whole society, our common path to success.

**Humanitarian policy and values**

Let us recall the opinion of O. Paschaver (2015), who surprisingly aptly noted that if the population professes some values and institutions are built on others, it means that such state institutions do not work. Nominally they exist, but they do not reflect reality. Among the social values of the European O. Paschaver includes, first, freedom for himself and for others; secondly, responsibility; thirdly, trust and effective cooperation with fellow citizens. Responsible freedom and responsible cooperation are key principles of European social values (Paschaver, 2015). In contrast, the behavioral feature of Ukrainians is to trust only the immediate environment, which is confirmed by sociological data. In some places, we tend to justify our failures and shift the responsibility onto others. However, the responsibility must be personal.

Thus, the humanitarian policy is about values, ideology, and the ability to maintain ideological balance in a changing world. Important views in this aspect – Aurelio Peccei (1908-1984), Italian scientist, public figure, founder and president of a powerful think tank – the Club of Rome, a researcher of global models of human development. Emphasizing that the development of mankind has reached a turning point, therefore, today’s man must be more focused and think like never before, because his decisions depend not only on the lives of the present but also future generations. Aurelio Peccei emphasizes that the problems of the surrounding world are related to the inner crisis of man himself; the key to salvation lies in man himself (Peccei, 2020: 31). Man must change and rewrite principles and norms, his life according to habit and on the path of awareness, must promote “the emergence of new values and motives – spiritual, philosophical, ethical, social, aesthetic and artistic” to become the basis for cultural development. Consciously come to the main healing goal of such humanism – the restoration of human cultural harmony and balance of the human system. We must decide how we want to see the future and regulate and regulate our activities accordingly. It is about the collective and personal responsibility of man to the world in which he lives (Peccei, 2020: 37). The researcher rightly supports the idea of the “outer limits” of the planet and the “inner limits” of the man himself, the value of cultural heritage, which must be preserved and passed on to future generations (Peccei, 2020: 39). Aurelio Peccei also warns us to refrain from the tendency towards universalization, which, on the contrary, will lead to the erasure of the unique features of each culture. We must preserve the cultural heritage and unite the efforts of scientific disciplines, including archeology, epigraphy, paleography, philosophy, ethology, anthropology, history, to protect the cultural heritage, we must develop a conceptual framework and concrete proposals to achieve our goal.

We must cultivate respect for the cultural heritage we have. Fight for the values of the civilized world. Learn to live by the rules. The ultimate beneficiary of such responsibility should not be international organizations, missions, resolutions, but ourselves because no one will do this job for us. We have to go our own way. We must realize that only culture opens to us the world of spiritual values, becomes a refuge in times of crisis, times of uncertainty. In order to make quality progress on the issue of Ukraine’s humanitarian policy, it is necessary to
unite the efforts of the political establishment, experts and the public environment. Use state, strategic thinking. We have a double task before us to open Ukraine both for the world and for ourselves. We must have the courage to admit that we do not know our own history and culture. We need to define the “national idea”, formulate a social contract and start writing our own success story.

As the sphere of culture is not abstract, accordingly it is regulated by norms, legislative acts and activity of the basic institutions which we should consider.

**Analysis of the resolution The role of culture for resilience, peace and security: a new international agenda promoted by UNESCO**

Let us start by understanding the international program, which is designed to ensure global security and promote the spread of humane values, respect for dissent and religious tolerance. This is the resolution entitled *The role of culture for resilience, peace and security: a new international agenda, which was developed at the initiative of UNESCO* (The role, 2021). The document addresses the threats and conflicts that are destroying World Heritage sites. Culture is defined as one of the most vulnerable areas, which is subjected to deliberate destruction, robbery, persecution of persons on the basis of their cultural, ethnic or religious affiliation, which is a violation of their cultural rights and sometimes encroachment on their personal rights. In this document, the idea of the connection between culture and human identity, respectively, the violation of cultural rights is perceived by people as an encroachment on the boundaries of their personal space, which further makes dialogue, reconciliation and peace impossible. The most dangerous are those conflicts based on ethnic or religious arguments. This document affirms respect for cultural pluralism, religious tolerance, respect for shrines, monuments, museums, libraries, archives, and religious leaders. Respect for dissent is prescribed and a call for dialogue of understanding and mutual enrichment of cultural traditions with other peoples is proclaimed. This document testifies in favor of an educational mission within the framework of humanitarian policy, which unites the spheres of culture, security and human rights, and global peacekeeping activities. It is about forming a coordinated position on the protection of culture, cultural pluralism as the only possible tool for achieving understanding and respect for life together in a civilized global world. In this context, we should mention the researcher Anis Van Engeland (Engeland, 2016), who studied the specific tools of the above humanitarian mission, balancing between the specifics of regional culture and universal human rights. The author substantiated the idea of creating a criterion, a certain set of universal values that would help resolve cultural conflicts.

**Meanings of the Law of Ukraine “On Culture”**

In the meantime, let’s turn to the understanding of Ukrainian legislation, projects and resolutions that define the sphere of Ukraine’s humanitarian horizon: first of all, it is the Law of Ukraine “On Culture” (Vidomosti Verkhovnoi Rady Ukrainy (VVR), 2011, № 24, p.168) (Law, 2011). With the changes introduced in accordance with the WWR Laws from 2013 to 16.07.2020, according to the main provisions of which, namely, paragraph №6 culture is defined as a set of the material and spiritual heritage of a particular community (ethnic group, nation), which accumulates and enriches over a long period of time, is passed down from generation to generation, includes all arts, cultural heritage, cultural values, science, education and reflects the level of development of this community (Law 2011). It should be noted that
this definition unites the spheres of material, spiritual, intellectual and emotional principles of the community and includes not only different types of art, but also the way of life, the basic rules of human life, the value of systems.

However, in the Law of Ukraine “On Culture,” there is no clear distinction, the dichotomy of three different concepts, such as “ethnicity,” “people,” “nation.”

If “ethnos” is about blood kinship, a set of features that unite us externally, then “nation” is a more complex concept that means ideological community, unity around the “national idea,” determines the formation and protection of the state. Only those who position themselves as a “nation” have the desire to create a state, to nurture a national culture. Only those who self-identify as a citizen of the nation are able to give the most valuable thing – their lives for the country.

Thus, “ethnicity” is an ethnic community united by its collective myth of ethnicity and its origins. At the level of “ethnos,” there is a relationship “own” – “foreign,” genetic features are clarified, the unity of origin, customs, language, way of life is established. “Ethnos” is a group of people between generations, united by long coexistence, common language, culture, self-awareness.

In turn, the “people” is the subject of history. Modern Constitutions speak of the people “as the bearer of sovereignty and the only source of power.” The people became a subject of the international legal system in 1945 as a result of enshrining in the UN Charter the principle of “equality and self-determination of peoples.” Belonging to a nation is determined not so much by biological as by socio-cultural factors, general cultural skills, values, traditions. It is a historically formed community of people who have certain views, interests and psychology. It is a collection of people united by belonging to a certain society.

After all, a “nation” is a historically created community of people characterized by a common language, territory, economic life and mental composition. People connected by a common origin and historical traditions. There is no nation without a national idea, without a national cultural core, which consists of two components: national history (which sets and determines the idea of the people) and national history. The core (cultural and political) is formed in the “world of ideas.” The basis of the cultural core is national history and literature, and the political core is the existence of a sovereign state and a social contract. The presence of the State (state form) is a key point. Thus, a “nation” is a community of people of different ethnic backgrounds, united by a cultural and political core, who are citizens of their state (within which they acquire their rights and freedoms), united by a national idea and a “social contract.” Political organization in the form of a state, united by a social contract, a “national idea.”

Accordingly, by the term “folk culture,” we mean traditions, customs, authentic folklore, everything that has a collective author. And, exclusively under the concept of “national culture,” we are not talking about isolated examples of talents and artistic heritage, but about an idea that can unite, about the ideology of the state system. Without a nation’s awareness of its “national idea,” there is no effective cultural policy.

Thus, it goes without saying that the use of concepts such as “ethnicity,” “people,” “nation” as synonyms is unacceptable because they have a completely different meanings. Without realizing their differences, we cannot build a meaningful and effective cultural policy. In order to pursue an effective cultural policy, it is necessary to formulate a “national idea” and to reach a consensus in reading one’s own history. Be united, steadfast and strong. Then our voice will become more visible in the world.
Understanding of the “Millennium Declaration,”
UN General Assembly and the concept of humanitarian development of Ukraine, NAS of Ukraine

Among the normative acts that are important for the sphere of culture, we should also mention the Millennium Declaration signed by Ukraine (UN Millennium Declaration, 2000), adopted in 2000 at the session of the UN General Assembly. Within which the collective responsibility for the establishment of the principles of human dignity, justice, equality at the global level is enshrined. The fundamental values of the 21st century define such principles as: freedom, equality, solidarity, tolerance, respect for nature, shared responsibility for the management of global economic and social development. Thus, this declaration is a map of established universal values recognized by the entire civilized world, but this declaration lacks specific mechanisms for implementing these principles in accordance with the local and regional characteristics of each country.

We should also mention the concept of humanitarian development of Ukraine, the National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine, according to which the main goals of humanitarian development are: “ensuring the implementation of human rights proclaimed by Ukraine; optimization of public relations and achieving civil harmony in society; reproduction and development of intellectual and spiritual potential of the nation” (Concept of humanitarian, 2021).

It should be noted that this project of humanitarian development of Ukraine refers to clear statistics and international rankings. In particular, there is a reference to the UNDP report on human development, according to which Ukraine ranked 45th in 1990 and 85th in 2009. Yes, the inefficiency of modernization of Ukraine society has led to certain manifestations of moral, ethical and legal anomie. The interdependence of economic prosperity and cultural development is proved. The interdependence between the quality of life and investment in human capital has been established. On the way to the project implementation, the priority of cooperation between the state and civil society has been established, the symbiosis of which provides both a consensus of decisions and a credit of public trust. This project was written in 2012 and was to be implemented by 2020.

Newly created institutions of modern Ukrainian culture

Among the leading institutions that testify to the qualitative changes and construction of a fundamentally new cultural space of Ukraine, we can highlight the following:

1. Ukrainian Institute, whose mission is to “strengthen the international and domestic subjectivity of Ukraine through cultural diplomacy” (Ukrainian Institute, 2021).
2. Ukrainian Cultural Foundation, whose mission is to promote “the creation of a developed ecosystem of culture and creativity in Ukraine, which allows to generate and disseminate new values and common values in society and contributes to the preservation of cultural heritage and development of Ukrainian culture in the context of modern world trends” (Ukrainian Cultural Foundation, 2021).
3. Ukrainian Book Institute, the purpose of which is to “support publishing, promote reading, stimulate translation activities, promote Ukrainian literature in the world” (Ukrainian Book Institute, 2021).
4. Dovzhenko Center, which is the largest film archive in Ukraine, “which stores more than 6000 titles of feature, documentary, animated Ukrainian and foreign films and
thousands of archival documents on the history of Ukrainian cinema. The mission of the Dovzhenko Center is to develop new views on the generally accepted history of cinema and history as such, to study the transformation of national memory, the reflection of artistic and historical processes through cinema” (Dovzhenko Center, 2021).

These institutions are a form of a new cultural space, which must be filled with content, meanings, ideas and connected by a thin thread of ideology that unites, reconciles, enriches us as the Ukrainian nation. We stand on the principle that all institutions of the Ukrainian cultural space should be subordinated to one goal – the discovery and promotion of our culture for themselves and for the world.

After all, culture is a field that is not limited to exhibitions and museums, it is an environment of values and ideology, and we must build a culturally marked world of humanitarian policy. We are convinced that nations are not born, but become. Sometimes through blood, through trials, by building state institutions, by uniting around a national idea based on a cultural code. Building self-identity through culture.

Conclusions

We have to go our own way, to unite around the national idea. We are united by the beauty of Ukrainian Baroque architecture, frescoes of Sophia of Kyiv of the 11th century, music by D. Bortniansky, A. Wedel, M. Berezovsky, Ukrainian avant-garde O. Arkhipenko, O. Bogomazov, O. Exter, a monumental painting by M. Boychuk, naive art M. Primachenko, miracle-world of flowers K. Bilokur. This is an incomplete list of great names in Ukrainian culture. We need to learn to respect and carefully value our past, which enriches us and opens Ukraine as a country of high, elite culture. Around the value of which we can unite. Because a nation always arises from an idea, as Vyacheslav Lipinsky rightly remarked. We may be different in our ethnic origin, but we must be united as a “nation,” we must be united around a “national idea.” “The nation – spiritual unity – is always born of the state – territorial and political unity, not vice versa” (Lipinsky, 1928: 65). This should be the strategy of Ukraine today. As M. Hrushevsky said, the Ukrainian people belong to the European family with its historical connections, languages and national character, but at the same time, we must refrain from borrowing samples. “We must follow the path of studying our history, find the essence of our self-identity, know ourselves and open ourselves to the world, – says Myroslav Popovych, – to master and learn to create a certain set of cultural phenomena, we need not only a system of skills but also system values. We often do not understand what exactly these cultural achievements of people in those past times meant, as well as how we should read and perceive them today” (Popovych, 1998: 3).

To achieve qualitative progress in the development of humanitarian policy and public administration, it is necessary to promote the growth of the quality of “human capital,” i.e., to invest in education, to model the socio-humanitarian strategy of Ukraine today. And thus to educate and form a new generation of people who will create those social institutions that will reflect our true values and beliefs. It is an investment in the intelligence of human capital that will allow us to build a country of equal opportunities and justice. Thus, without the effective functioning of social institutions, qualitative progress and development of a smart community are impossible. Let’s appreciate Ukrainian culture and remember that it is a culture that gives political strategies persuasiveness and charm.
References


Concept “Culture” (2021) Available online: https://www.britannica.com/topic/culture


*Dovzhenko Center* (2021) Available online: http://www.dovzhenkocentre.org/


Paschaver, A. (2015) *With our current values, we cannot be a rich country*. Available online: http://reinvent.platfor.ma/aleksandr-pashkaverr/


Ukrainian Cultural Foundation (2021) Available online: https://ucf.in.ua/
Ukrainian Institute (2021) Available online: https://ui.org.ua/
The Shifting Image of Social Capital: Digitizing Cooperative Ties

Frol Revin

Ph.D. in Philosophy, Lecturer, National Pedagogical Dragomanov University (Kyiv, Ukraine)
E-mail: frollrevin@gmail.com
http://orcid.org/ 0000-0002-7349-8079


The article examines digital discourse perceived as a rallying impetus for generating shared proactive attitudes necessary to foster online cooperative action. The emergence of social media as a means of collaborative online communication has informed several distinct research agendas. The author is especially keen on studying the impact of Internet technologies on the creation and accumulation of social capital, comparing its formation and spread in online and offline environments. An equally important task is to identify the role its multiple research methodologies play in highlighting the functional features of various physical and/or virtual communities. A special point of interest for the author is in analyzing the ever-diminishing gap between web-based communication and real-world information exchange. Particular research emphasis is put on establishing the common ground between online and offline social interaction, which leads to the growing number of overlapping study results between the two spheres.

Keywords: collaboration, collective action, virtual networks, social (bonding, bridging) capital, digital ties, connectivity, public sphere

Received: 23 August 2021 / Accepted: 07 October 2021 / Published: 15 November 2021

Introduction

Widespread use of various social media platforms enhances and encourages greater inclusion, fosters diversity, promotes civic engagement and dialogue. All of this leads to increased activity within digital communication channels which can be shaped according to specific user expectations and agendas. More importantly, the digital medium allows for the creation and sustaining of favorable collective action conditions via a set of online interactive practices. With equal access to numerous e-based platforms, users are now in possession of truly egalitarian means of communication with transparent networking opportunities. The established status quo is additionally reinforced by the fact that all network
participants can contribute to the common exchange pool serving not only as consumers but also through generating and validating the parameters of a shared informational field. The following procedure creates an incentive for additional deliberative selectivity, which helps online communities to establish conditions for the formation of concrete cooperative action. Based on this interpretation, we can note that virtual networks serve as unique platforms for consolidating various users based on their common nexus of shared intentions, interests, and values, resulting in cohesive, communicative exchange bringing about a synergistic effect.

This visible demarcation of the online cooperative dimension manifesting itself through fostering of virtual interest groups and communities often undergoes a further tangible transformation culminating in the creation of physical associations, activist groups, and public institutions. The latter provide their members an opportunity to formally disseminate ideas, attract new followers and coordinate their actions in the offline sphere. Another consequence of the rise of modern digital media is the ever-situation whereby the physical and the virtual reciprocally influence each other by laying the foundation for the emergence of novel forms of social activity and organization. In particular, virtual networks make use of the previously nonexistent means of collective action by allowing users who share similar professional qualities, personal and vocational aspirations to establish firmer collaborative ties.

Drawing a parallel, Manuel Castells views the flow of capital (social or otherwise), information technology, network associations, and symbolic interplay as the main driving forces stimulating (virtual) actors to engage in reciprocal exchange depending on their proximity and integration into a scheme of the resource reallocation centers. In such a globally dominant technological infrastructure of communication reigns supreme by determining this new interactive space almost as much as the railroads defined economic regions and national markets underpinned the preindustrial economy. Perceiving modern society as “a culture of real virtuality,” a platform profoundly dominated by deterministic global communication systems, Castells believes that reality is completely captured and fully immersed in the virtual images of an electronic world in which the externally displayed messages do not just appear on your screen as transmitted visual and symbolic experience, but are the experience (Castells, 2007: 240). Accordingly, the web nowadays offers countless highly efficient collaborative instruments available to active users engaging in collective political action when compared to more conventional offline means of expression and participation.

Thiery Penard and Nicolas Poussing, on the other hand, believe that significant collaborative gains accrue when randomly occurring physical affiliations become linked to technological platforms shaping coordinated large-scale collaborative enterprises since such spontaneous networking allows to more effectively ensure shared creation and distribution of information and identities. Compared to more formally developed bonds and obligations based solely on a stringent hierarchical structure, spontaneous interaction gradually forms a fixed nexus of productive interdependence between individuals whose cooperative ties reinforce the overall effectiveness of jointly undertaken civic pursuits (Penard & Poussing, 2010: 575). Distributed across the various web-based platforms, these novel cooperative technological tools allow users to take advantage of effective ways to voice their opinions, shaping and adapting message dissemination algorithms to accommodate the constant flux of the ever-increasing data exchange.
Measuring online cohesion and communication

The cornerstone of any modern community is communication, whereby actors with the greatest chance of influencing power are those whose messages are able to generate the most noticeable disseminating impact. Viewed as an outcome of three major elements (information, relay, and reception), network communication presupposes that the message has to be accepted and decoded by the recipient as a prerequisite for subsequent reciprocal information exchange. Simply put, communicative success is the result of attracting the attention and motivation of other network participants. Having said that, successful communication cannot fundamentally depend solely on the realization of its selective content (meaning), whereby the impact of a particular digital activity is measured solely on the basis of calculating the number of subsequent response actions (comments) or other feedback metrics. Conceptually, this entails that communicative capital, while capable of being converted into other forms of reputational gains, is, nonetheless qualitatively different from human or any other sort of capital and is, therefore, not reducible to it.

The emergence of social media as a means of collaborative online communication has formed several distinct research areas. Researchers are particularly interested in studying the impact of Internet technologies on the creation and accumulation of social capital, comparing the peculiarities of its formation in an online and offline environment. Hence, when one takes a closer look at the methods of analyzing social capital accumulated due to enhanced connectivity and cyber cohesion (identifying the impact of its multiple functional features for various physical and/or virtual communities), what becomes apparent is a somewhat dated approach to the assessment of social capital through the definition of its main forms: social networks, trust, and modes of reciprocal behavior. Researchers of online social capital, viewing it as an addition to concrete social ties, argue that participation of the social network actors in joint Internet projects can be based either on active or passive inclusion (Earl & Kimport, 2011). The latter usually occurs as a mundane action of knowledge acquisition (gaining access to certain information) whereby a user is able to familiarize herself with a new piece of data by simply reading a post online. According to a number of authors, the borders between online and offline social capital are becoming increasingly difficult to demarcate (Hampton et al., 2011: 135). This is nowhere more evident than amongst young people actively utilizing the web for increased connectivity that results both in individual and interpersonal gains.

It is precisely the combination of these factors (passive affiliation to the social network as well as merging online and offline means of social ties) that questions the relevance of exclusively traditional study methods. The work of Dmitri Williams (2006) serves as a good illustration of the kind of criticism that such conventional (pre-web) approaches to measuring digitized social capital receive. In particular, it emphasizes the traditional survey’s inability to accurately capture whether a potential respondent belongs to a specific group which reflects cooperative behavioral patterns spread within their Internet community. In order to provide an effective means of determining such parameters, Williams managed to develop a special technique (Internet Social Capital Scales) of comparing social capital corresponding to different types of an online and offline collaborative environment. More specifically, he tried to confirm the hypothesis that the particular mechanism for measuring the outcome of potentially cohesive relations (between the new vibrant virtual reality and the more orthodox social interactions) was already embedded within the information and communication technologies at the heart of the ongoing digital revolution (Williams, 2006). Accordingly, if the two main types (bridging
and bonding) of social capital did not differ significantly during the pre-Internet era, modern web-based means of data transmission drastically altered the channels through which social ties are currently being established and transformed.

With an ever-diminishing gap between virtual communication and real-world information exchange, it is becoming increasingly difficult to establish pronounced differences in online and offline social interaction, which leads to the heightened probability of overlapping study results between the two spheres. All this suggests that the main reason for the incorrect use of the predominantly survey-based methodology for measuring Internet-facilitated social capital stems from the multi-faceted nature of web presence as a phenomenon belonging to a new cross-platform communication space. In particular, high-speed transmission of large quantities of data leads to network users developing new trust markers applied to other communication participants and even more so to the informational and cooperative incentives received from them. What seems even more apparent is that nowadays, a rising number of individuals perceive the web as an environment with oftentimes misleading, unreliable information, a place with a high probability of monitoring and interception of private data (tracking of the user behavior analytics, automated manipulatory technologies, automated advertising networks, bots, popup recommendation services, etc.) No less important is the emotional aspect of interpersonal web exchange represented by the emergence of new communication practices such as the use of memes, emojis, and other means of pictorial messaging (Neves, 2013).

Accordingly, there appear to be two fundamentally different approaches to making use of e-technologies in order to facilitate collaborative action. In the first case, the Internet is seen and scrutinized merely as a tool for coordination of social cohesion that takes place in real physical space. A fitting example illustrating this would be all manner of public awareness affecting events, from peaceful flash mobs to protest rallies, organized with the help of virtual social networks such as Facebook, Twitter, and other popular platforms. Thus, one can witness the impact of e-generated activism on politics, economics, education, and the daily lives of regular users who perceive the web as a medium drastically modifying normative forms of interaction. The second type of joint online engagement within the virtual space occurs with the aim of achieving interpersonal rapport and is geared towards establishing effective communication channels while encouraging collaborative data exchange.

Alternatively, when faced with these types of virtual environments coupled with mediated data transmission methods, online researchers are presented with novel opportunities (as well as facing equally new challenges) for examining the intricate nature of digitized social capital. In particular, the expansion of the existing methodology can be supplemented by the use of a non-dial approach (modeling situations through the process of enabled observation), semantic network analysis (viz. community cohesion analysis). These kinds of tools make it possible to take into account the interdisciplinary nature of the various objects of study, encompassing a wide array of anthropological, ethnographic, and cultural characteristics prevalent in virtual communities that are based on specific types of Internet connection and/or communication. When conducting research, the sociologist must, therefore, determine the basic study nexus based on a particular choice of social networks (Internet communities) in order to successfully implement a specific approach for collecting data and subsequent result interpretation. In addition, to these new types of data analysis (as well as utilizing measurements through polls and sampling), social capital researchers can employ webometrics as a method for data collection, which presupposes Internet scanning (Björneborn & Ingwersen, 2004). The advantage of this approach when compared to traditional polling lies in its minimal amount
of invasiveness, perfect for when the behaviors and opinions of people are studied as if ‘under cover.’ Lastly, when combined, the methods of content and network analysis make it possible to identify hidden patterns of application. These categories (language utterances, situational content) help designate various participants in pattern-specific collaborative virtual communities. When web resources provide users with access to their databases, offering researchers to interface application programming (API) tools while providing webometric scanning becomes especially relevant. An example of this kind of research may be the analysis of the cooperative interaction of social actors on Twitter. This platform is a perfect hybrid of microblogging and social network services.

Network ties and setbacks of shared interfaces

The severe social bias inherent in certain virtual network formats goes against all principal egalitarian tenets of participant equality and communicative freedom expounded by the pioneers of Internet technology, many of whom believed that genuine digital interaction has the ability to neutralize micro and macro level imbalance without negating the existence of rigid offline social stratification. With the impact of digital media on the level of disparity, a potentially fruitful avenue lies in applying Pierre Bourdieu’s theory of social fields to the study of inequality appearing within virtual communities. In particular, his theory states that a medium’s conventional utility is spread over a wide array of habitual practices regardless of their technical characteristics. This most prominently manifests itself in Bourdieu’s approach to technology and, specifically, in his belief that technological infrastructures do not just help you attain a fixed narrow goal but are socially shaped along with their meanings, functions, domains, and utility. In other words, they cannot come into existence simply to fill a preexisting role since the role itself is co-created (defined) alongside its technical characteristics by the makers and users. Moreover, this designation is not a static function but something that can change over time depending on how people’s perception shifts being influenced by particular technological functionality and preferences (Ignatow & Pierre, 2017).

Viewed through this lens, a social field is an arena of struggle between tech-savvy actors (members of the digital community) for the right to reinvest the results of their capital accumulated online within task-oriented, field-specific limits (the boundaries of the virtual community). Thus, actors occupying similar or close positions (proportional to the total capital they have in defining authority access) form a class with social field logic dictating a division of the totality of positions into two interlinked types based on the possession of class relational power. Since digital community participation principally comes in the form of information exchange, the ability to alter interpersonal communication (censoring debate platforms) can be interpreted as a form of direct constitutive power. Consequently, an inherent bias within a given online community exists as a division among users with and without control over other members’ communicative tools and practice. It follows that digital inequality is embodied by an institute of moderators who exert legitimized symbolic censorship while representing the dominant e-stratum (Dhavan et al., 2001). With the old types of social inequality largely offset in the virtual space, the role of the classic forms of capital is, likewise, likely to be substantially reduced and/or significantly modified. Accordingly, cultural capital is digitized by means of users’ internalized technological socialization directly corresponding to the scale, reach, and sophistication of their digital utilization patterns.
This Bourdieusian framework has documented empirical worth when applied to studies analyzing online user activity as well as those scrutinizing the interplay between digital and other more concrete forms of capital. In particular, the former can undergo a reverse transformation into each of the three major forms of capital (cultural, social, and informational) through unhindered professional networking, open access to public goods, and unrestricted dissemination of useful connections skillsets, and knowledge. This last point seems to hint at how the same kinds of ICT engagement can yield contrasting payoffs for skilled kinds of users. Indeed, the varying levels of digital habitus, access, and literacy have been shown to increase the gap in offline resource distribution, mirroring visibly lower levels of economic and cultural capital (Robinson, 2020: 488). Hence, acquired expertise is necessary for finding and assessing online data makes up one of the most prominent prerequisites for technologically advanced individuals whose digital adroitness serves as an advantageous precondition for the attainment of informational and operational superiority. Not only do better-trained Internet users reap steady benefits by arriving at desired outcomes with less effort and significant time efficiency, but they are also able to utilize the various ICT capabilities in a more versatile manner compared to their less-skilled peers. By seamlessly transitioning from one web resource to another, these individuals are taking further advantage of the Internet’s cohesion, inducing platforms and algorithms via employing significantly more nuanced and productive tools available to those wishing to maximize their digital capital-enhancing potential.

Renowned German philosopher and sociologist Jürgen Habermas gives credit to this idea by emphasizing a distinction between instrumental and communicative action. The latter is seen as a byproduct of a special democratizing dimension of rational critical discourse, which facilitates wider inclusivity coupled with an increased quality of collective decision-making. As individual units of collaborative parlance, speech acts bolster interpersonal ties allowing the speaker to take up a relation to the world of legitimate social orders, representing existing states of affairs, while crystallizing his cooperative experiences through a first-person attitudinal stance. Communicative action, thus, relies on interlocutors aiming to reach a common ground in contentious matters coordinating their actions by reasoned argument, consensus, and through cooperation rather than undertaking a purely strategic, goal-directed course of action. Indeed, Habermas expressed concern that an overly commercialized attitude to all manner of social interaction and partnership would eventually spell doom for the ever-diminishing character of the genuinely public sphere of cooperation (Ramos-Pinto, 2012: 58). What especially seems to lend support to this notion is a presently alarming tendency of these discursive practices to turn into formalized sets of rigorous rules which supplant the more organic notion of deliberation with artificially imposed guidelines of the communicative contest. Modern society, thus, appears to be in dire need of readjusting of our rapidly shrinking discursive potential to prevent the previously accessible modes of the public forum from becoming utterly commodified. Expressing his dissatisfaction with our current shift from a culture-debating society to a culture-consuming one, Habermas placed the primary blame for this radical negative shift in the way we approach interpersonal communication on the disproportional growth in commercial mass media spread and popularity.

**Conclusions**

Social capital manifests itself as a form of transformative power affecting both concrete and digital means of collaboration and exchange. Accordingly, web-accumulated capital
might be defined not only as a set of skills, competencies, and cooperative predispositions embedded within a particular interconnected online infrastructure but serves the function of bringing together social actors by creating new as well as reinforcing established relational power networks. Communicative success often occurs as a concomitant result of attracting attention and harnessing the motivational resources of other network participants. Successful communication cannot only depend on the explication of its selective content since the impact of a particular digital activity is measured not just on the basis of predicting and calculating the number of potential response actions (comments) or other feedback metrics. While capable of being converted into other forms of reputational gains, communicative capital is, nonetheless qualitatively different from human or any other sort of capital and is, therefore, not reducible to it.

Studying the impact of various forms of social cohesion, researchers encounter models of Internet-facilitated discourse that tend to take an uncritical view towards web-fostered cooperation (failing to differentiate between distinct types of discourse facilitators), as well as neglecting to acknowledge the precise way freedom of expression is dependent on particular social platform architecture. By acknowledging the role social networks play in continually improving diverse forms of collaborative practice, one cannot disregard their massive influence as exclusive gatekeepers (exercising unilateral authority) of the ever-growing discursive online landscape. The last decade has undoubtedly witnessed a revolution in ICT proliferation that had a profound democratizing effect on allowing the widest social strata to partake in regional and global dialogue and deliberation by ushering in an era of almost utopian inclusivity and technological accessibility. With the old types of social inequality largely offset in the virtual space, the role of classic forms of capital is likely to be substantially reduced and/or significantly modified. Accordingly, cultural capital gets digitized by means of users’ technological ties which are directly corresponding to the reach, scale, and sophistication of their online patterns of interaction.

Significant collaborative gains further accrue when randomly occurring physical affiliations are transferred to the level of technological platforms, taking advantage of their ability to shape and coordinate large-scale collaborative endeavors. Compared to more formally developed bonds and obligations based solely on a stringent hierarchical structure, spontaneous exchange gradually forms a fixed nexus of productive interdependence between individuals whose cooperative ties reinforce the overall effectiveness of jointly undertaken civic pursuits. When examining various types of virtual environments, researchers are frequently presented with novel opportunities for examining the intricate nature of digitized social capital. A potential expansion of the existing methodology stems from the use of the non-dial approach, utilizing a semantic network and community cohesion analyses, as well as turning to mediated data transmission methods. These kinds of tools make it possible to take into account the interdisciplinary nature of online social networking while encompassing a wide array of anthropological, ethnographic, and cultural characteristics prevalent in virtual communities that are based on specific types of connection and/or communication.

References


Mahlouly, Dounia (2013) Rethinking the Public Sphere in a Digital Environment: Similarities between the Eighteenth and the Twenty-First Centuries. *ESharp* 20, no. 6, 1-21.


Identity Crisis as the Main Motive of Contemporary Native American Literature

Sergii Rudenko

Doctor of Philosophical Sciences, Professor, Guangdong University of Petrochemical Technology (Maoming, Guangdong Province, China); Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv (Kyiv, Ukraine)
E-mail: rudenkosrg@gmail.com
https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9069-0989

Yaroslav Sobolievskyi

Doctor of Philosophical Sciences, Associate Professor, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv (Kyiv, Ukraine)
E-mail: yasobolevsky@knu.ua
https://orcid.org/0000-0001-8251-2744


This research offers a linguacultural analysis of the main ideas and goals of institutions for the preservation of the culture and language of the Indigenous peoples of America, through the publication of relevant research in thematic journals and popular books, to determine the relevance of the problem of the identity crisis in the worldview and literature of Native Americans.

The authors used the thick description method to analyse the main goals of twenty-five Native American organisations, basing their research on articles published in the past few years in nine scientific journals on various topics (from culture to business) and books written by Indigenous authors. The authors reached their conclusions based on this research material.

The results of the study, which focused on institutions that preserve the culture and heritage of the Indigenous peoples of America and their activities, found that one of the main challenges is the preservation of identity. Analysis of the articles of leading journals on literature, culture, politics, business, philosophy, as well as analysis of the content of the books written by Indigenous people, revealed that identity crisis is an urgent problem. Despite the prevailing opinion in American society, it is obvious that a crisis is inevitable.

All 25 of the organisations, whose goals were studied in this article, support, preserve, broadcast, and transmit values, heritage, and spiritual culture, and, in one way or another, confront the identity crisis. After analysing more than 550 articles in nine scientific journals devoted to the culture of American
Identity Crisis as the Main Motive of Contemporary Native American Literature
by Sergii Rudenko and Yaroslav Sobolievskyi

Keywords: Native American Literature, American Culture, Identity Crisis, Self-Identity

Received: 27 August 2021 / Accepted: 20 September 2021 / Published: 15 November 2021

Introduction

“When questioned by an anthropologist on what the Indians called America before the white man came, an Indian said simply, ‘Ours’” (Deloria, 1969: 166). This quote characterises the dramatic nature of the acculturation process of Native Americans and European colonists. As a result of this process, the aborigines lost their territories and their language, culture, and worldview. On the one hand: “language as an intrinsic property of man, as his research focused not on individual national languages but also on general linguistic characteristics” (Sobolievskyi & Liebiedieva, 2021: 109). But on the other hand, it is difficult to argue with the meaning of language for the national question, culture, and self-identity. In this study, we approach the problem of language in a complex manner.

In fairness, it should be clarified that there are exceptions to this generalisation. For example, thanks to the writing of the Europeans, it was possible to preserve the heritage of the Indigenous authors. Thanks to missionary activities, the cultural heritage was preserved. “Since their first contact with Westerners, Native Americans have faced open racism, indifference on the one hand, and compassion, respect, and even admiration on the other” (Rudenko & Sobolievskyi, 2020: 179). In this study, we try to avoid radical statements, revealing only certain problems. Literature is an essential source of information to study the identity crisis faced by Native Americans. Therefore, to determine the relevance of this problem, we turned our attention to modern literature.

The process of studying Native American literature is a particularly challenging task, and it should be remembered that there are currently more than five hundred federally recognised Indian tribes in the United States. An important nuance is that although very few tribal groups have received official recognition, all tribes have had contact and have been impacted to varying degrees by the influence of the colonial policies of European countries (Great Britain, Spain, France, Holland, etc.). It is known that the Indigenous tribes of the United States experienced the impact of colonisation during their existence before the U.S. Supreme Court decided to intervene at the state level. The interactions between surviving Native cultures and these colonial influences have shaped the narrative of Native American literary texts. These problems may not be familiar to non-indigenous people from other cultures, however, many people understand these problems intuitively. For example, Professor Irina Khomenko has a similar opinion, and she claims that there is a direct connection between argumentation in folklore and language: “…folk cultural predispositions and understandings of interpersonal arguing as a background of modern views” (Khomenko, 2020: 25).

We selected three sources to study the relevance of the identity crisis among American Indians. The first source comprised the activities of institutions designed to assist the Indigenous peoples of America in matters of politics, law, economics, culture, language, literature and
philosophy. The second source of information was articles in periodicals written by both Indigenous people and researchers of other nationalities. An important feature of the research was the search for the mention of the problem of the identity crisis and how frequently it was mentioned. The third source of information was books written by both Indigenous authors and representatives of other peoples. The publications had to be modern and had to reflect reality.

### Native American Organisations Serving the Community

In studying the activities of Native American organisations, we looked at the statutes and objectives of these institutions to determine the importance of the concept of identity. A list of these 25 institutions includes American Indian Business Leaders (AIBL); the American Indian Higher Education Consortium (AIHEC); the First Nations Development Institute; the American Indian College Fund; the American Indian Policy Center; the National Indian Council on Aging (NICOA); the Native American Disability Law Center; Americans for Indian Opportunity; the Association of American Indian Affairs (AAIA); the American Indian Society of Washington, DC; the National Alaska Native American Indian Nurses Association (NANAINA); the National Indian Child Care Association; the National Native American Law Enforcement Association (NNALEA); the Native American Art Council; the Native American Capital (NAC); Native American Today; the Native American Financial Official Association (NAFOA); the Native American Journalists Association (NAJA); the Native American Rights Fund (NARF); the Indian Country Media Network; The Native American Times; the National Native American AIDS Prevention Center; the National Native American Bar Association (NNABA); the American Indian Science and Engineering Society (AISES); Women Empowering Women for Indian Nations.

Analysis revealed that the organisations have common motives, which are manifested both in the slogans (for example, culture, tradition, language = Indigenous Identity) and in their purpose. Some organisations, such as The Native American Disability Law Center, are dedicated to helping people with special needs, but they also care about mental health and respect the individual, the community, and the laws they seek to uphold. Founded by Ladona Harris in 1970, AIO draws on traditional Indigenous philosophy, and Americans for Indian Opportunity promotes, from an Indigenous perspective, the cultural, political, and economic rights of Indigenous peoples in the United States and around the world.

For example:

“The American Indian Society has worked to support the goals it established in 1966:

- to preserve Indian culture and perpetuate Indian tradition;
- to promote fellowship among members of all American Indian tribes;
- to enlighten the public and encourage a better understanding of the Indian people;
- to assist young Indian boys and girls in their academic studies through its scholarship program.

We hope you will join us to support the next generation of native leaders and continue our work to preserve Indian culture in this nation” (American Indian Society of Washington).

The very first goal is the need to preserve Indian culture; the word ‘preserve’ implies that there is a need to protect it from someone or something, which means there is a threat. The Native American identity crisis can be confronted by educating the public and facilitating communication between members of different tribes.
American Indian journals and identity

The list of American Indian journals that address the crisis is long: *the American Indian Culture and Research Journal; the Journal of American Indian Education; the American Indian Quarterly; Ethnic and Racial Studies; the American Indian Law Review; Studies in American Indian Literatures; the Journal of the Native American and Indigenous Studies Association; the Indigenous Policy Journal*. This list, which is far from complete, only includes frequently cited journals. This study analysed articles in nine journals published over the last three years. The total number of articles published over this period is approximately 550, including book reviews, scientific reports, and opening words. It is very difficult to determine the exact percentage of articles that relate to the topic of the crisis, but according to our estimates, more than half of the articles directly or indirectly relate to the problem of an identity crisis, loss of heritage, the threat of loss of culture, and political, social and legal problems.

The first journal worth mentioning is *the American Indian Culture and Research Journal*, published since 1971. This journal is a renowned multidisciplinary journal dedicated to the publication of interdisciplinary research in the study of Native American peoples. In addition to articles, the journal publishes reviews of books and literature. The journal’s topics are diverse, covering the fields of history, anthropology, geography, sociology, political science, health care, literature, law, education and art. It is published by the Center for American Indian Studies at the University of California, Los Angeles. While the first journal is devoted to culture, education is the focus of the scientific journal, *the Journal of American Indian Education*, founded in 1961. This scholarly journal contains original articles on the education of American Indians, Alaska Natives, Hawaiian Natives, and Indigenous peoples around the world, including Aboriginal, Maori, Native American peoples and others. The peer-reviewed *American Indian Quarterly* is an interdisciplinary journal that publishes articles on the anthropology, history, literature, religions and arts of Native Americans. The scientific journal covers a variety of issues and topics related to the life and work of the Indigenous peoples of America.

Another example is *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, which aims to be the leading journal that analyses the role of race, racism, ethnicity, migration, and forms of ethnonationalism. These social phenomena are at the heart of many of the modern world’s major social and political issues. As for the legal field, it is important to mention the scientific journal *American Indian Law Review*. The journal publishes articles that analyse changes in legal issues affecting Native Americans and Indigenous peoples in America and around the world. Although the journal adheres to the traditional legal review format, it offers in-depth articles by legal scholars, lawyers and other expert observers. In addition, the review features comments and notes written by students and editors on a wide range of topics related to Indian law. The only journal in the United States that focuses exclusively on American Indian literature is *Studies in American Indian Literatures*. With a broad scope of scholars and creative contributors, this journal is on the cutting edge of activity in the field. The journal’s broad definition of “literatures” includes all written, spoken, and visual texts created by Native peoples. Finally, the policy of the scholarly journal, *Journal of the Native American and Indigenous Studies Association*, promotes the convergence of Indigenous peoples despite their geographical location. Scientific journal editors strive to create a dynamic intellectual space for communication and exchange of excellent scientific knowledge related to Indigenous research.
Identity Crisis as the Main Motive of Contemporary Native American Literature
by Sergii Rudenko and Yaroslav Sobolievskyi

Using the example of one issue of one journal, we aim to demonstrate the significance of the problem of identity crisis to extrapolate this to other publications. Almost all materials in one way or another relate to the problem of the identity crisis. It seems impossible to calculate the exact number and percentage of publications on this topic due to the subjectivity of the approach, but here are some examples. The introduction discusses the structural racism of colonialism that continues to have many negative impacts on Indigenous peoples, and the impact of COVID-19 is no exception. The theme of the special issue, while focusing on the impact of the pandemic, touches on the resilience of Indigenous communities and the importance of self-determination in public responses. This theme is also evident in the rest of the articles. Examples of the titles of articles and the formulation of problems are as follows:

Risk and Resilience Factors in Urban American Indian and Alaska Native Youth during the Coronavirus Pandemic (2020):
“American Indians and Alaska Natives suffer disproportionately from poverty and other inequities and are vulnerable to adverse health and socioeconomic effects of COVID-19” (D’Amico et al., 2020).
“Despite demographic similarities, American Indian/Alaska Natives exhibited more stressors related to COVID-19 as well as higher depressive symptom scores compared to non-Hispanic whites” (Burton et al., 2020).
“We propose a “call to action” framework comprising four elements: (1) guaranteeing self-determination for tāngata whaikaha; (2) addressing all forms of racism, ableism, and other structural forms of oppression; (3) rectifying historical injustices; and (4) allocating resources for the pandemic and beyond in alignment with need” (Jones et al., 2020).
First Nations’ Survivance and Sovereignty in Canada during a Time of COVID-19 (2020), “First Nations people in Canada have demonstrated and continue to demonstrate persistent and resilient cultural, linguistic, and traditional endurance: survivance. The devastation resulting from centuries of health pandemics such as smallpox, influenza, cholera, tuberculosis, measles, and scarlet fever reinforces the ongoing resilience of First Nations people, cultures, and traditions in Canada. Despite the history of pandemic-related trauma and myriad social, political, environmental, and health challenges, as well as the added burden that COVID-19 is placing on the healthcare system in Canada, First Nations organisations and leadership are enacting their inherent rights to sovereignty and governance” (Rowe et al., 2020).

Native American writers and their books

Books written by Native American peoples describe their vision of the problems that plague them. Identity crisis problems can be considered in the example of a separate nation. The book Eastern Cherokee Stories: A Living Oral Tradition and Its Cultural Continuance (2019) is an in-depth study of the traditions of the Eastern group of Cherokee Indians. The conditions creating this work are quite typical. Sandra Muse Isaacs, the author, grew up in Detroit but reunited with her heritage while living in Cherokee, North Carolina, where she pursued her PhD in English and cultural studies. The author has not proposed any new
methodologies, but her research is extremely interesting. A characteristic feature of the work is a mix of stories from both respected residents and native people. Her book contains five chapters, and the language balance is achieved using terminology in the Tsalagi language with English explanations. The idea is to steal the traditions politically and to share the research with a wide audience. Central to the study are two ideas: “coming together” (gadugi) and the “right path” (duyvkt) – which, according to the author, determine the fundamental principles of the Cherokee worldview (Isaacs, 2019).

On the other hand, this work could be seen as a study of the process of acculturation and the coexistence of Indigenous peoples and settlers/colonists. Celine Carayon, assistant professor of history at the University of Salisbury, Salisbury, MD, specialises in the study of French colonial history and Native American history. In her book Eloquence Embodied: Nonverbal Communication among French and Indigenous Peoples in the Americas (2019), she has outlined a thorough study of the history of non-verbal communication between the first French explorers, settlers, and Native Americans in the 16th–18th centuries. The research is based on Jesuit Relations, a 17th century literary and historical monument; this is the correspondence of New France missionaries with Europe, published mostly in Paris in 1632-1672 (Carayon, 2019). The uniqueness of this work is that the author argues that scholars have over-emphasised the complexity, even the impossibility, of intercultural communication in early America, due to strong modern skepticism about probable success in non-verbal communication. Also, she traces the vast role of non-verbal communication, not only in basic forms such as asking for directions, or food or shelter, but also in complex diplomatic and religious conversations. The following researcher touches on a slightly different problem in his research. Author of a similar study, Gonzalo Lamana, associate professor in the Department of Hispanic Languages and Literature at the University of Pittsburgh, writes an intellectual history in his monograph How “Indians” Think: Colonial Indigenous Intellectuals and the Question of Critical Race Theory (2019). The author’s temporal range begins in 1492, when Christopher Columbus’s Spanish crew first landed in America, through to the Spanish colonisation of Peru in the seventeenth century. From Lamana’s perspective, colonialism and the forms of domination that it entails are supported by notions of white supremacy, which predominate among Spaniards. But, at least in theory, it is not necessarily to skin colour (Lamana, 2019: 17). The author describes the way Andean Indigenous peoples and Spanish colonists came to understand (as well as misunderstand) and interact with each other.

A unique collection of essays, Decolonising Research: Indigenous Storywork as Methodology (2019), compiled by Native researchers from Canada, Australia, New Zealand, is a good example of collective work. It joins other outstanding works on decolonisation, such as Decolonising Methodologies: Research and Indigenous Peoples by Linda Tuhiwai Smith (1999, 2012) and Indigenous and Decolonizing Studies in Education: Mapping the Long View by Smith, Eve Tuck and K. Wayne Yang (2019). There is an interesting thought about decolonisation in the foreword of this book; the author believes that by studying private stories, we can get more authoritative information than if we study the comments of unbiased scholars. “…we mostly hear that version from a dominant perspective that has assumed the right to tell the stories of the colonised and the oppressed that they have re-interpreted, represented, and re-told through their own lens” (Archibald, 2019: XI).

This book emphasises the rights to self-determination guaranteed by the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples. In the context of the work required for decolonisation, these essays embody the unique experiences of scholars who work in the
territory of representatives of different nations and communities. Languages, land, society, and many other key questions in the essays demonstrate the depth of understanding of the problems.

Earlier, in 2008, Jo-Anne Archibald conducted an active study into the culture of the native people of America. She worked closely with tribal elders and renowned storytellers, collecting and organising both traditional and personal stories to describe life experiences. She published the book *Indigenous Storywork: Educating the Heart, Mind, Body, and Spirit* (2008), in which she described oral stories of Indigenous peoples. According to the author, the stories are an important source of information about the life of Indigenous peoples. She believes that stories can serve as teaching tools (Archibald, 2008). The issue of education is extremely acute for American Indian society since there is still no teaching model that takes into account the needs of Indigenous people and historical justice. In 2015, researchers found that 87% of primary school curricula focusing on Native American culture were dedicated only to Native American history, and more than half of the U.S. states did not even mention Native Americans by name. There is a false impression that this topic is not worthy of coverage in literature and education, which directly affects the identity crisis of the Indigenous population. The book *An Indigenous People’s History of the United States for Young People* (2019) describes the current situation; most schools in the United States limit the teaching of Indigenous culture to the Thanksgiving story. This book seeks to change that, starting in pre-European North America and continuing to the present, ending with a chapter on recent Standing Rock activity (Dunbar-Ortiz, 2019).

Besides culture, politics, and history, writers often turn to the topic of ecosophy since a well-known feature of the worldview of the Indigenous peoples of America is not anthropocentrism but ethnocentrism. Roberts, an assistant professor of history at Bowdoin College, examines the life and work of colonial leaders, showing how they influenced social and commercial relations in the Connecticut Valley and Boston and Europe throughout the West Indies. In his book, *Colonial Ecology, Atlantic Economy: Transforming Nature in Early New England* (2019), the author analyses how Indigenous people and Europeans forged communication and trade in the regional and transatlantic economy of New England. The book shows how the rise of modern capitalism took place and how it changed the ecological landscape of the 18-19th centuries (Roberts, 2019). Mythology, which we believe is an integral part of a person’s worldview, is deeply rooted in the culture of the Indigenous population of America. The book *The End of the Myth: From the Frontier to the Border Wall in the Mind of America* (2019) is not the first of its kind, but it is one of the latest to address this topic. The author proposes an intellectual history of the border myth, details the genocide that accompanies territorial expansion, and explores the pathological symbiosis of capitalism and the inherent promise of the frontier. Grandin describes in detail how, from the earliest days of its existence, America’s national border: “Didn’t just move occasionally, in response to episodic war or diplomacy, but constitutively as a quality of its being” (Grandin, 2019: 31).

Grandin’s work is the first to argue that the myth of borders is dead, pointing to the wall as evidence that separates the past from the present as clearly as it is intended to separate Mexico from the United States. For more than two centuries, war-driven territorial and economic expansionism has allowed Americans to hide deep social and political divisions with an expansionist imperative narrative. According to Professor Oleg Bazaluk, unfortunately, in the history of America, the issue of peace and war has been raised quite often, despite the peace-loving intentions of the leaders. “The creators of the American democracy made a significant contribution to the comprehension of war and peace in international relations... Charles-Louis
de Montesquieu, Thomas Paine, Thomas Jefferson, and others defended the idea that the law was able only to stop the violence, but not eradicate it; that the destinies of independence of states, and the Republican system, depended only on the moral development of people” (Bazaluk, 2017: 96-97)

Gender issues are also relevant for Native American writers. In Indigenous Women Writing and the Cultural Study of Law (2017), the author emphasises the ways that Indigenous women are enacting their sovereignty by writing about Indigenous issues of Native America. Suzack focuses on Indigenous women writers such as Leslie Mar Mon Silko (Laguna Pueblo), Beatrice Culleton Mosionier (Canadian Metis), Louise Erdrich (Turtle Mountain Band of Chippewa), and Winona LaDuke (Ojibwe White Earth Band of Chippewa) (Suzack, 2017). Each of the four Indigenous women has written novels to address real issues that continue to impact Indigenous women’s sovereignty. The author discusses these novels in relation to real-life Supreme Court cases that have addressed concerns around gender identity, blood quantum, domestic violence, and land to show the importance of Indigenous women’s voices through writing. The second example is a book written by the Indian rights activist Winona LaDuke, who was a Green Party vice-presidential nominee in 1996. Although she has written many relevant books, her artistic debut is a provocative novel based on her own life experiences, Last Standing Woman (1997). The author skillfully combines social experience with a mythological picture. The novel, which is set in the White Land Reservation in Minnesota, covers three centuries, with the main events taking place in the 20th century. At the centre of the plot is the struggle for dignity and self-determination against the crisis of self-identity (LaDuke, 1997). The focus is on strong women who resist ongoing U.S. persecution and corrupt tribal governments. Other books by the author on this topic are All our Relations: Native Struggles for Land and Life (1999), about the drive to reclaim tribal land for ownership; Recovering the Sacred: The Power of Naming and Claiming (2005), a book about traditional beliefs and practices; The Militarization of Indian Country (2013); The Sugar Bush (1999); The Winona LaDuke Reader: A Collection of Essential Writings (2002); All Our Relations: Native Struggles for Land and Life (1999).

In the search for the identity of Native Americans, a classic work is the book The Search for an American Indian Identity: Modern Pan-Indian Movements (1971). “Pan-Indian,” the author notes, “...seems first to have been used in 1950 by Charles S. Brant in a study of the Native American Church” (Hertzberg, 1971: 291).

Since that date, the term has frequently been employed by anthropologists and ethnohistorians (whether Indian or non-Indian), although seldom by the Indian actors themselves. In conceptual asides to her historical narrative, Hertzberg contrasts “pan-Indianism” with “assimilation,” the “melting pot,” and other terms that characterise the nature of interaction on an ethnic frontier. However, it would be a mistake for present-day readers to take the title of her volume seriously and to approach it for social-psychological interpretations of identity and “the self” on that frontier (for such discussions, consult the work of Neils W. Braroe, Robert V. Dumont, Jr., and Robert K. Thomas). Hertzberg gives her readers scholarly history that is based closely on relevant documentary sources and occasionally enlivened by comparisons with the immigrant experience of the early 20th century.

The importance and relevance of studying the literature of Indigenous people of America are undoubted. To better understand their worldview and the crises they face, we will give an example of the importance of the study. The Cambridge Companion to Native American Literature (2012) provides an up-to-date and significant overview of a new area of literary research related to Native American culture. The collection includes texts of various genres in
the language of the American Indians from the 18th century to the present day. The companion consists of seventeen chapters, each written by professional scholars, both Indigenous and non-Native Americans, Europeans, etc. This companion describes historical and cultural contexts and raises gender issues. A wide variety of authors and genres cover not only the 18 to 19th centuries but also the 20th century (Momaday, Silko, Welch, Ortiz, Vizenor, Erdrich, Harjo, Alexie), and the work includes biographies of forty authors. Complementary to the text are maps, chronology charts detailing Native American and American literature, and their links to important social, cultural, and historical events. According to Ray B. Browne: “[This book should have been titled] “Native American Writers” because it is concerned with the authors, not the literature. Limiting the discussion to full coverage of the literature of native and mixed-blood Americans, the volume is very useful” (Browne, 2006: 98-99).

Conclusion
Research on the presence of an identity crisis in the modern narrative of American Indians indicates that this problem is urgent. To search for signs of this issue, the study focused on the activities of 25 organisations that are designed to preserve the culture of Indigenous peoples, specifically to help in social and economic spheres. All these organisations support the preservation and transmission of values, heritage, and spiritual culture. Thus, by their very essence, they resist the crisis of identity in one way or another. This study analysed publications in nine scientific journals devoted to American Indian culture, which include approximately half a thousand articles and reviews. In a broad range of journal articles that covered different topics, from literary reviews to medical problems, the topic of identity crisis was pervasive, as illustrated by the examples mentioned. It was found that the overwhelming majority of materials directly or indirectly relate to the problem of the crisis, which indicates the need for fundamental research in this area to mitigate the crisis.

References


This paper aims to analyze the current situation with EMI (English as a medium of instruction) teaching in Ukrainian universities. The author outlines the main challenges that teachers and students face and provides certain suggestions on how to address the existing challenges, preserve and improve the efficiency of EMI teaching in Ukraine. In the course of the research, the author relies on his own EMI teaching experience and describes and generalizes the experience and solutions offered by the colleagues. The author claims that EMI teaching nowadays has become one of the key elements of the strategy for the internationalization of higher education in Ukraine. More and more Ukrainian universities offer EMI bachelor and master programs which are very popular among international students from various countries. However, effective and rapid switch to EMI teaching turns out to be problematic for most of the universities because they are lacking in teachers with sufficient English proficiency and academic mobility experience. To improve the quality of EMI teaching in the nearest future mentioned two features have to be prioritised and supported by the respective higher education institutions. The author also claims that another important factor that significantly influences the efficiency of EMI teaching is the low English proficiency of the international students. Most of the international students have CEFR level B1, which is consistent with the current enrollment requirements of most universities but turns out to be insufficient for the comprehension of most study materials. The author suggests that changing enrollment requirements to CEFR B2 and adding international language certification to it could help to avoid numerous challenges and complications. As the practical suggestion for teaching philosophical subjects in English, the author, generalizing his own EMI teaching experience, describes the possible strategy of curriculum development and provides some recommendations on topic choice and strategies for teaching philosophical courses in English.

Keywords: English as a medium of instruction, curriculum development methodology, internationalization of higher education in Ukraine, international students, teaching philosophy

Received: 19 August 2021 / Accepted: 1 October 2021 / Published: 15 November 2021
Introduction

Currently, Ukrainian education and science undergo a substantial transformation due to the recently enacted legislation. Internationalization of higher education appears to be of great importance within the strategy of pro-European reforms in this field. Increasing the share of international students in the universities is a commonly accepted and important milestone on the way of efficient internationalization (Knight, 2008: 3). Keeping this in view, most Ukrainian universities, both private and owned by a state, became much friendlier and open for international students in recent years. Preparatory departments that provide preliminary Ukrainian language and culture classes, lower entry requirements, comfortable accommodation, and paperwork support – all of those benefits increase the competitiveness of Ukrainian universities dramatically (Liashenko, 2018; Nelipa et al., 2018).

Particular financial and political factors explain why Ukraine attracts more and more international students every year. Ukrainian universities offer a good quality higher education for a relatively lower price if compared to the similar bachelor and master programs of European and Asian universities. Ukrainian university diplomas are also recognized by many countries all over the world and in most cases, graduates will not need to do any further recertification.

Another strategy of marketing and making “customer acquisition” for the Universities easier is an implementation of subject teaching in foreign languages. The geographical location of Ukraine in the middle of Eurasia and the intersection of the eastern and western cultures have numerous advantages for the prospective internationalization of higher education. Bilingualism inherited from being a part of the Soviet Union (Csernicskó; Máté, 2017; Besters-Dilger, 2009) appears to be one of them when it comes to accessibility of Ukrainian education for the residents of all the ex-Soviet countries as well as the former countries of Warsaw Pact. University programs delivered in Russian for the first 20 years of independence had been the only alternative to Ukrainian programs offered for foreigners. Nowadays, more and more Universities decide to incorporate the advantages of teaching in English into their educational practices. Such a step allows broadening the scope of prospective international students and developing international mobility. As a result, subject teaching in English becomes in increasing demand. However, it also appears to be a serious challenge both for the administration of the Universities and their teaching staff because the employment of such teaching in the circumstances of Ukraine is a complex and long-term problem. In the author’s opinion, the possible solution for this problem might be the accumulation and analysis of the existing experience, which unfortunately remains poor.

This article aims to generalize and describe the experience of teaching Philosophy in English for the international undergraduates and Ph.D. students of different majors (International Law, International Business, Software Engineering, Linguistics, etc.) at Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv and State University of Infrastructure and Technology. Since there is a substantial increase in the number of international students in Ukrainian universities in the last several years, sharing this experience may be up to date and beneficial for stakeholders such as teachers of arts and humanities who are about to begin working with an international audience or administration staff who are involved in planning and improving study programs. In the article, we will discuss the following points. Teachers’ skills are needed to deliver a particular subject in English. Command of English and teacher-student communication. Philosophy syllabus and topic choice that matches with international students’ needs.
English as a Medium of Instruction. Challenges for the Teachers

First, we would like to focus on the required skills that EMI (English as a Medium of Instruction) teachers must have and challenges that they have to cope with in course of their work. Most of them are in the frames of English language proficiency and EMI teaching experience. Concerning the former, the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine recommends the CEFR level C1 and considers CEFR level B2 to be a minimal requirement. The latter is mostly a matter of academic mobility and exchange. Obtaining those skills up to the appropriate level sufficient for EMI turns out to be problematic in Ukrainian circumstances.

In the 2020 “English Proficiency Index” (Education First, 2020), Ukraine was ranked 44 of the 100 countries included. Such rank means that the level of English proficiency in Ukraine is moderate on the scale of “Very High – High – Moderate – Low – Very Low.” “Low” level is consistent with CEFR level B1. In comparison, neighbouring Poland holds the rank of 16 and pertains to the countries with a “high” (CEFR B1+) level of English proficiency. Unfortunately, we must admit that there is no positive tendency in moving to the top of the rankings. In 2017 Ukraine was ranked 41st of 71 countries, in 2018 – 43 of 88 countries, and 2019 – 49 of 100. For several recent years, Ukraine either remains on the same level or moves towards the bottom of the list of ranked countries. The conclusions that could be driven from this tendency and figures are that the efficiency of teaching English at all levels of education in Ukraine is not sufficient. Such insufficiency could be partially explained by the English proficiency level of EGP/ESP teachers in Ukraine. According to a recent study conducted by British Council on this matter, only 61 per cent of ESP teachers of each of the 15 participating Ukrainian universities demonstrated the CEFR level C as a result of the “Aptis” test. 39% of tested teachers did not reach that level, and 4 per cent were tested at the CEFR level A2/B1. At the same time commonly, recognized European standards of English proficiency for EGP/ESP teachers are C1 for secondary school and C2 for higher education institutions. (Bolitho & West 2017: 32-39) The report also states that the certain official Ministry standard has not been established yet.

As a result, when it comes to EMI teaching, obtaining a proficiency level higher than B1/B2 appears to be a matter of self-education and essential expenses from the teachers end. The bare-bones budget of most Ukrainian teachers prevents them from taking effective and expensive classes in private language schools. (Monthly payment for such classes may take up to 20% of the total teacher’s monthly income)\(^1\) Moreover, language self-study is a time-consuming endeavour impossible for many teachers due to their workload. Accordingly, a large amount of EMI teachers cannot improve their English proficiency what is confirmed by the statistics presented in the aforementioned British Council study. The study has shown that the average level of English proficiency among the EMI teachers of the 15 most representative higher educational institutions of Ukraine is between B1 and B2 CEFR. An only a small proportion of the EMI teachers had shown the level C1.

Under such circumstances, most of the EMI teachers have to perform “learning by doing,” improving their level of proficiency in course of teaching. Such a way of dealing with the problem may give a positive outcome, but at the same time, it may affect the quality of the classes delivered in English. Key recommendations that the organizers of the “English

\(^1\) The approximate monthly salary of a Ukrainian EMI teacher is between 10000 and 20000 UAH. The average price for the semester of study (4 months) in the leading language schools in Kyiv (British Council, Cambridge First Educational Center, etc.) is about 12000 UAH.
Proficiency Index” give to the higher education institutions aiming to contribute to the general English proficiency improvement are:

a) “Teach English using a communication-based methodology.

b) Give students frequent opportunities to speak English through activities like English clubs, theme days, classroom twinning, school trips, and guest speakers.

c) Provide a forum for teachers to share best practices and get advice about teaching English effectively.

d) Give teachers a straightforward path to improve their own English.

e) Include English language requirements for all university majors.

f) Allow subject classes to be taught in English if both the students and the professor meet the requisite English level” (Education First, 2019: 43).

In the author’s opinion, taking into account the present situation of Ukraine, we still have a lot of things to do, especially about recommendations 4 and 6. The fulfillment of mentioned recommendations will allow breaking the vicious circle of English proficiency limitations in a more fast and effective way.

The lack of experience appears to be the second major challenge that may be faced by the EMI teachers. By this, we mean not only the active EMI teaching experience which in most cases is completely absent but the “passive” experience of being involved in the professional activity performed in English as well. Academic mobility, a common thing for European and American education and science, is the only efficient way for prospective EMI teachers to acquire the essential skills by observing and practising under the supervision of experienced foreign colleagues. In our opinion, there are at least two obstacles on the way of using this opportunity by Ukrainian teachers. First is a pandemic of COVID-19 that led to a suspension of numerous international mobility programs. The second is legislation issues that make the process of mobility approval too complicated and time-consuming. For the last several years Ukrainian government has improved many regulations in this field, but there are a lot of changes that still must be implemented to make the overall process simpler and more efficient. In the meantime, the only option that is available for those teachers who would like to improve their EMI teaching skills is online video courses on either specialized online platform (“Coursera,” “GetSmarter,” “Udemy,” etc.) or YouTube. Taking such courses will provide EMI teachers with useful, practical examples to creatively follow in their future teaching. On the other hand, active practice is also a crucial part. Our experience has shown that switching to English in all possible research activities such as academic publications, conference speeches, panel discussions, etc. not only helps with breaking the wall of isolation within certain local research paradigms but also with English fluency improvement. The same could be mentioned regarding using English translations of any specialized literature needed for teaching and research as primary in case reading the original text is not possible.

Command of English and teacher-student communication

Sufficient English proficiency is important not only for EMI teachers but also for students enrolled in the course. Students’ proficiency limitations can substantially impact the efficiency of teaching.

After seven years of EMI teaching experience in different higher educational institutions in Ukraine, we must admit that the English proficiency of international students in Ukraine is
not always sufficient for effective participation in the learning activities. The vast majority of international students of non-linguistic majors could be placed between B1 and B2 (CEFR) in terms of their English proficiency. However, within a single academic group, there could be students with A2. The level of C1 is common mainly for the student whose major is linguistics. For other majors, it appears to be rather a rear case. Moreover, the majority of the international students demonstrate inconsistency in levels of different language skills. For instance, their reading skills may be at B1 while speaking, listening, and writing at A1-A2.

In our opinion, the reason why such a situation occurs is that most of the universities in Ukraine do not require international students to provide proof of their English proficiency, such as international language proficiency certificates (ILTS, TOEFL, FCE, etc.) Entrants’ proficiency is mostly being verified by universities themselves during the entry exams and enrollment. International certificates, on the other hand, can guarantee the consistency of all the students’ language skills and the accuracy of the certified level.

Another reason is relatively low language proficiency entry requirements (Level B1 CEFR) that in most cases prove themselves not to be sufficient for the subjects being taught. In the case of philosophy and other humanities, the linguistic complexity of the study materials is far beyond the skills and vocabulary range of CEFR level B1.

Considering such a peculiarity almost every EMI teacher in Ukraine faces, to make the teaching more efficient, it is strongly recommended to begin with the English proficiency placement test. It can be performed both in oral and written form depending on the skill which is more required for completing the assignments of the course. In the case of the philosophy course, which consists mainly of speaking and reading activities, a short oral task that initiates the discussion within the group of students can provide a clear picture of the student’s English proficiency level for the teacher. In our case, we begin the course with a short impromptu presentation that students do to introduce themselves and talk about their experience in philosophy.

Arranging such kind of placement tests is not the only complication that appears to be effort and time-consuming. Limited students’ English proficiency implies other repercussions for the teacher themself and the general flow of student-teacher interaction. First of all, such a course requires a curriculum, specially designed to address mentioned proficiency peculiarity. A teacher has to spend extra time looking for and creating teaching materials of different complexity as well as developing various strategies of materials delivery and explanation. Choosing the easiest materials and the easiest way of presenting them is not always a good option because it would not be able to address the needs of students with higher language proficiency. Moreover, teachers have to spend at least half the time more on feedback and noticing, asking and addressing questions and changing strategies after each point of a lesson to make sure that students with low English proficiency are still in the loop of the material being taught. In fact, instead of developing one general curriculum, the EMI teacher must come up with at least three “regular,” “simplified,” and “the simplest” versions in terms of vocabulary and grammar used.

Limited proficiency also substantially impacts students’ performance in the classroom. Along with studying the subject itself, they must do a significant amount of English learning. On the one hand, it might seem beneficial in terms of consistent language skills improvement. On the other hand, the drawbacks of such a “steep learning curve,” in our opinion, outweigh the benefits. For students with A2-B1 CEFR levels, such an approach may become too overwhelming, preventing them from acquiring the necessary volume of skills and knowledge.
in all courses. For philosophy courses, in particular, lack of proficiency leads to poor student-teacher and student-student interaction in the classroom. Students limit their presentations mainly to reading out loud the materials they found on the internet or recommended sources instead of creatively reporting their research results and opinions regarding the topic. The same goes for the written assignments. Most of the materials students hand in turn out to be copied and pasted fragments from different sources.

**Philosophy Curriculum and Topic Choice for International Students**

Taking into account all mentioned above, efficient teaching philosophical disciplines and other humanities in English requires special teaching and communication strategies. This section of the paper is focused on some of them developed and successfully practised by EMI teachers. First, we will dwell on the topic choice for the philosophy curriculum developed for international students of non-philosophical majors (International Law, International Business, Linguistics, IT technologies, etc.) Next, we will describe two existing student books for teaching international students.

Dwelling on the topic choice for the philosophy curriculum, we mainly rely on our curriculum development and teaching experience for international students of the majors listed above. After two years of teaching, it became clear that topics selection for international students will be different from the one we’ve been using for Ukrainian students. Keeping in mind English proficiency limitations, cultural and religious differences of the international students, some of the topics had to be adjusted, simplified, added, or extracted. Students have shown more interest in the history of philosophy as well as the possible ways of the practical application of their knowledge. That is why the historic part of the course had to be expanded and references to the history of philosophy and history of culture added to the theoretical components of each topic. Since there are two types of classes within the course (lectures and discussion classes), it makes sense to approach the theoretical part during discussions. In contrast, the historical part is better approached in the form of an interactive lecture. Establishing the balance between theory and history this way made the course more accessible for approaching by students. The increase of accessibility was proved by the increased number of students involved in the discussion of every topic (70-80% after the changes in comparison to 40-50% before the changes) and better assessment results.

Typical philosophy course in most Ukrainian universities consists of 15 lectures and 15 practical classes. Here are some ideas on the EMI philosophy curriculum composition that may make the approach of the subject easier for the international students. In our opinion, the introductory topic should be presented as the set of answers to the questions that every student may ask about studying philosophy. One of the good examples of such a Q&A introduction to philosophy was given by Nigel Warburton in his book “Philosophy: the basics” (Warburton, 2013). Next topic that can help students effectively comprehend the variety of possible questions that are in the scope of philosophy we devote to the description of its main subfields. Among various subfields that we describe, more attention is being paid to metaphysics, epistemology, ethics, aesthetics, and logic. The next topic introduces the concept of the worldview from theoretical (definitions) and practical (presentation of historical types of the worldview: myth, religion, science) perspective. Several following lectures and discussion classes we usually devote to the brief overview of the history of philosophy. The practice has shown that introducing myth, religion, science, and philosophy is not just a mere definition
but as the historical types of the worldview with the cultural references makes it easier for the students to comprehend the peculiarities of each period of the history of philosophy. After the history of philosophy, we recommend moving to the selection of topics all titled “Philosophy of...”. We noticed that for some reason, topics “Philosophy of religion,” “Philosophy of art,” “Political philosophy,” “Philosophy of law” draw more students attention and interest than for instance, topics “Philosophy of mind,” “Philosophy of science” and “Philosophy of language.”

As for the study materials and sources, taking into account limitations with English proficiency, the good option would be to add links to short video lectures with subtitles to each topic. The amount and complexity of reading should also be carefully considered because there is a high chance that for most of the students in the group, the successful accomplishment of the reading assignment may turn out to be impossible.

A working option to address such an issue with reading assignments is the composition of the special student books. As successful examples, we would like to mention two recent student books designed to address most of the above-mentioned linguistic challenges and facilitate EMI teaching of philosophical courses.

First is a student book, “Lectures in the History of Ukrainian Culture,” by professor Sergii Rudenko (Rudenko, 2019). The composition and the content of this book allow the student to easily comprehend the minimal required amount of information. In terms of language complexity, it has been designed in a way that students with levels B1-B2 will not have critical difficulties when working with it. Apart from addressing the supportive needs of the course itself, according to the author’s idea, this student book is also designed to assist with students’ English proficiency improvement. In this regard, professor Rudenko claims the following “In our humble opinion, there is one more advantage of this book for a wide range of non-English speaking readers from the lexical point of view. This book also could be useful as a glossary of English equivalents of typical and the most representative objects (pieces of art, religious, educational, scientific movements, etc.) of Ukrainian culture” (Rudenko, 2019: 5-6). As for the students with a better command of English, this book provides them with a brief schematic outline of the main topics as well as with profound recommendations on further reading.

The second example is a student book, “Analytic Philosophy and Philosophy of Language,” written by Dr. Oleksandr Kylyk (Kulyk, 2018). As it could be seen from the introductory notes, the original idea for this book was to make it useful both for subject studying and English learning simultaneously. The author chooses the so-called “Hard-CLIL” (Content and language integrated learning (Ball, 2016)) methodology for the composition and presentation of the materials in the book. He explains that in the following lines. “There are two kinds of CLIL techniques: one is a language-led approach; the other is content-led. The term “Soft CLIL” is used to describe supporting content learning in language classes; the term “Hard CLIL” is for supporting language learning in content classes. My course is based on “Hard CLIL” (Kulyk, 2018: 8). Language learning purposes of this student book have been achieved by putting certain classroom content assignments in the form of language learning exercises that allow focusing on learning new vocabulary items along with content ideas of the philosophy of language. Dr. Kulyk claims that his student book has been designed to address the needs of students whose English proficiency level is B1+. However, the composition of the book and its further reading suggestions make it a convenient guide for higher proficiency students.
Conclusions

EMI teaching in Ukraine is a relatively recent phenomenon that due to its numerous peculiarities requires further attention and research. In this paper, we tried to generalize and describe our EMI teaching experience in the field of philosophy for international students. As a result, we can outline several important points and challenges that any EMI teacher should keep in view before and during his classroom work.

First, EMI teaching requires a certain level of English proficiency. In our opinion, it should be not less than CEFR C1, which is rather a rare case in the reality of Ukrainian higher education. To support such an opinion, we provided some figures from the “English Proficiency Index,” and recent British Council reports on EMI teaching in Ukraine. We must admit that the current professional training of prospective teachers in philosophy is not oriented toward further EMI teaching. This means that teachers who would like to teach their professional courses in English have to self-improve their command of English as well as revise all their knowledge and materials in English because translation is not the option. All those steps are effort-, time- and funds-consuming and unfortunately, teachers mainly have to deal with those challenges on their own. Certain obstacles with academic mobility, which is the only effective way of gaining the necessary EMI teaching experience, is another problematic factor. Gradual changes in the prospective teachers training programs, focus on English proficiency, providing better access to academic mobility and wider institutional and financial support could make the situation with EMI teaching in Ukraine better in the next decade.

We also discussed a problematic situation with the English proficiency of most international students in Ukrainian universities. Particularly the situation with the inconsistency of students’ fluency within the same academic group when levels could vary from A2 to C1. The average students’ level of B1, which is an entry requirement for most universities, appears to be not sufficient for comprehension of the materials of the course that makes the process of teaching challenging both for teachers and students. Teachers have to develop a special curriculum with the possibility to address the needs of students with a different command of English. Students, being not able to fully comprehend the study materials, can get only limited mastering of the course. To facilitate the teacher-student communication and increase the efficiency of EMI teaching, we suggest including international English proficiency certificates (TOEFL, IELTS, PET, FCE, etc.) in the list of entry requirements for EMI master and bachelor programs. In our opinion, the best long-term solution for this problem also would be establishing proficiency level B2 as the minimal enrollment language requirement.

Finally, we discussed peculiarities of the EMI philosophy curriculum development and shared our own experience on the possible topic choice and order based on the international students’ preferences. We also briefly discussed two recently published student books for EMI teaching of special philosophical courses written by professor Sergii Rudenko and Dr. Oleksandr Kulyk. We find those student books being successful attempts to address existing challenges, preserve and improve the quality of EMI teaching in Ukraine.

References


Ecofeminism and Social Ecology in Indian Context: Exploration in Customs, Cultures, and Religions

Amita Valmiki

Ph.D., Associate Professor, Ramniranjan Jhunjhunwala College of Arts, Science and Commerce, University of Mumbai (Mumbai, India)  
E-mail: amitavalmiki@gmail.com  
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1235-3730


The article makes an attempt to explore various social customs, cultures, and religions of India and revisit the concept of ecofeminism and social ecology, which seems to be a dire necessity in contemporary times, especially in the Indian context. India is a land of variegated customs, cultures, and religions. The diversity is not limited to these realms but incorporates multi-racial, multi-spatial, and multi-eras, the ancient, medieval, and contemporary history. The pattern is intricate as these factors affect the eco-diversity in both ways: unsympathetically and chancily. It is ostensibly witnessed that India suffers deplorably in the ecological rondo. Do we need a complete set of anticipatory hermeneutics of variegated Indian customs, cultures, and religions to convalesce the ecosystem? The answer is de-facto ‘yes’. The paper indubitably confesses the arrogance and disdain shown towards nature and ecology as a whole in the country that nurtures illogical axioms those which are maintained and adopted in the name of customs, cultures, and religions; and to offer a potent solution, if not to eradicate entirely but lessen the extravagant exploitation of natural resources and building stable ecological equity. Ecofeminism and Social Ecology can be taken to task to solve the grave ecological crisis that India encounters.

Keywords: ecofeminism, social ecology, India, cultural studies, religious studies.

Received: 29 August 2021 / Accepted: 20 October 2021 / Published: 15 November 2021
Introduction

“We are going to have a future where women lead the way to make peace with the Earth, or we are not going to have a human future at all,” said Vandana Shiva (Faith in the Face of Militarization, 2021: 112).

“Until society can be reclaimed by an undivided humanity that will use its collective wisdom, cultural achievements, technological innovations, scientific knowledge, and innate creativity for its own benefit and for that of the natural world, all ecological problems will have their roots in social problems,” said Murray Bookchin (The Murray Bookchin Rader, 1999: 53).

India holds a unique position on the global map. One’s diversity is one’s unique perceived benefit (UPB), and to sustain till date as one nation is her point of difference. The query remains, are we, as so-called Indians, at an advantage due to the unique diversity we live in? The question is a demanding one and the probe is inevitable in contemporary times. India’s enlightenment period dates almost back to the pre-historic era. The civilization is classical and in her evolutionary period, many changes, exchanges, and interchanges developed and continue hitherto. Indubitably it has its flavored richness and amelioration. But there is always a dark side of the moon, so every nation has her/his rear side, which is not always pleasant. So do with India. The land’s topography favored a variety of races, religions, clans, and tribes to move from their native lands and settle in India and the Indian sub-continent. Spheres of knowledge, customs, traditions, and faiths found suitable ground to establish themselves with the natives of Indian civilization. Today India is the second-most populous country in the world after China. But China’s boundaries are much wider than India’s, and the fact cannot be denied. Therefore, vistas of all spheres were enriched, for example, science, art, architecture, a system of education, the birth of new languages and dialects, and most potently, the religious diversity that was never ever devoid of philosophy. In India, ‘philosophy is religion and religion is philosophy.’ It would not be wrong to assert that all spheres of life are intertwined with religion, say it, India’s politics, social norms and customs, economics, social structure with its caste system, gender status and, in fact, all that is in India.

The intriguing fact is, though India is democratic, the ideals of democracy are indispensably knitted to religions (more authoritatively to majority religion). Obviously, the religion of the majority has its strong footing. Therefore Brahmanism (popularly known as Hinduism) so far has been magisterial. According to the 2011 census, the Hindu population is 79.80 %, Muslims are 14.23 %, Christians are 2.30 %, Sikhs are 1.72 %, and others (Buddhist, Jains, other tribal and not stated ones are in 0. something %) (Religion Data Census, 2011).

None of the cultures, races, traditions, and customs of different communities have maintained their authenticity. Hinduism rendered tremendous influence on other faith followers, and some fundamentalist time immemorial have been active instigating populace of the community to sustain the supremacy. Therefore, caste, religious ideology, and gender issues continue brewing, affecting the people’s social lives and has rendered cataclysm on the ecosystem, adversely affecting the green environment. Instead of nature’s pre-eminence, it is, on the contrary, the dominance of dogmatic ideology governing nature. When women are portrayed in a negative light, ‘nature’ being feminine is disparately exploited. And since the caste structure that has influenced all religious groups (though they have remained neutral originally), the attitude of dominance has always prevailed on the ecosystem. Precisely to maintain environmental ethics, the need for ecofeminism and social ecology is felt seriously.
Revisiting Ecofeminism in Indian Context

India, being a democratic country, people are free to practice any religion of their desire. And their ideology as one Indian Nation comprises of the philosophy of ‘religious tolerance.’ Precisely the word ‘tolerance’ has to be re-examined since how much one can tolerate, especially in the matter of religion. After seventy years of Indian independence (from the British rule), India as a nation gradually moved towards an intolerant nation, camouflaging herself as ‘going back to one’s origin’ ideology. So, more the majority have realized the potency to be authoritative, more medieval deteriorating social norms in relation to gender are seriously upheld. The position of women in India has always taken a backseat, and nature is seen in parallel to feminine gender also has taken a backseat.

Though women in Hindu scriptures (and other than Hindu religious scriptures) have been respected, reverence has been part and parcel only in scriptures, not in praxis. ‘She’ is considered as Shakti (Divine Power) in Hindu philosophy, as noted by Kinsley, “Sakti [shakti] means “power”; in Hindu philosophy and theology sakti is understood to be the active dimension of the Godhead, the divine power that underlies the godhead’s ability to create the world and to display itself… (…) It is quite common, furthermore, to identify sakti with a female being, a goddess, and to identify the other pole with her male consort. The two poles are usually understood to be interdependent and to have relatively equal status in terms of the divine economy.” (Kinsley, 1986: 133) The Samkhya school of Indian philosophy designates equal prominence to Purusha (Soul or Self, the Male counterpart of the Divine Female) and Prakriti (Matter/Nature, the Female counter part of the Male, Conscious Self); and the Universe is the composite of both, Male and Female. But, not to ignore, ‘She’ is still Unconscious Matter / Nature with modes or attributes that make her high or low. Axiomatically ‘she’ tends to be somewhere inferior to the male. The only sect of Hinduism, Shaktism, where the Divine Shakti, the Power of the Feminine is worshipped. According to scholars like Arthur Basham, it was pre-Aryan times that Shakti worship was popular in India, namely the Indus Valley civilization dates back to ca. 3300 BCE. The entry of the Aryan migration to India and was believed to have patriarchal culture, gave way to male dominance (Basham, 1967; 313). With the popularity of the Aryan establishment, Indian society experienced a complete metamorphosis.

Even deterioration in the position of women in Indian society came through The Manu Smriti (The Laws of Manu or The Dharma [Duty] Text of Manu) (ca. 100 CE). Even today, the text holds an authoritative position in Hindu society that lives in the majority. Though in some verses of the text, a woman is revered, there are an ample number of examples where she is positioned on the dicey ground. As Ghatak notes, “With respect to the purpose of a woman’s life, the scripture affirms: ‘Woman was created for procreation.’ Chapter III of the same scripture avers: ‘By a girl, by a young woman, even by an aged one, nothing must be done independently, even in her own home.’ Accordingly, it is stated that: ‘In childhood, a female must be subject to her father, in youth to her husband, in widowhood to her sons; a woman must never be independent’ (Ghatak, 2012: 71).

This is immediately translated to ‘nature,’ and the law transforms from a female individual to Prakriti, ‘nature’. Nature is for procreation and is meant for that; nature remains inferior to human beings as women are inferior to men. The ways in which the patriarchal cum capitalist societies have treated women cum nature establish the monocultures. The supremacy of ‘men as gender’ in society has had its horrendous impact on women and nature in simultaneity.

After the Mughal and later the British invasion, India added positive and negative elements
to its already misunderstood culture. The Judeo-Christian view and the Islamic view on ‘nature’ was equally taken out of context; and instead of ‘stewardship’ as human being’s duty to take care of everything, including nature and all is God’s creation, was overtaken by the view that God created nature for human beings’ benefit; and to add fuel to this view the verse from Genesis 1:28, ‘To fill the earth and subdue it’ again gave power for a human being to dominate the earth. So, the concept of ‘stewardship’ remained vague and in the name of progress ‘nature’ was and is always being exploited. This also echoed in the treatment given to women as most people who got converted to these religions followed the old customs of the Dharma Shashtra [Test] to treat women as low, corresponding to ‘nature’ as low.

At this juncture, the necessity of ecofeminism is seriously felt. According to Geetika Khanduja, “Ecofeminism can be defined as a movement that sees a connection between the exploitation and degradation of the natural world and the subordination and oppression of women” (Khanduja, 2017: 105). After various conferences and workshops by academicians and women in various professions in the late 1970s in the United States that ‘ecofeminism’ took birth. These ecofeminists confirmed the ideology that women have to end their dominance on nature to liberate themselves. Theologian Rosemary Radford Ruether believed that the concept of sin needs to be separated from finitude, and she reiterates the point that matter is always understood as low, for her matter should not be equated with evil. In alliance with theologian St. Augustine and Paul Ricoeur, Ruether agrees to the Original Sin concept but interpreted (hermeneutics intended) the Biblical version not in biological inheritance but historical inheritance by not obeying the commands of God to maintain purity (of the environment as well). Humans have sinned against nature by hazardous use of nature’s resources. And it should be well kept in mind, as Ruether noted, the sin should not be attributed to Eve but to human beings in general. Since the patriarchal mentality always has attributed the sin to Eve, and ecofeminist broke this stereotyped patriarchal mentality of attributing all sinful acts to Eve, whatever and whosoever, those who belong to the feminine gender, are also considered low. This finds its immediate translation towards nature (Wiley, 2002: 175-176).

This seems to have a connection to Indian customs, cultures, and religious traditions taken dogmatically. Women have always been placed as subordinate to men, and unless this has not been lifted or erased completely, the exploitation of women and nature will continue. Vandana Shiva, an eminent ecofeminist, has been working on breaking this androcentric attitude prevalent in Indian society (as noted earlier) in Christian society. In her book Monocultures of the Mind (1993), she has noted that Western cultures, especially the imperialists’ attitude which are deep-rooted now in their colonies, have underestimated the indigenous cultures and traditions of the local regions, and local areas have very easily adapted to the Western ideology of globalization and capitalism that is male-oriented. There women and nature have always been utilized for one’s benefit. This ideology finds its support from intellectualizing the religious scriptures and the dharma laws that underestimate the image of women, so also of nature. Therefore, the concept of ‘dominance’ has seeped too deep in the Indian soil that is wrapped over nature, to control nature and maintain the hedonistic stance in a psychological sense. It has turned out to be too dangerous, resulting in an ecological crisis. To establish equality is society can and will restore ecological balance. According to Shiva, “Diversity is an alternative to monoculture, homogeneity and uniformity. Living diversity in nature corresponds to living diversity of cultures. The natural and cultural diversity is a source of wealth and a source of alternatives” (Shiva, 1997: 7). Shiva believes women work in the field, women consume what is grown on the field, but at the same time, women importantly contribute to growing what they grow. Though
Shiva is strongly criticized for being ‘essentialist’ and ‘anti-westernization’; but her philosophy needs to be interpreted in light of imperialism, colonization, and capitalism. Though Indian mythologies and religious scriptures are full of praises for woman, defining her as Mother Earth, the Divine Power behind this Universe, but the Laws of Manu that is in practice that vitiates the Indian scenario. So, when we discuss Hinduism giving sacred place to Mother Earth and women considered as Divine Power, we have to clarify which Hinduism is one talking about! Is the Laws of Manu or ‘the Vedic injunction of worshipping female power and nature and her forces in tandem’ – that is first to be sorted out.

It is but obvious that if Indian society opts for philosophy of equality and translates this philosophy into praxis, erasing the age-old customs of dominance and patriarchal culture that is found in dogmatically adopting of the Dharma Shastras (the theological legal treatises of Hinduism) or the Laws of Manu, an ecological crisis can be lessened and ultimately solved.

**Revisiting Social Ecology in Indian Context**

Social ecology is quite in vogue in contemporary times as the present ecological crisis is seen to be a deduction of all our social issues. Therefore, social ecology categorically depends upon the external and, more particularly, though not seen on the surface, but felt deeply in the Indian context, as an internal condition. India lives in her diversities of cultures, races, religions, customs, tribes/clans, and languages. As noted in the former sub-topic of this article, there are many kinds of discrimination strictly followed, though the British rule either diluted or completely erased them legally; but under the name of tradition and ‘rich heritage’ of India, these customs were followed. Oriental religions in India comprise Brahmanism (Hinduism), Jainism, Buddhism, and Sikhism. The foreign religions, Zoroastrianism, Judaism, Christianity and Islam, became and are part-n-parcel of India. They also have maintained a distinct Indian identity. And one important aspect is India’s large section is agrarian living in rural regions. So, these rural societies are still struggling to elevate the standard to living. They lack basic amenities like education, health facilities, hygiene, basic infrastructure like proper conveyance facilities, roads, houses, etc. On the physical front, any which ways they lag behind, even if the village is sparsely populated or dense. Above all these difficulties, social structures like caste, class, race, religion, and gender discrimination still prevail. These social issues are the main cause of the ecological crisis. Intercepting at this juncture, the social ecology of Murray Bookchin is essential. According to Bookchin, segregating social issues from ecological issues is a grave mistake and needs to be rectified. They are intrinsically connected. As Bookchin notes, “Social ecology is based on the conviction that nearly all of our present ecological problems originate in deep-seated social problems. It follows, from this view, that these ecological problems cannot be understood, let alone solved, without a careful understanding of our existing society and the irrationalities that dominate it. To make this point more concrete: economic, ethnic, cultural, and gender conflicts, among many others, lie at the core of the most serious ecological dislocations we face today – apart, to be sure, from those that are produced by natural catastrophes” (Bookchin, 2007a: 19).

For most environmentalists, issues are related to nature, say, for example, deforestation, climate change, global warming, pollutions of all types – noise, air, water, soil, etc.; if eradicated, ecological balance can be restored. This is a myth, according to Bookchin. These ecological issues cannot be removed by improving and balancing our eco-bio-diversity, but these problems are deep-rooted in our customs and traditions, which over the passage of years have been followed with observing the social evolution of human beings. The hierarchical structure of the
society gives the plutocrats and capitalists to maintain their supremacy as God bestowed gifts (in the Indian context), and therefore, they have the right to dominate other human beings and other human beings creatures. At the same time, the attitude and aptitude of these plutocrats continue even over nature and her resources. De facto, the social issues are needed to be solved first. This will, as a matter of fact, solve the ecological crisis.

The caste system in India has been deeply ingrained in the minds of Indians. Many environmentalists resolutely believe there is an urgent need for a philosophical system that comprehends the connection of the environment to social customs and traditions. The Dalits (were known to be untouchables), the subaltern communities of women, tribals, ethnic groups, dialects’ group – have directly related to either upholding environmental ethics or maintaining ecological balance that is much needed in every society. But they are always a neglected lot, vulnerable to criticism as outlaws or weak or impoverished. In fact, they are straight away inbuilt in our natural world. The capitalists and the upper caste (mainly the Brahmin caste) have underestimated their contribution though they have immensely contributed to preserving nature. The tribals (called Adivasis, meaning the settlers before the Aryans entered India, the aboriginal or first natives) have their laws that benefit nature, their medicine system, their nature befitting science and economy, including their polity is environment friendly. But the upper layer of Indian society has always suppressed them and uprooted them by destroying forests and the natural environment. These subalterns never had their say in framing economics, politics, social norms, regulations, or science policies. They are the oppressed a lot, those who have no say in anything. This is an age-old tradition that goes on and on.

The same echo one can hear among suppressed lower castes and the Dalits in India. Since the caste system is justified in scriptural work, at the same time is justified through nature, the elite remains on the apex forever, undermining the lives of these subalterns. Through this, they control the economy and political sphere. By this, the culture of capitalism develops. This is a big setback for the environment as industries grow and the power structure of dominance allows the decision-making in the hands of few. Such contaminated and untoward practices infringe ‘laws of nature, consequentially bringing forth ecological crisis. Therefore, according to Bookchin, social ecology is a means to adopt the philosophy of ‘communalism.’ ‘Communalism as defined as a theory or system of government according to which each commune is virtually an independent state and the nation is merely a federation of such states.’ (Dictionary.com, 2021). It thereby implies that the political structure of any nation is directly and explicitly in correlation with the economy of the society.

Therefore, restructuring our social organization is the need of the hour. This restructuring will bring a paradigm shift in our political and economic policymaking. He believed that society is destroyed systematically by having market orientation and the competitive mandate of ‘either grow or die’ policy. As Bookchin writes, “Any attempt to solve the ecological crisis within a bourgeois framework must be dismissed as chimerical. Capitalism is inherently anti-ecological… The destruction of the natural world, for being the result of mere hubristic blunders, follows inexorably from the very logic of capitalist production.” (Bereano, 1976; 140) Few examples of that can be quoted concerning consequences of capitalistic hierarchical approach, those which are the cause of concern in India, are as follows:

- Tehri dam disaster. [Uttarakhand, India]
- The Narmada Controversy (Sardar Sarovar dam). [Navagam, Gujarat].
- Clearing major forest region at Aarey Milk Colony creating space for Mumbai Metro line, Mumbai, India.
• Illegal coal mining in Meghalaya, mica mining in Jharkhand, Dhanbad coal mine mafias in India.
• Deforestation in Jharkhand and evacuation of tribals or shifting or establishing urban lifestyle that uproots the authentic ethnic groups and their culture.

Bookchin believes the mentality of supportiveness is needed rather than the attitude of dominance. And exactly the converse mentality prevails among the bureaucrats and state politicians, those who have undermined the importance of human lives, other than human species and natural wealth. “Thus, in its call for a collective effort to change society, social ecology has never eschewed the need for a radically new spirituality or mentality. As early as 1965, the first public statement to advance the ideas of social ecology concluded with the injunction: ‘The cast of minds that today organizes differences among human and other life-forms along hierarchical lines of ‘supremacy’, or ‘inferiority’ will give way to an outlook that deals with diversity in an ecological manner – that is, according to an ethics of complementarity’ (Bookchin, 2007).

Conclusion

Indeed, India, the second most populated nation in the world, is not just facing problems on the economy or political forefront, but has to deal with fundamental and ground-level problems to satisfy the necessities of food, clothing, and shelter. In all these difficulties, the environmental issues are often side-lined. The ecological crisis needs immediate attention, or we will be extinct as a species. Obviously, India needs both remedial measures to be implemented strictly, namely ecofeminism and social ecology. The following quote by Nobel laureate Amartya Sen becomes pertinent at this juncture, “As competent human beings, we cannot neglect the task of judging how things are and what needs to be done. As reflective creatures, we have the ability to contemplate the lives of others. Our sense of behavior may have caused (though that can be very important as well), but can also relate more generally to the miseries that we see around us and that lie within our power to help remedy” (Sen, 2001: 283).

Ecofeminism and Social Ecology in the Indian context need to be established as the variegated customs, cultures, and religions have somehow contributed to environmental degradation. Since ‘nature’ is considered female, and as the Laws of Manu in some verses does not speak high about women, on the contrary commands to control women; therefore, the patriarchal social structure of dominance immediately translates towards nature. This is also what social ecology claims, to restructure our social customs, cultures, and religions that axiomatically will lead to environmental ethics to maintain ecological balance. In fact, Hinduism proclaims Nature as the revered Divine Power of God to create the world, and the pantheistic view of Non-Dualistic Philosophy too considers everyone equal; unfortunately, the scriptures need to be reinterpreted in the present context. However, Bookchin is firm not to associate ecological issues with super-natural or with spirituality but to be rational enough by restructuring the society to move on the path of anti-capitalistic and anti-dominance systems. As Michael Parenti notes, “Ecology’s implications for capitalism are too momentous for the capitalist to contemplate. The plutocrats are more wedded to their wealth than to the Earth upon which they live, more concerned with the fate of their fortunes than with the fate of humanity. The present ecological crisis has been created by the few at the expense of the many.” (Parenti, 2007: 97).

The idea of dominance over nature by human beings stems from the dominance of human beings over human beings; let us eradicate the notion of dominance and hierarchy of human beings over another human being in society. This will reduce the exploitation of nature. We need
to establish ‘libertarian socialism’; and political ideology of ‘Communalism’ [i.e., A modern definition of social ecology understands it as the interactions within the social, institutional, and cultural contexts of people-environment relations that make up well-being; and to develop interdependencies of social systems]. Last but not least, especially in the Indian context, we need to ‘re-spiritize of the natural world.’

**References**


A Study of the History of Chinese Philosophy in Independent Ukraine: The Sinological Experience of Kyiv Universities in the Late 20th and Early 21st Centuries

Heorhii Vdovychenko

Doctor of Philosophical Sciences, Associate Professor, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv (Kyiv, Ukraine)
E-mail: georgyvdovychenko@knu.ua
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8532-7672


The article deals with the achievements of the development of domestic studies on the history of philosophical education, science and culture of China in the Kyiv universities of independent Ukraine. The thirtieth anniversary of the beginning of the entry of independent Ukraine, after the final collapse of the USSR in 1991, to world socio-political life as its full participant, is celebrated this year. This year, at the same time, marks a historic starting point for a qualitatively new stage of bilateral relations between Ukraine and the People’s Republic of China. A search of the history of China’s philosophy by Ukrainian scholars from the A. Yu. Krymskyi Institute of Oriental Studies of the National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine and the H. S. Skovoroda Institute of Philosophy of the National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine, as well as from a number of other relevant institutes, is extremely important in the growing cooperation of academic science and universities of these two countries. It is noteworthy that the significant contribution to this process of leading Ukrainian Orientalists V. Kiktenko, S. Kapranov and their colleagues from these institutes is closely linked with important achievements in the development of philosophical Chinese studies in a number of universities in the capital of Ukraine, such as the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv and Borys Grinchenko Kyiv University. The high scientific potential of V. Rezanenko, N. Kirnosova, O. Boichenko, G. Bokal, Y. Shekera, and some other Sinologists from the Institutes of Philology of both these universities and their other units, as well as the potential of their colleagues from the National University of “Kyiv-Mohyla Academy,” Vadym Hetman Kyiv National Economic University, the Kyiv National Linguistic University, is distinctly reflected in the proceedings of symposia and in the periodicals of the said universities.

Keywords: Chinese philosophy, modern Ukrainian studies, A. Yu. Krymskyi Institute of Oriental Studies, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv, V. Kiktenko, S. Kapranov, V. Rezanenko, N. Kirnosova, O. Boichenko, G. Bokal, Y. Shekera

© Vdovychenko, Heorhii, 2021
Introduction

The history of domestic studies in the history and culture of the Near, Middle, and the Far East began to be systematically explored by the community of Ukrainian Orientalists just after its independence, namely during the last three decades. The results of these searches were repeatedly covered in the papers of the staff of the A. Yu. Krymskyi Institute of Oriental Studies of the NAS of Ukraine in its periodicals, first of all in journals “The Oriental Studies” and “The World of the Orient.” The second of them published articles by E. Kovalyova, L. Matveeva, E. Tsygankova and T. Shcherban, which considered the emergence of modern domestic Oriental studies in a number of higher education institutions of the Russian Empire, and later – in the Ukrainian SSR, in particular in the form of the All-Ukrainian Scientific Association of Oriental Studies (1926 – 1931). At the same time, a number of essays on the history of the new Oriental studies in Ukraine by the head of the Asia-Pacific Department of the said institute, Doctor of Philosophy Viktor Kiktenko deserves special attention. It was just him, one of the founders and President of the Ukrainian Association of Sinologists, the author of two thorough monographs on the history of Ukrainian Chinese studies (Kiktenko, 2002; Kiktenko, 2018) and some papers on its modern progress, for example (Kiktenko, 2019), who together with his colleagues, in particular V. Rezanenko, S. Kapranov and Y. Shekera, laid the solid foundations of all modern domestic philosophical Chinese studies. Their scientific destinies are jointly connected with the development of these researches in well-known Kyiv universities, in particular with the activity of both the global network of Confucius Institutes and a number of Sinological centers, such as the Confucius School of Borys Grinchenko Kyiv University and Center for Oriental Studies of the National University of “Kyiv-Mohyla Academy” (NaUKMA). More than 30 years of virtuous educational and scientific activity of these scientists, their colleagues and students are presented both in collections of materials of numerous Chinese studies symposia and on columns of a number of authoritative and curious, though small-circulation periodicals. Their list ranges from the bulletin “Oriental Languages and Literatures” and the collection of works “Humanitarian Studies” of the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv and “Scientific Notes of NaUKMA” and “Magisterium” of the National University of “Kyiv-Mohyla Academy” to the collection of the scientific works “Ukrainian Oriental Studies” of the mentioned Confucius School. Thus, the purpose of this our research is to provide an overview of the main results of the development of studies on the history of philosophical education, science and culture of China in the universities of Kyiv in the era of independent Ukraine in the context of clarifying the content and specifics of modern domestic philosophical Sinology.
Republic of China (PRC), have always been strengthened, including educational, scientific and cultural ties. Over the last three decades, these relations have reached an unprecedented level of socio-cultural interaction. One of its most notable pages is active and fruitful cooperation of them in the humanities – education and science, started in January 1992, shortly after the establishment of diplomatic relations between Ukraine and PRC. The main participants in this interaction from the very beginning were the recently established then leading domestic scientific institution on Oriental studies, namely the A. Krymskyi Institute of Oriental Studies of the National Academy of Sciences (NAS) of Ukraine, as a research institute of the Department of History, Philosophy and Law of this academy, and the Institute of World Economy and International Relations of the NAS of Ukraine, founded in the 1991 and closed in November 2013 by the decision of the Presidium of NAS of Ukraine. It is noteworthy that the well-known researchers of both these institutes at that time, namely V. Kiktenko and Vladislav Sednev, together with their colleague Serhiy Geranin, formed an initiative group for the establishment in Kyiv in 2003 of the Public Association “Ukrainian Association of Sinologists.” Over the past two decades it has gained the status of a leading public center for the study of China and the development of Ukrainian-Chinese relations, especially in the field of education and science. Head of the Asia-Pacific Department of the first of the said institutes and Director of the Center for Contemporary China Tianxia Link LTD., V. Kiktenko is known as a leading modern representative of Chinese philosophical studies in Ukraine. He is also well-known as a co-organizer of the fourteen already traditional international scientific conferences “Chinese Civilization: Tradition and Modernity” held by this association in Kyiv in 2006-2020. At the same time, an important role in their establishment, as well as in laying the foundations of modern Ukrainian, in particular philosophical, Sinology in the leading Kyiv universities, was played by a doctoral student of the Institute of World Economy and International Relations of the NAS of Ukraine Vladyslav Sednev. Participant in the First Ukrainian-Chinese Scientific Conference “Ukraine-China” held in Kyiv in 1993, in particular, the author of the report “Development of Chinese Studies in Ukraine,” he joined the process in the 1980s as one of its initiators in Kyiv universities yet in Soviet time.

V. Sednev was one of the first outstanding lecturers of Oriental studies in independent Ukraine, who formed the image of modern Sinology in some capital’s universities, first as an Associate Professor of the Department of History and Law of Asia, Africa and Latin America at the Kyiv State University, and soon as Vice-Rector of the Department of Languages and Civilizations of the Far East at the Kyiv State Linguistic University. He was the author and co-author of a series of textbooks and articles published in Kyiv in the 1970s and 1980s on the history of Soviet-Chinese official relations, including those related to the history of Chinese culture. V. Sednev testified in them to the clear ideological transition of the Soviet power from a critical attitude to “Maoism” and foreign policy of PRC to a systematic reassessment of Soviet-Chinese relations due to Gorbachev’s “perestroika.” He also became one of the first domestic researchers of the phenomenon of PRC as a “global power” on the threshold of the third millennium, in particular, was the developer of Ukrainian-Chinese cooperation in the field of high technology. At the same time, he paid no less attention to the problem of studying Oriental languages in domestic universities in the light of considering the transition of these countries from the dialogue of pedagogical systems to the dialogue of cultures and civilizations. He devoted to this topic the section “Civilization Model of Modern China,” written by him for the second book of the final volume “Civilizations of the East in the Context of Globalization” (2008) of the collective monograph “Civilization Structure of the Modern World: in 3 Vol.”
Sednev and Kiktenko, as well as their colleagues from the mentioned academic institutes and universities, jointly determined by their educational and scientific activity in the early 1990s the establishment in the minds of the scientific community of Ukraine, domestic students and the general public of a fundamentally new image of PRC as one of Ukraine’s leading partners and one of the leading centers of civilizational development of mankind from ancient times to the present. Largely thanks to them, the demythologization of the attitude of the Ukrainian post-soviet public to China is carried out, due, not least, to the massive acquaintance of Ukrainians with the realities of socio-cultural life in PRC in the 1990s. This process contributed to the formation over the next two decades in the public consciousness of the citizens of Ukraine of a lasting positive image of China as a very important partner of our country in the field of education and science.

The emergence of a qualitatively new type of Ukrainian Orientalist, primarily, in our opinion, just a Sinologist, has become possible both in the domestic higher school, classical universities and in the alternative public educational and scientific space, not least due to the fruitful cooperation of academic scientists from a number of authoritative and, simultaneously, newly established universities in Kyiv from the 1970s to the present. No less significant in its duration and scientific significance than V. Sednev’s teaching work is V. Kiktenko’s active cooperation with such Kyiv universities as the East-West Institute of Kyiv National Linguistic University, the Institute of Oriental Linguistics and Law, International Solomon University (ISU), etc. It is noteworthy that the branch of domestic philosophical Chinese studies systematically developed by him is very effectively cultivated by the scientific staff of the H. S. Skovoroda Institute of Philosophy of the NAS of Ukraine, first of all by the staff of its Sector of History of Eastern Philosophy, Doctors of Philosophical Sciences Y. Zavgorodnyi and A. Strelkova, i.e., in a published by them collective monograph (Zavgorodnyi, 2013). Thanks to them, in 2006, the Society of Researchers of Oriental Philosophies was founded on the basis of this Sector, the main task of which is the development of philosophical Oriental studies as a new direction of the Ukrainian humanities. One of the most famous members of this society is a senior researcher of the A. Yu. Krymskyi Institute of Oriental Studies of the NAS of Ukraine and, at the same time, a researcher of the H. S. Skovoroda Institute of Philosophy of the NAS of Ukraine, Serhiy Kapranov. He, like his friend Y. Zavgorodnyi, is a graduate of NaUKMA and has been teaching at his alma mater and in ISU for a long time, and for some time, he was a lecturer at Kyiv University “Eastern World.” S. Kapranov, like V. Kiktenko, is one of the most authoritative and most published in Ukraine domestic researchers of philosophical education, science and culture of China and Japan from ancient times to the present. Studying Japanese civilization in its relations with a number of other cultures of the Ancient East as the author of papers on Sanskrit in the culture of Japanese Buddhism or on the main currents of Japanese Confucianism during the Edo period, he paid special attention to Taoism. This is clearly reflected, in particular, in his research on early European explanations of the Tao and the study of “Tao de Ching” in Europe in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, as well as in his speech in a TV program “Invasion” on “Taoism is the Path to Immortality” (the TV channel “Gamma”, February 26, 2016).

One of the most experienced Ukrainian Sinologists is a recognized specialist in Oriental Hieroglyphic Writing, Doctor of Philology Volodymyr Rezanenko, well-known lecturer at NaUKMA and Borys Grinchenko Kyiv University. Inspirer and co-founder of the Center for Oriental Studies of the NaUKMA, the initiator of the already traditionally held at the “Days of Science” of the university meetings of the scientific seminar “Source Studies in the Methodology
of Chinese Studies,” he is the creator and head of the Confucius School of Borys Grinchenko Kyiv University. Like S. Kapranov, V. Rezanenko combines his long-standing interest in the history, writing and culture of Japan with the study of Chinese philosophy and culture. Noted domestic public figure, head of the Ukrainian Association of Scientific, Technical and Cultural Cooperation with the countries of the Asia-Pacific region, he, since the 1970s, has been one of the first long-term researchers of the phenomena of Japanese and Chinese semantic and graphic writing. V. Rezanenko studies the topic of adequate interpretation of religious and philosophical teachings of China on the example of problems of the semantics of cyclic signs of the Taoist circle and the semantic-graphic structure of hieroglyphic symbols of the five elements of Chinese cosmogony, analyzing the principles of classical schools of Chinese philosophy through the prism of explanation internal forms of Chinese characters. Oleksandr Boichenko, Doctor of Philosophy, Scientist at the Center for Humanitarian Education of the NAS of Ukraine, was a much younger graduate of the very same university as V. Rezanenko. He studied the history of the same schools of Chinese philosophy in two dissertations defended by him in the alma mater: “The Relationship between Natural and Human as a Problem of Ancient Chinese Philosophy (Comparative Analysis of Taoist and Confucian Interpretations)” (2000) and “Statehood in Ancient Chinese Philosophy: Paradigms of Comprehension” (2012). No less significant achievement of this promising, but, unfortunately, deceased scholar, who was a condisciple of the author of this article in the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv during 1992 – 1997, is his last monograph (Boichenko, 2003) and a number of last articles devoted to the history of Confucianism, Legalism and Mohism.

Illustrious Sinologists Ganna Bokal and also, unfortunately, the late Yaroslava Shekera, both of whom are graduates, as well as their already said colleagues, of the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv, and the first studied at the Faculty of Philosophy, and the second – at the Institute of Philology, devoted themselves to teaching at the alma mater for almost the last two decades. G. Bokal is the author of interesting essays on the history of early Taoism (Bokal, 2010), Tibetan Buddhism, and, at the same time, on the history of ancient Indian philosophy in the professional philosophical periodicals of her native university. Curiously, she devoted the paper (Bokal, 2013) to the problem of clarifying the meaning of the concept “Eastern philosophy” in view of her assessment of the contribution of domestic Orientalists to awareness of such Oriental “lines of philosophical culture” as “Indo-Vedic” and “Chinese-Confucian”. Y. Shekera initiated three major Chinese studies projects in alma mater, f.e. organized a textbook of Chinese literature of the third and sixth centuries, “Philosophical Poetry of Medieval China” (2010) and wrote a textbook on the history of Chinese literature of the sixth and thirteenth centuries (Shekera, 2013).

She embodied in them the experience of her work as both an Associate Professor of Department of Chinese, Korean and Japanese philology, Institute of Philology of the native university, and also an Associate Professor of Oriental studies at the Open International University of Human Development “Ukraine.” Her numerous profound publications on the history of Taoism and the representation of its foundations in the poetic heritage of ancient China became the real decoration of the bulletin “Oriental Languages and Literatures” of this institute and of no less authoritative periodicals “The Oriental Studies” and “The World of the Orient” of A. Krymskyyi Institute of Oriental Studies of the NAS of Ukraine. Nadiya Kirnosova, a well-known domestic translator from Chinese, is an Associate Professor of the Department (renamed the Department of Languages and Literatures of the Far East and South East Asia in 2016) and an active scientific secretary of the Ukrainian Association of Sinologists. A graduate
of NaUKMA, she is a recognized specialist in the field of phonetics of the Chinese language and linguistics, as well as the history of Chinese literature as Y. Shekera. Studying, first of all, Chinese pilgrimage prose and its genre-thematic paradigm, she carefully examines the topic of how to organize data in Chinese characters, such as the reflection of objective and subjective knowledge about the world.

**Study and Popularization of the History of Chinese Philosophy, Philosophical Education, Science and Culture in China in the Universities of Ukraine: the Experience of the Kyiv Universities of the Late 20th – Early 21st Centuries**

In our opinion, the assessment of the level of development of philosophical Chinese studies in the capital universities of independent Ukraine presupposes not only a generalized review of the figures of its leading representatives and their ideas, begun in the mentioned works of V. Kiktenko. It also requires evaluation of the achievements of research work both by themselves and their colleagues and students in the context of analyzing the array of inquiries on the history of philosophical education, science and culture in China contained in the periodicals of all these universities. The focus of this part of our article is the progress of the study of the history of Chinese philosophy by Ukrainian scientists over the past three decades in five capital universities, first of all in the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv, and also: National University of “Kyiv-Mohyla Academy,” Borys Grinchenko Kyiv University, Kyiv National Linguistic University and Vadym Hetman Kyiv National Economic University. Oriental studies of subdivisions of these universities, as well as a number of Sinological research centers in their composition, are very closely related to significant advancement in the learning of this issue in the A. Yu. Krymskyi Institute of Oriental Studies of the NAS of Ukraine and also in the H. S. Skovoroda Institute of Philosophy of the NAS of Ukraine. The Chinese studies of staffs of the Institute of Philology and the Faculty of Philosophy of the first of these universities deserve special attention. It is presented in the bulletins “Oriental Languages and Literatures” and “Philosophy,” as well as in collections of scientific papers, f.e. “Humanitarian Studies,” and in the digests of the international scientific conference “Days of Science of the Faculty of Philosophy.” No less interesting is the experience of studying the history of Chinese philosophy and also its philosophical culture in NaUKMA by members of its Center for Oriental Studies and the Oriental Circle, which is covered in “Scientific Notes of NaUKMA”, in particular in their updated format from 2018, and additional “Magisterium.” An important source of consideration of the achievements of NaUKMA Sinologists is the materials of the “Days of Science” of this university, such as the seminar “Source Studies in the Methodology of Chinese Studies” traditionally organized by the mentioned center, and international conferences such as three ones dedicated to the memory of the co-founder and the first director of the A. Krymskyi Institute of Oriental Studies of the NAS of Ukraine Omeljan Pritsak. Collection of scientific works “Ukrainian Oriental Studies” is one of the most notable Ukrainian Sinological periodicals, founded by the Institute of Oriental Languages of the Kyiv National Linguistic University, which is currently published by the Institute of Philology and the Faculty of History and Philology, Borys Grinchenko Kyiv University.

A significant contribution to the progress of philosophical Chinese studies in Ukraine belongs to the said Vadym Hetman Kyiv National Economic University, which since 2006 has been actively involved in the preparation and holding together with the A. Yu. Krymskyi
Institute of Oriental Studies of the NAS of Ukraine of the international scientific conference “Chinese Civilization: Traditions and Modernity.” Held by him for the fourteenth time in Kyiv in November 2020 together with the National Institute for Strategic Studies and the Ukrainian Association of Sinologists, it was presented in the section “Studies of Chinese Civilization: History, Philosophy and Culture,” as always, by profound and relevant reports of students and professors of these universities. We note among them two speeches by candidates of historical sciences of the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv, dedicated to its great contribution to educational and scientific ties with PRC and Chinese studies at this university: “Chinese Students at Taras Shevchenko KSU (1950s – early 1960s)” by O. Kupchyk and “Practice and Problems of Studying Sources on the History of Ancient China at the Historical Faculty of Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv” by V. Urusov. Covering the training since 2015 at the mentioned Faculty of students majoring in Oriental studies (Chinese studies), the known lecturer of the Center for Studies of Modern China at this university V. Urusov noted their study of Confucian, Taoist and Buddhist canons and many other sources on the history and culture of ancient China. Both the proceedings of this conference and the scientific journal “Chinese Studies” jointly founded by these two institutions clearly testified to the very successful continuation of the first bilateral symposia of the early 1990s, especially the First Ukrainian-Chinese Scientific Conference “Ukraine-China: Ways of Cooperation” (1993). Along with V. Kiktenko’s and S. Kapranov’s publications, in particular, the paper of the second of them, “The “Tao de Ching” Study in Europe in the First Half of the 19th Century”, this year’s journal “Chinese Studies” contains an article “The Tao Concept: Metaphysics, Ethics and Mimetics in the Collective Imagination” by the ex-graduate student of the Kyiv National Linguistic University P. Kretov. Also, the magazine “Ukraine-China,” which, with support of the Chinese Embassy and the A. Krymskyi Institute of Oriental Studies of the NAS of Ukraine, has been published by the Ukrainian Association of Sinologists for more than twenty years, has repeatedly issued papers on cooperation between Ukrainian universities, especially in Kyiv, with Chinese educational institutions.

Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv is a leader among universities in the capital of Ukraine in educational and scientific partnerships with the universities of PRC. It has existing agreements with Beijing and more than twenty other Chinese universities in 2021, including the Confucius Institute, on many various projects, for example, joint training of graduate students. And the international Conference of this Institute has become a tradition dedicated to its achievements and prospects, which in his reports, like “Cooperation of the Confucius Institute of the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv with Educational Institutions of Ukraine and China” in 2017, highlighted its director O. Goncharenko. With the activity of this institution is closely connected the work of the Department of Languages and Literatures of the Far East and South East Asia, Institute of Philology, whose staff, mainly Y. Shekera, N. Kirnosova, and their colleagues issued articles mainly on the history of ancient Chinese literature and philosophy in the “Oriental Languages and Literatures”. Since 1997, when this bulletin was founded, Chinese studies have been published in it, covering the development of Chinese philosophical education, science and culture since ancient times, such as in the papers by S. Kostenko, O. Kozoriz, O. Slipchenko, I. Shcherbakov, N. Kirnosova and, mainly, Y. Shekera, to the 21st century, as in the papers of the same N. Kirnosova and D. Haryshyna. The progress of Sinology at this institute, as in the institute in the 1990s and 2000s is largely due to the research and educational work of Serhiy Kostenko, an article in memory of whom (Popova & Isayeva, 2019) published two years ago in the magazine “Ukraine-China.” A recognized examiner of
the language and lexicography of ancient China, such as the researcher of the etymological dictionary of characters “Shuowen Jiezi” and the life of its author Xu Shen, he sought to trace the links between language and culture, to reveal symbolic codes of old Chinese philosophical treatises and iconic works of Chinese literature (Popova & Isayeva, 2019), i.e., in the paper “On the Problem of Periodization of Ancient Chinese Literature” (1998). Interestingly, most of the Chinese studies in this bulletin covers more than two thousand years of development of Chinese folklore and literature, addressing the problem of their conditionality by ancient Chinese philosophy and offering an analysis of its leading schools in terms of their role in shaping the language and, in general, the cultural tradition of China.

If the article “Plots of Ukrainian and Chinese Fairy Tales, Images of the Main Characters (Comparative Analysis)” (2010) by Olexander Kozoriz raises the topic of the probable connection between Ukraine and China at the very beginning of their mythologies, the article “Buddhist philosophy of China and Central Asia and Its Influence on Far Eastern Literature” (2009) by Yaroslav Shcherbakov, a lecturer at the Department of Oriental Languages and Translation, is based on his dissertation “Buddhist Motives in Yuan Drama.” The most representative in this list is a series of papers on the history of Chinese literature of the Middle Ages and the influence on it of the philosophy of ancient China by M. Shekera, the materials of which were used by her in the said monographs and who has repeatedly explored the influence of Buddhism on Chinese literature, f.e. (Shekera, 2015). In the papers “The Metaphor of Sleep in Taoist Philosophy and in Su Shi’s Poetry (1037-1101)” (2010) and “The Taoist Concept of Emptiness in the Treatises of Lao-Tzu and Chuang-Tzu as the Basis of the Chinese Worldview” (2012), she again raised the cross-cutting theme for her scientific analysis of the role of Taoism in the history of Chinese culture, to which a significant amount of her articles in “The World of the Orient” and other Ukrainian periodicals are devoted. In one of her last lifetime papers, “The Nature of Meditativeness of Chinese Classical Poetry and Ukrainian Poetry of the XIX – early XX Centuries: An Experience of Comparative Analysis” (2019) Y. Shekera made one of the first attempts to compare the works of famous Ukrainian modern poets B. Grinchenko and M. Voronoi with Chinese poetry of the eighth – twelfth centuries, in the light of a thorough analysis, including the ideas and masterpieces of the Buddhist poet-monk Hanshan. At the same time, in articles by N. Kirnosova, O. Kozoriz and their colleagues, f.e. “Cognitive Linguistics in China: History and Terminology” (2012) and “Objective and Subjective Beginnings of Knowledge About the World Reflected in Chinese Characters” (2015) of the first of them and in “The Largest Semantic Field of China’s Noosphere” (2016) of the second, raised a question of specifics of the development of the Chinese language picture of the world and its conditionality by Chinese traditional mode of life, language practice, and philosophy. In addition, the assistant of the Department of Languages and Literatures of the Far East and South East Asia, Institute of Philology, Darya Haryshyna, researcher of the concept of the human personality of Lu Xin as the famous participant of the “Movement for a New Culture”, considered in the article “Philosophical Understanding of the Human Personality: Western and Chinese Models” (2019) the topic of the specifics of Chinese ethnopsychology in the light of the assessment of the historical place of anthropological issues in Confucianism, Taoism and Buddhism.

An example of an in-depth analysis of this topic in Ukraine in the 1990s in the almanac “Multiversum” of the H. S. Skovoroda Institute of Philosophy of the NAS of Ukraine, as well as in the bulletin “Philosophy. Politology” of the Faculty of Philosophy of the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv, are articles by a graduate of this university, Doctor of Philosophy
Olexander Boichenko. He raised in them “the problem of natural and human” and the exegesis of their interdependence at the stage of formation of ancient Chinese philosophy, in particular in early Taoism (Boichenko, 1998) and Confucianism (Boichenko, 1999), and summarized all the conclusions in the candidate’s thesis “The Relationship Between Natural and Human as a Problem of Ancient Chinese Philosophy (Comparative Analysis of Taoist and Confucian Interpretations)” (2000). The monograph (Boichenko, 2003), published by the Center for Humanitarian Education of the NAS of Ukraine, in which O. Boichenko worked until the end of his life, was the result of his investigation on this topic. And during the writing of his doctoral thesis “Statehood in Ancient Chinese Philosophy: Paradigms of Comprehension” (2012), namely in 2009 – 2011, he drew attention to the views of Legalism and Mohism on social life and statehood, as well as on the teachings of Confucius and the ideas of his followers Mencius and Xunzi in this regard, including the article “The Doctrine of Education and Upbringing in the Philosophy of Early Confucianism” (2012) in the digest of the scientific works “Humanitarian Studies.” The paper “Philosophy of Confucian Education” (2018) by associate professor V. Khavronenko in the bulletin “Sofia” of the same university is devoted to the same topic. G. Bokal, an associate professor of the Department of History of Philosophy at the Faculty of Philosophy, is also a famous researcher of the history of Chinese philosophy, published in periodicals both alma mater, such as in the bulletin “Philosophy” (Bokal, 2009) and “Humanitarian Studies” (Bokal, 2010), and the H. S. Skovoroda Institute of Philosophy of the NAS of Ukraine. Asking in the first of these articles the question of authentic terms in the historical and philosophical study of ancient China, and in the second one considering the principle of “inaction” in the philosophical legacy of early Taoism, she summarized in a paper (Bokal, 2013), published in the journal “Philosophical Horizons,” her above-mentioned vision of the phenomenon of “Eastern philosophy.”

One of the illustrative examples of G. Bokal’s reading of this phenomenon is her report “Relevance of the Study of Logical and Epistemological Specifics of Chinese Philosophy,” delivered by her as the head of the subsection “Problems of History of Oriental Philosophy” at the international scientific conference “Days of Science of the Faculty of Philosophy – 2015,” Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv. Its materials point at the very close attention of its participants to ancient Chinese philosophy in view of their study of the principles and history of Taoism (“Tao as the Highest Law and Substantial Basis of the Universe” by T. Danilov and “The Concept of Harmony and Its Main Characteristics in Postclassical Taoism on the Example of the Text “Huai Nan Tzu” by A. Petritsyuk) and also Confucianism (“Logical and Semantic Analysis of the Confucian Principle “Zhengming” by V. Khavronenko and “The Principle “Zhengming” in the Philosophy of Confucianism” by O. Gordienko). As follows from the materials of the said conference in this and previous years, the attention of their partakers was drawn to the history of ancient Chinese philosophy and its studying in Ukraine in the 20th – early 21st century. Of particular note is the participation of Doctor of Philosophical Sciences, Professor Serhii Rudenko, Center for Chinese-European studies at the Guangdong University of Petrochemical Technology (Maoming, PRC) in the theme “The Images of Europe and Asia in Current Cross-Cultural Practices” at this conference in 2020 and in section 16 “Chinese-European Studies” at the conference this year. Deputy Dean of the Faculty of Philosophy, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv, spoke at the first of them on the topic “The Studies on Ancient Chinese Philosophy in Soviet Ukraine” on the basis of the article (Rudenko & Liashenko, 2020) about a significant event in the history of domestic philosophical Chinese studies. Its topic is the publication by then well-known figures...
of the Kyiv philosophical school of the second half of the 20th century from the mentioned university in its publishing house one of the first Ukrainian-language manuals (Dmytrychenko & Shynkaruk, 1958) on the history of ancient Chinese philosophy to the 10th anniversary of the origin of the People’s Republic of China. As the moderator of the mentioned section 16 at the conference “Days of Science of the Faculty of Philosophy-2021”, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv, S. Rudenko made a speech “The Understanding of the Other in Western and Chinese Philosophy” and outlined the project on comparative studies, developed by him in the general framework of the international initiative of PRC The Belt and Road Initiative (BRI).

According to experts, this is the largest geoeconomic project in human history that should consolidate the vast Eurasian space and part of Africa, namely more than 65 countries with a total population of more than 4 billion people (Kiktenko, 2018). It is, simultaneously, a leading global initiative and a serious challenge for the educational and scientific process in Ukraine, the European Union, and the world as a whole. Celebrated in 2019, the 70th anniversary of the founding of the People’s Republic of China coincided with the celebration in China and Ukraine of the 25th anniversary of the establishment of diplomatic relations between them. These two celebrations, which fell on the Year of China in Ukraine, became an important reason for their joint comprehensive assessment of their cooperation in the humanitarian sphere. Undoubtedly, the interaction of the Ukrainian higher school, first of all the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv, and higher educational institutions of both the capital and all the regions, with Chinese friends plays an important role in its gaining momentum. An important guarantee of this, in the context of establishing a permanent, mutually beneficial bilateral partnership between them in all areas of cooperation, is the rapid development of Chinese philosophical studies. The initiators and leaders of it both in the academic and university and in the public spaces of Ukraine were and are graduates and employees of the said university V. Sednev, S. Kostenko, N. Kirnosova, Y. Shekera, G. Bokal, O. Boichenko, S. Rudenko, etc. An unprecedented breakthrough in the field of Oriental studies has been going on in Ukraine for the last three decades thanks to them and their teachers, colleagues and students from the institutes of the NAS of Ukraine and other capital’s universities. Our next articles are devoted to their accomplishments in the field of Chinese studies, namely the revival and, in fact, the birth of Ukrainian philosophical Sinology in the postmodern globalized world.

Conclusions

The results of our research are as follows.

1. An important place in the formation of domestic Sinology, which began after Ukraine’s independence and had been going on for the last three decades, is occupied by Chinese educational and scientific activities of a number of well-known metropolitan universities, first of the all Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv. They jointly develop this one of the leading branches of modern Ukrainian Oriental studies in deep cooperation with the A. Krymskyi Institute of Oriental Studies of the NAS of Ukraine and many domestic and world centers of Sinology.

2. All these years, the Institute of Philology and the Faculty of Philosophy of Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv have been making a certainly significant contribution to Sinology together with Chinese studies centers of NaUKMA, Kyiv National Linguistic University, V. Hetman Kyiv National Economic University and
Borys Grinchenko Kyiv University. Sinologists of these institutes and faculty, as well as, in particular, members of the NaUKMA Center for Oriental Studies and the ones of the Confucius School of the latter of the mentioned universities, together with the Ukrainian Association of Sinologists and institutes of the NAS of Ukraine, carry out essential philosophical Chinese studies.

3. Chinese studies of the Institute of Philology of Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv is represented by literary, linguistic, and philosophical works of S. Kiktenko, Y. Shekera, N. Kirnosova and their colleagues, and the relevant studies of the mentioned faculty are researches and projects of O. Boichenko, G. Bokal, S. Rudenko, etc. Their achievements, including the Chinese studies of other famous graduates and professors of this university, especially V. Rezanenko and V. Sednev, largely determine the face of Ukrainian philosophical Sinology and its substantial potential in the international scientific arena.

4. The wide and relevant ideological and thematic interdisciplinary intersection of these studies and activities goes from the consideration of the origins of Chinese philosophical education, science and culture to the current stage of their progress. The study of the said scientists is notable for their focus on the evolution of the philosophical foundations of Taoism, Confucianism and Buddhism, mainly their anthropological and ethical aspects, in light of the analysis of the reflection of their guidelines in writing, language, literature and, in general, the whole socio-cultural life of China.

References


Dmytrychenko, Volodymyr, and Shynkaruk, Volodymyr (1958) *The Development of Philosophical Thought in Ancient China*. Kyiv: Publishing Center of the Kyiv State University named after Taras Shevchenko.

of Oriental Studies of the NAS of Ukraine.

Feng-Shuo Chang

Doctor of Philosophy in Social Policy, Associate Professor, Guangdong University of Petrochemical Technology (Maoming, Guangdong Province, China)
E-mail: feng.shuo.chang@gmail.com
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4315-0194


Rudenko and Liashenko’s (2020) “Chinese studies in Ukrainian philosophy of the Soviet period” explores the philosophy and political thought of that time through the study of a Soviet-era book on Chinese philosophy. Their article argues that the content and structure of Dmytrychenko and Shynkaruk’s (1958) book “The development of philosophical thought in ancient China” reflects its authors’ political education intentions. This analytical argument is comprehensively presented in the paper and effectively articulates the particularity of this Ukrainian book on Chinese philosophy. In this article, I examine Rudenko and Liashenko’s paper from the perspective of positivism and of an individual who received a traditional Chinese education. Through a comparison with other books on Chinese philosophy, I discuss Rudenko and Liashenko’s argument regarding the materialist historical view of Dmytrychenko and Shynkaruk’s book. The lack of excerpts from the original Chinese texts affects the correctness of some interpretations in the reviewed article. Nonetheless, through a dialogue between the two authors and contemporary philosophers, the reviewed article touches upon many philosophical ideas and research topics that are worth reading and studying, especially in terms of socialist philosophy, the historical development of Marxism, and the study of Ukrainian philosophy.

Keywords: Chinese philosophy, materialism, Marxism, reception study, Soviet period, Ukrainian philosophy

Received: 17 July 2021 / Accepted: 25 August 2021 / Published: 15 November 2021
Introduction

The article *Chinese studies in Ukrainian philosophy of the Soviet period* by Ukrainian philosophy researchers Sergii Rudenko and Iryna Liashenko (2020) is a reception study of Chinese philosophy aiming to enhance the understanding of Soviet-era Ukrainian philosophy and Marxism. The article’s first author, Sergii Rudenko, is an expert in the study of philosophy in present-day Ukraine, particularly the history of Marxism. This article is one of his representative works. Coauthor Iryna Liashenko is currently a Ph.D. candidate and assistant professor of philosophy. She is an expert in Hegel and philosophical education and history. Their article is primarily an analysis of Volodymyr Dmytrychenko and Volodymyr Shynkaruk’s (1958) book *The development of philosophical thought in ancient China*, a philosophy education book of particular significance for the development of philosophy and philosophy education in Ukraine in the second half of the 20th century. This review article is based on the views of a positivist social science researcher who received a traditional Chinese education in Taiwan. This paper conducts a preliminary comparison of the contents of Ukrainian Chinese philosophy books with English Chinese philosophy books and provides suggestions for the interpretation of Chinese literature in the reviewed article.

The methods used by Rudenko and Liashenko to analyze Dmytrychenko and Shynkaruk’s book are based primarily on the discourse of Mróz (2016), who argues that the selection of specific information reflects the intention of the selector. The authors also refer to other philosophy researchers’ comments on the book and their discussion of the development of philosophy during the period in question to examine the influence of the book at that time. They believe that this Ukrainian Chinese philosophy book introduces the origins of Chinese philosophy and the Chinese philosophy school to prove that the development of philosophy should be diverse and multi-origin and that philosophy education should not be centered on Western philosophy. Rudenko and Liashenko also note that in Dmytrychenko and Shynkaruk’s book, Chinese philosophy is mainly seen through the lens of interactive dialectics of idealism and materialism and the differences between dialectical and historical materialism.

Rudenko and Liashenko explain that because the three representative figures addressed by this Ukrainian Chinese philosophy book are Laozi 老子, Confucius 孔子 and Wang Chong (or Wang Ch’ung) 王充 and that the authors of the book classify Laozi and Wang as materialist and Confucius is idealist, the book places a greater emphasis on materialism. Moreover, they point out that Dmytrychenko and Shynkaruk regard Confucius as an idealist and Laozi as a materialist, considering their respective philosophies diametrically opposed, unlike contemporary scholars, who do not consider materialism and idealism mutually exclusive. The authors also remind readers that since the introduction of Chinese philosophical ideas in the Ukrainian Chinese philosophy book is not based on the author’s direct translation of the original Chinese works, there may be errors of understanding caused by the translation process. The discussion of three philosophical research topics at the end of the authors’ analysis is worth readers discovering for themselves, especially readers interested in philosophical education, Marxism, and the development of Soviet-era Ukrainian philosophy (Rudenko & Liashenko 2020). Namely, the three topics are the following: “Is it possible today to go beyond the West-centric guidelines in the study of the history of philosophy?”, “Are reception studies an effective and reliable method of studying history of philosophy in general and Ukrainian philosophy of the Soviet era and the philosophy of ancient China in particular?”, and “Can we trust the texts written by Ukrainian philosophers of the Soviet era about the philosophy of ancient China?”
A review from the perspective of positivism
and of an individual who received a traditional Chinese education

Overall, Rudenko and Liashenko’s analysis of the structure and contents of The development of philosophical thought in ancient China clearly explains the particularity of the book. This particularity lies in its emphasis on materialism, reflecting the ideological environment in socialist Ukraine. Compared to Fung Yu-lan’s (1948) A short history of Chinese philosophy and Mou Zongsan’s (1983) Nineteen lectures on Chinese philosophy, two well-known books on Chinese philosophy, Dmytrychenko and Shynkaruk’s book clearly attaches greater importance to Wang Chong. In contrast, in Fung Yu-lan’s book, Wang Chong’s name does not appear in any chapter titles and appears only once in the subtitle in Chapter 18 (‘The Ascendancy of Confucianism and Revival of Taoism’) and only four times throughout the book. Considering that in his book, Confucius is mentioned 231 times, Mencius 216 times, Zhuangzi 162 times, and Laozi 131 times, it is clear that unlike the Ukrainian philosophers, Fung Yu-lan does not value Wang Chong as much as Laozi and Confucius. Both Fung’s and Mou’s Chinese philosophy books (Fung, 1948; Mou, 1983) introducing Buddhism and Zen in China receive independent chapters, but Dmytrychenko and Shynkaruk do not dedicate separate chapters to Buddhism and Zen, which may have something to do with the atheism that was championed at the time (Defoort & Zinda, 2010).

In fact, the emphasis on Wang Chong can also be seen in Marxist education in socialist China. Chinese scholars under Communist rule mostly regarded Wang as the earliest materialist philosopher, and Wang Chong’s book Lun heng 論衡 (“About balance/balanced discussions”) questioned many ancient superstitions and fallacies through methods similar to today’s scientific argument; indeed, Wang Chong is often referred to by Chinese scholars as a great atheist (Klein & Klein, 2016). In China, ideological education under socialism emphasizes that Wang Chong’s role in questioning Confucius’s ideas has had political significance, especially in the Cultural Revolution, and that opposition to Confucius’s thought is considered political correctness (Reinders 2004). However, Wang Chong may be more of a skeptic focused on logical argumentation and questioning the unnatural parts – similar to what are now known as the “scientifically unverifiable” parts – of the story and discourse about Confucius. It would not be appropriate for us to interpret Wang Chong’s ideas as being in total opposition to Confucius or Confucianism (McLeod, 2015).

In their conclusions and discussions, Rudenko and Liashenko’s analysis puts forward the idea of eliminating Western centralism in philosophical education; similar discussions can be found surrounding the very definition of philosophy in the study of Chinese philosophy because the term “philosophy” is alien to the Chinese language. There is a lively discussion in the Chinese and international academic community about whether we can study the history of philosophy within a Western framework. Defoort (2001, 2006) has thoroughly discussed whether so-called Chinese philosophy is actually Chinese philosophy or rather philosophy in China. In Taiwan, Chinese philosophical ideas are mostly learned through literature and the classics. The word “philosophy” (哲學zhe-xue/tetsugaku) was a Japanese coinage of Chinese character compounds used to translate Western philosophy concepts and then passed on to present-day China (Chung, 2001; Lee, 2019). Although the Western academic classification was introduced at the end of the Qing dynasty (1644-1911), the government was concerned
A Ukrainian Interpretation of Chinese Philosophy in the Soviet Period: 
A Review of “Chinese Studies in Ukrainian Philosophy of the Soviet Period” by Feng-Shuo Chang

about the invasion of Western thought, and philosophy did not become an independent subject. By comparing the development of the “history of Chinese thought” in Chinese departments and the “history of Chinese philosophy” in philosophy departments of universities in Taiwan, Tsung-Ting Lee (2019) finds that the textbooks of the two courses are characterized by high levels of overlap, but the history of Chinese thought covers a wider range. The fact that the word “thought” is more abstract and inclusive than “philosophy,” coupled with the fact that the latter term is from an alien language, may indicate that discussion of the “philosophy” of the Chinese itself implies a certain meaning and framework, perhaps centered on the West or Western interpretation.

Another issue of which readers need to be reminded before reading the reviewed paper is the Chinese translation. Traditional Chinese is a language and a character system whose pronunciation is as important as its glyphs. Relevant Chinese literature should note the original Chinese text for reference; otherwise, issues related to “one pronunciation–multiple meanings” and “one glyph–multiple meanings” and the variety of transliteration systems (such as the Wade-Giles index, Chinese pinyin system, and Yale index) make it difficult for interpreters to ascertain the meaning of the original text. It should also be noted that studies on ancient Chinese books should use the Traditional Chinese Big5 encoding method for Chinese words. Using the Simplified Chinese GB2312 character set may lead to misinterpretations of the original meaning of ancient Chinese texts.

In Rudenko and Liashenko’s analysis, three translations of Chinese words should be noted. One is the distinction between qi and qi in Tai-qi, which can be confused in the rendering of English letters using romanization, since chi, ji, and qi may all represent the same word according to different transliteration systems (Xing & Feng, 2016). Qi alone and qi in Tai-qi look like the same word in both the Ukrainian Chinese philosophy book and Rudenko and Liashenko’s analysis, which is confusing (Adler, 2014; Leslie, 1956). The second word to be aware of is Tao (or Dao), which may have two very important meanings: “truth/principle” as a noun and “make sense/ reason/ see the truth” as a verb. These two explanations help expand our understanding of what Laozi might have wished to express. Third, the article mentions the two Chinese words Ming-tzu, but pronunciation alone does not help determine precisely what they refer to in the original Chinese texts. Without citing the original Chinese text, Ming-tzu may mean “Mencius” (孟子/meng-zi/meng-tzu) or “School of Names (Logicians)” (名家 Ming-jia) or anything that sounds alike, which is confusing for the reader.

In future studies, it would be ideal to have a corresponding Chinese text and Roman phonetic display to enhance the interpretation accuracy of the Chinese terms. This is of great importance for correctly understanding the text and its intended interpretation at a given time. For example, the interpretation of Confucianism by Western missionaries may be selective because of religious considerations (Horyna, 2020; Hung, 2003); without the original text for comparison, there will be analytical problems. I believe that this method is critical for the future exchange of cross-cultural values, cognition, and ideas.
Conclusion

Rudenko and Liashenko’s article is of great importance for philosophy research and for reception studies. The article’s structure is clear, and the authors carefully excerpt important original passages, which are very helpful for the reader. Although there are no original Chinese texts provided for reference, making it difficult to interpret some content, the article makes a significant contribution to the discourse in contemporary philosophy research. I believe that this is a contribution that should not be missed, especially for students of philosophy and Marxism studies and the history of Soviet-era Ukrainian philosophy.

References


AUTHORS

Isabela de Andrade Gama is a Ph.D. in International Relations at the Pontifical Catholic University of Rio de Janeiro (Brazil). Currently, she is a Postdoctoral Fellow at Army Command and General Staff College Marshal Castello Branco School in Military Sciences. Her research realm covers the following problematics: Theory of International Relations; Russian Studies; Foreign Policy; International Security; Peacekeeping Operations. Rio de Janeiro (Brazil).
E-mail: isabela_a_g@hotmail.com

Ljiljana Čabrilo Blagojević is a Ph.D. student at European Center for Peace and Development (ECPD), established by the United Nations University for Peace, Belgrade (Serbia). She received a Master’s degree from École des hautes études en sciences sociales (EHESS), Paris (France), Department of History, and graduated from the Faculty of Law of the University of Belgrade (Serbia) with a degree in International Public Law. Research areas: Yugoslav and Serbian emigration after the Second World War, immigration issues, especially the specifics of the aging immigrant population, global inequality, social inequality in France. Belgrade (Serbia).
E-mail: ljiljanacabriloblagojevic@yahoo.fr

Feng-Shuo Chang is an Associate Professor of Law at the Guangdong University of Petrochemical Technology (Maoming, China). He received his doctorate in Social Policy from the School of Social Policy, Sociology and Social Research (SSPSSR) at the University of Kent (UK). His research interests include social stratification and regional development in China, and he is currently completing a study of the hukou migration of migrant workers in China. Maoming (Guangdong Province, China).
E-mail: feng.shuo.chang@gmail.com

Yuhuan Hou is a class of 2018 undergraduates, a scholar at Guangdong University of Petrochemical Technology (China). Maoming (Guangdong, China).
E-mail: 1827366275@qq.com

Dan Howitt is a scholar in private study at Harvard University. He was educated at Colgate University, The University of Chicago, and Harvard University. His book Black Light was published in March 2021, and his article, The Discovery of Black Light – Darkness is Black Visible Light, was published in October 2021. His unprecedented observations in the field of autism will be published in November 2021. His 2014-2021 Harvard webpage, www.scholar.harvard.edu/danielhowitt. Cambridge (Massachusetts, the United States of America).
E-mail: dth055@g.harvard.edu
Yevhen Kharkovshchenko is a Doctor of Philosophical Sciences, Professor, Religious studies scholar, and Philosopher. His research interests include studies in the sophianic, history and current situation of Ukrainian Orthodoxy, religious security. To date, he has published over 250 scientific works (monographs, manuals, articles). He is also a member Ukrainian Association of Religious Studies. He is currently Head of the Department of Religious studies of the Faculty of Philosophy, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv. Kyiv (Ukraine).
E-mail: sacerdoc@ukr.net

Bo Ma is a Ph.D. in Law, Professor, Dean of the School of Humanities and Law, Guangdong University of Petrochemical Technology (China), as well as the head of Maoming Local Legislative Research Evaluation and Consulting Service Base. He has published more than 50 academic papers in journals like “Law Review,” “Journal of Law,” and two scholarly monographs. Academic research interests focus on environmental law and space law. Maoming (Guangdong, China).
E-mail: gdjasonma@gdupt.edu.cn

Wiktor Możgin is a Master of Political Science at the Ignatianum Academy in Krakow. Currently, he is continuing his education at doctoral studies, the field of cultural studies, at the Jagiellonian University in Krakow. The social and political issues of contemporary Ukraine are the area of his scientific research. He is also an active participant in scientific life both in Poland and abroad. He takes part in many scientific conferences and is the author of numerous scientific papers, among which it is worth mentioning: Euromaidan 2.0 as a determinant of the shaping of a new model of Ukrainian society (2016); The constructive role of the media revolution in Ukraine in the context of cultural and political changes (2017); The media context of the Malaysian Boeing 777 crash in Ukraine – whose side is the truth? (2018). Krakow (Poland).
E-mail: wiktor.mozgin@doctoral.uj.edu.pl

Victoria Omelchenko is a Candidate of Philosophical Sciences (Ph.D.), philosopher, and historian of philosophy. Her research interests include studies in the Ukrainian history of philosophy, philosophy of law, philosophy of culture. To date, she has published over 75 articles. She is currently an Assistant Professor of the Ukrainian Philosophy and Culture Department of the Faculty of Philosophy at the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv. Kyiv (Ukraine).
E-mail: victoria.007.omelchenko@gmail.com

Frol Revin is a Ph.D. in Philosophy, Lecturer at the UNESCO Chair on Science Education (National Pedagogical Dragomanov University). In 2021, he obtained a Ph.D. in Social Philosophy and Philosophy of History (“Intentional collective activity as a driving force of sociocultural transformation”). His research interests include interdisciplinary studies in the fields of social philosophy (collective intentionality and cooperation), philosophy of science, future studies, education, and mind. He has published seven articles and participated in numerous conferences. Kyiv (Ukraine).
E-mail: frollrevin@gmail.com
Sergii Rudenko is a Doctor of Philosophical Sciences, Professor, Senior Researcher at the “Belt and Road Initiative” Research Centre for Chinese-European studies, Guangdong University of Petrochemical Technology (Maoming, Guangdong Province, China). His research interests embrace the studies in Local Philosophies and Cultures, Chinese philosophy and Culture, Ukrainian philosophy, East European Philosophy, History of Marxism, Philosophy and Cosmology, Higher Education Administration. Prof. Dr. Rudenko is a member of the International Society of Philosophy and Cosmology (ISPC). He is a Co-Editor-in-Chief of the academic journal “Future Human Image” (ISPC), a member of the editorial board of “The Bulletin of Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv. Philosophy” and “The Bulletin of Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv. Public Administration” academic journals. Personal page: www.sergiirudenko.name. Kyiv (Ukraine). E-mail: rudenkosrg@gmail.com

Yaroslav Sobolievskyi is a Doctor of Philosophical Sciences, Associate Professor, philosopher, and historian of philosophy. His research interests include interdisciplinary studies in the fields of philosophy, history of philosophy, history of American philosophy, and cosmology. Yaroslav Sobolievskyi is a member of the International Society of Philosophy and Cosmology (ISPC). To date, he has published over 40 articles. He is also editor of the academic journals Bulletin of Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv and Philosophy and Humanitarian Studies. He is currently an Associate Professor of the Department of History of Philosophy at the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv. Kyiv (Ukraine). E-mail: yasobolevsky@knu.ua

Vitalii Turenko is a Candidate of Philosophical Sciences, Philosopher, and Historian of Philosophy. His research interests include studies in the history of philosophy, philosophical anthropology, and religious studies. To date, he has published five books and over 100 articles. He is currently a junior research fellow of the Faculty of Philosophy, Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv. Kyiv (Ukraine). E-mail: vitali_turenko@ukr.net

Vadym Tytarenko is a Candidate of Philosophical Sciences (Ph.D.), an expert in the History of Western philosophy of the 18th-19th centuries, Ukrainian and Russian philosophy. His research interest concentrated on the philosophical problems within German classical idealism and its interpretations and receptions in soviet-Ukrainian philosophy. He is also interested in methodological research within the History of Philosophy (national and general approaches). During the recent years of academic and teaching activity, he has published 2 books and more than 20 research papers (articles, conference papers, etc.) including “Cosmology in the Philosophical Education of Ukraine: History and Modern Condition” (2018), “Some points on German classical philosophy researches in field of history of philosophy” (2017), “Kant’s ethics: religious sources, milestones, theoretical features” (2017), “Logic and history of philosophy in acquirement of professional philosophical competences” (2016), etc. Dr. Tytarenko is a member of the International Society of Philosophy and Cosmology. Vadym Tytarenko is presently on the position of Associate Professor of History of Philosophy Department at Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv. Kyiv (Ukraine). E-mail: tytarenkove@gmail.com
Shevchenko National University of Kyiv. Kyiv (Ukraine).
E-mail: tytarenko.vadym@gmail.com

Amita Valmiki is Associate Professor and Head, Department of Philosophy, Ramniranjan Jhunjhunwala College of Arts, Science and Commerce (Autonomous), Affiliated to the University of Mumbai, and Visiting Professor of the Department of Philosophy, University of Mumbai. She was a Member of the Board of Studies in Logic and Philosophy, University of Mumbai. She has published a book titled *Mystical Worlds: Social, Spiritual and Secular*, co-edited a book titled *100 Years of Indian Cinema: Issues and Challenges in Retrospection* and published more than 60 articles in various books and in national and international journals. She has organized National and International Colloquiums, Seminars and Conferences. Special areas of interest – Ethics, Theistic Existentialism, Philosophy of Religion, Mysticism and Philosophy of Film. Mumbai (India).
E-mail: amitavalmiki@gmail.com

Heorhii Vdovychenko is a Doctor of Philosophical Sciences, Associate Professor, Researcher at the Taras Shevchenko National University of Kyiv (Ukraine). He is an expert in the History of Ukrainian philosophy, History of Ukrainian culture, and Regional studies. His research interests are focused on Ukrainian philosophy of the Soviet period, Philosophy of Culture, and Philosophy of History. He is the author of more than 50 research works, including 2 monographs, 45 research papers. Kyiv (Ukraine).
E-mail: georgyvdovychenko@knu.ua